

The principal objectives of the research were to:

- Identify factors that act as barriers to the delivery of mixed use development and which of these are the most significant;
- Analyse how barriers differ depending on location, the mix of uses and the inclusion of different housing tenures;
- Explore how the identified barriers can be addressed and what those interventions should be;
- Review existing work regarding barriers to the implementation of mixed use development;
- Explore whether the majority of development proposals and local plan allocations over the past decade have been for single use.

What has been learned?

Definition and Local Plan Commitment

The barriers that have been identified overlap and are interrelated and this 'cross cutting' issue has implications for broadening the debate, knowledge and understanding of how to deliver more mixed use development.

The term 'mixed use' is very loosely defined and the strength of commitment to promoting and delivering mixed use development in local plans has been variable. It would not be appropriate however, to try to impose a standard national definition of mixed use but rather it is important to encourage local planning authorities through the new development plans to adopt a clear and specific definition appropriate to the particular local context.

The working definition of mixed use development that emerged from this research includes the following three principles:

- Two or more revenue producing uses / activities including housing;
- Significant physical and functional integration including real physical connections between uses within a five minute walk; and

- A higher density, multi functional environment with vitality and attractiveness.

Planning and Place Making

The design process can be used to overcome many barriers and should be founded on **five principles** namely: *establishing a clear shared vision of the mixed use development concept; actively working with partners; an effective masterplan; and establishing a costed and phased delivery strategy.*

Mixed use developments are perceived as more complex and slower to deliver than corresponding single function schemes because of the complexity of negotiating the planning and technical approvals stages. In reality both mixed and single function projects can be equally complicated. Community resistance to certain uses being co-located and preconceptions can however lead to difficulties and delays.

Delivering more and higher quality mixed use development will require relevant *skills development* in the public, private and third sectors.

Designing for Mixed Use

The requirement to consult widely on significant mixed use frameworks and masterplans is possibly a little more complicated, with more detailed involvement from additional agencies for mixed uses schemes, e.g. environmental health and fire.

Different technical issues become critical at different scales of development with the *greatest complexity being in mixed use designs where different functions exist within the same structure, e.g. vertical mixed use.*

There is an increased risk in mixed use development that individual technical 'silos' magnify the significance of minor design issues. Therefore the ability to get together all interested parties in *cross discipline technical workshops and cross department teams* can assist in resolving problems quickly and developing a

shared understanding of the complex inter-relationships.

Mixed use developments need to be designed for flexibility of function over time. In some cases developments start out as single use but are converted to mixed use as neighbourhoods mature. To enable this kind of temporal flexibility *the built fabric needs to be robust and adaptable, with the critical technical design factors being; structure, services strategy, sound insulation, floor plan depth and section heights.*

Deal Structure & Funding: Model to Deliver Mixed Use

Deal structuring was raised consistently as a significant barrier and local planning authorities recognised it was a key issue. There is also limited knowledge of different models for delivering mixed use development.

Tenure & Ownership Structures

Tenure and multiple ownership are perceived barriers and not unique to achieving a successful mixed use development. *Fragmented ownership is a particular issue where residential uses have been introduced into a mixed use development, as the flats and houses provided are generally sold off whilst commercial units may be retained by the developer and leased.*

Managing Mixed Use Communities

There is a potential barrier because of the difficulty of reconciling different environmental health requirements within a mixed use development. *Addressing these issues at the early master planning stage is crucial. As a result of the more intensive use and extended use patterns, regular and high quality maintenance is even more important with mixed use development.*

What next?

Planning reform in Scotland presents an ideal opportunity to put in place appropriate interventions to deliver more and better quality

mixed use development and this will require appropriate skills.

In the current economic downturn there are likely to be very *significant opportunities to stimulate and deliver appropriate mixed use development* using new kinds of 'delivery models'. *Local planning authorities in Scotland could adopt a more proactive role to sponsor, pilot, promote and deliver mixed use development projects.*

The research has culminated in four recommendations and fourteen suggestions namely:

1. Scottish Government to Enable Provision of More Proactive Advice on How to Deliver Mixed Use Development & Improve Skills.

The working *definition* of mixed use development needs to be refined and broadly agreed. It would not be appropriate however, to adopt a detailed standard national definition in Scotland because of the need to reflect the particular local contexts. Using a more specific and agreed definition would also allow more robust and accurate statistics to be collected.

Overall planning policies on mixed use development need to be more precise and firmly founded on an understanding of realistic market opportunities for uses and policies should *require* rather than just encourage mixed use. *Robust capacity and market studies* are essential to help justify mixed use masterplans, set their context and specific location. Establishing a Scottish mixed use development web site with best practice case studies, relevant images and advice material is also suggested.

2. An Initiative to Promote Delivery of Mixed Use Development

The aim should be to be proactive and advocate mixed use development to local government officers and members, community councils, residents and business groups; to collect and share good practice and to invest in resources, tools and research.

Local authorities should audit their skills base to identify their particular *training and recruitment needs*. The Improvement Service and professional institutes like the Royal Incorporation of Architects in Scotland (RIAS), Royal Institution of Chartered Surveyors (RICS), Royal Town Planning Institute (RTPI) and others through CPD should deliver relevant *skills development and training* at the appropriate levels. The subject and the specific skills gaps include:

Planning barriers: mixed use; appropriateness & location; spatial planning/place making, density & intensity, property values; planning & land use allocation; risk/uncertainty/change.

Deal structure and funding barriers: stand-alone uses; land values & Section 75 contribution; mixed use: development vehicle; development economics.

Residential and other leases barriers: land tenure; title conditions; Development Management System; funding; residential quality/tenure; new financial instruments.

Managing mixed use communities barriers: standards/regulations; user demographics; management of mixed use communities.

A small team of *independent experts* possibly in conjunction with the Improvement Service or Scottish Property Federation could also be established to provide specific advice to local planning authorities on structuring joint ventures to deliver mixed use development.

3. Enhanced Advocacy Role for Architecture & Design Scotland (A+DS)

It may be possible for A+DS to take on an enhanced advocacy role in promoting the delivery of mixed use development particularly in the context of planning reform and the economic downturn.

4. Encourage & Pilot New Approaches to Deal Structure: Funding & Managing Mixed Use Developments

Exploring different models to deliver mixed use development and disseminating best practice will be vital. This includes the possibilities of using Planning Permission in Principle (from

August 2009) with a Parameters Plan and then Area Planning Briefs.

New models for funding 'up front' major infrastructure for larger more complex mixed use developments: e.g. Tax Increment Financing need to be considered. Amending business rates liability for new non-domestic properties within mixed use developments and aiming to better promote the use and benefits of the legislation that affects multiple residential ownerships are also suggested.



Scottish Centre for Regeneration

↳ This is published by the Scottish Centre for Regeneration. The Centre is part of the Housing and Regeneration Directorate of Scottish Government. We help to achieve Scottish Government's Purpose, Targets and National Outcomes through supporting our public, private and voluntary sector delivery partners to become more effective at:

- regenerating communities and tackling poverty
- developing more successful town centres and high streets
- creating and managing mixed and sustainable communities.

↳ We do this through:

- coordinating learning networks which bring people together to identify the challenges they face in delivering regeneration and to support them to tackle these through organising events, networking and capacity building programmes
- identifying and sharing learning through undertaking research, developing capacity building tools and highlighting lessons learned and good practice
- developing partnerships with key players in the regeneration sector to ensure that our activities meet their needs and support their work.

Scottish Centre for Regeneration
Scottish Government, Highlander House
58 Waterloo Street, Glasgow G2 7DA
Tel: 0141 271 3736

E-mail: contactscr@scotland.gsi.gov.uk
www.partnersinregeneration.com

The views expressed in learning points are those of participants at various events and are not necessarily shared by their employers, the Scottish Centre for Regeneration (SCR) or the Scottish Government.
September 2009