

**STRATEGIC GROUP ON WOMEN**

**IMPROVING THE POSITION OF WOMEN IN  
SCOTLAND:  
AN AGENDA FOR ACTION**

## **FOREWORD: CONVENOR**

“I myself have never been able to find out precisely what feminism is. I only know that people call me a feminist whenever I express sentiments that differentiate me from a doormat.”

**Rebecca West, Irish author, 1913**

Some people say that women have now achieved equality with men. That simply is not true – the position may have improved enormously since Rebecca West made her famous observation in 1913, but evidence shows that women still have lower levels of earnings, pensions and other income, fewer opportunities and less power and influence than men. Some people think that even if women are not equal, they are at least as equal now as they are ever going to be, or as equal as they should be. I, and the other members of this Group, do not agree that women somehow do not deserve to have the same chances in life as men.

“Feminism”, as the way of describing the desire of both women and men for society to be fairer and more tolerant, may not be used as much now as it was before, but the sentiments behind it are still valid. This report focuses on the key issues – equal pay, job opportunities, childcare, poverty, violence, influence and decision-making – that are important to most women and makes recommendations for improving the position of women in Scotland in these areas. It does not set out to cover every issue that is important to women, and it does not look in detail at how different groups of women, such as older women, women from minority ethnic or faith communities, disabled women or women who are lesbian, bi-sexual or transgender, are affected by the key issues in different ways. We were asked to focus on key issues and priorities but we have indicated where we think more work needs to be done to take account of the different needs of different groups of women and registered our view that we expect that this will require further consultation.

In our discussions we kept returning to a number of principles or reasons for our recommendations. The principles underpinning this report are that:

- women contribute – both through paid and unpaid work - as much as men to the economic and social well-being of the country which is why they need to get fair treatment and recognition for their contribution;
- social, economic and cultural frameworks should not hinder women from reaching their full potential;
- women should be able to make their own choices and live independently, without dependency on other people, if that is their choice;
- services, whether in the public, private and other sectors, should fit women's lives instead of women's lives having to fit around the services that they are offered;
- recognition that women are not all the same; that the way society is structured and widespread attitudes cause additional barriers for some women who are disabled, lesbian, bi-sexual or transgender, from a minority ethnic or minority faith community, because of their age, ability to speak English or where they live; and
- attitudes that limit what women and men aspire to and attain need to continue to change in the interests of both men and women and future generations

The members of the Group have between them an enormous range of experience and knowledge from their involvement in paid and unpaid work and from activity in the community– far too much to try to summarise here – and I would like to thank them for contributing their time, energy and expertise to the production of this report.

**Joan Stringer**  
**November 2003**

<b>CONTENTS</b>	<b>PAGE</b>
<b>Executive Summary</b>	<b>6</b>
<b>Introduction</b>	<b>17</b>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The Group</li> <li>• The Group’s work</li> <li>• The scope of the report</li> </ul>	
<b>Section One: Setting the scene – the position of women in Scotland today</b>	<b>21</b>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The position of women in Scotland</li> <li>• Key statistics</li> <li>• What women say the issues are</li> <li>• The role of the Scottish Executive, the Scottish Parliament and local authorities</li> <li>• The role of women’s organisations</li> <li>• The importance of developing the agenda for gender equality</li> </ul>	
<b>Section Two: Key policy issues to be addressed</b>	
<b>EMPLOYMENT</b>	<b>32</b>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Equal pay</li> <li>• Low pay, job segregation and unemployment</li> <li>• Promoting diversity in the workplace</li> </ul>	
<b>CHILDCARE</b>	<b>41</b>
<b>CARING (FOR OLDER PEOPLE AND PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES) AND PERSONAL ASSISTANCE</b>	<b>45</b>
<b>POVERTY AND EXCLUSION</b>	<b>47</b>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Poverty and social exclusion</li> <li>• Difficulties in access to services, including in rural areas</li> </ul>	
<b>VIOLENCE AND SAFETY</b>	<b>53</b>
<b>INFLUENCE AND DECISION-MAKING</b>	<b>55</b>

## **Section Three: Political Institutions and Policy Approaches**

THE SCOTTISH PARLIAMENT	<b>58</b>
• The Scottish Parliament	
• Equal Opportunities Committee	
THE SCOTTISH EXECUTIVE - POLICY APPROACHES AND CONSULTATION WITH WOMEN	<b>59</b>
• Mainstreaming equality	
• Monitoring, research and evaluation	
• Statutory duty requiring public bodies to promote gender equality	
• Awareness raising and campaigning about gender equality issues	
• Consultation with women	
RELATIONS BETWEEN THE SCOTTISH EXECUTIVE AND THE UK GOVERNMENT	<b>66</b>
• Relations between the Scottish Executive and the UK Government	
• Division of devolved and reserved matters	
<b>Conclusion</b>	<b>70</b>
<b>Summary of action point recommendations</b>	<b>71</b>
<b>Biographical details of group members</b>	<b>81</b>
<b>Appendix of acronyms</b>	<b>86</b>

## **EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

### **The Group and this report**

The Group was asked by the Minister for Communities (the then Minister for Social Justice), Margaret Curran MSP, to take a strategic look at the issues facing women in Scotland today and to suggest an agenda for action for the next Scottish Executive. The report:

- sets the scene for the Group's recommendations by describing inequalities that are still experienced by women in Scotland.
- sets out the Group's recommendations in a number of key – and mainly familiar - areas that affect most women such as employment and pay, childcare and other forms of caring, poverty and exclusion, violence, influence and decision-making.
- suggests some ways in which political institutions such as the Scottish Parliament and the Scottish Executive can improve the way in which they deal with women's issues.
- is a contribution to the process of improving the position of women in Scotland which, if acted upon, should bring about a substantial improvement in various aspects of the lives of women in Scotland.
- stresses the importance of recognising and understanding the diverse experiences of women across Scotland, but does not look in detail at how different groups are affected by the key issues discussed.

### **The position of women in Scotland today**

- Inequality between women and men is both a widespread and persistent feature of contemporary Scottish society.
- Although there have been many great advances for women over the last century and a higher profile for equal opportunities in Scotland since the establishment of the Scottish Parliament and Scottish Executive, in general women today still have less access than men to income and other material resources, less time that is their own, less political power and have a 1 in 5 chance of experiencing domestic abuse during their lives.
- Not all women experience the same degree of inequality though discrimination and prejudice can still affect women whatever their social status and earning power.

- Social and economic disadvantage, problems associated with living in rural areas, and other types of discrimination and prejudice such as racism, ageism, homophobia, or discrimination against disabled people, affect both women and men, but tend to have a greater impact on women because of the underlying gender inequalities and sexism that permeate Scottish society.
- The factors that contribute to this inequality are complex and inter-related, so the strategies we adopt to tackle these issues have to take into account all the areas that impact on women's lives.
- Thinking about the needs of different groups of women and adapting policies and services to meet those needs – mainstreaming gender equality – has to become part of the everyday work of all policy makers, service providers and organisations in general.

### **Key Policy Areas: Recommendations**

All of the following recommendations should be viewed in the light of the Group's recognition that women are not all the same and that issues of ethnicity, language, faith, age, geography, sexual orientation, disability, social and economic status must be taken in to account in implementing each recommendation.

#### **EMPLOYMENT: Equal Pay**

The Scottish Executive should develop a strategic plan for reducing the gender pay gap which includes the following:

- Setting targets for the reduction of the gender pay gap in both the short term and longer term
- Prioritising sectors within the Scottish economy for action on equal pay
- Requiring public bodies to carry out pay reviews and encouraging their conduct within the private sector
- Identifying how public sector procurement policies can advance compliance with equal opportunities and promoting the use of such policies
- Promoting flexible working arrangements for employees' benefit
- Setting up programmes to tackle gender segregation
- Increasing the numbers of women decision makers in business and economic development, as well as in the public sector

## **EMPLOYMENT: Low Pay, Job Segregation and Unemployment**

- The Scottish Executive should set up a short life working group for schools and Her Majesty's Inspectorate of Education to look at gender issues , including the gender issues that affect career choice and opportunity, sexual harassment in schools and gender in the curriculum.
- EOC should be invited to conduct more investigations into unlawful practices which maintain barriers to women pursuing particular careers
- Key bodies should encourage more women and men into non-traditional sectors and occupations. The Scottish Executive should examine the value to employers of carrying out training audits
- The Scottish Executive, business organisations and trade unions should collaborate in identifying good practice in providing better in-work training opportunities. The Scottish Executive should commission research to identify how training is being advanced for women in low paid jobs.
- The Scottish Executive should extend mentoring schemes for women.
- Public sector bodies should develop strategies on equal pay and job segregation.
- The Scottish Executive should provide, through Careers Scotland, careers guidance and advice to cater for older women and women in rural areas.

## **EMPLOYMENT: Promoting Diversity in the workplace**

- The Scottish Executive, EOC, the Enterprise Networks, employers' organisations such as the CBI and FSB and other agencies should be actively making and promoting the business case for diversity
- The Scottish Executive should explore how it can assist SMEs in promoting diversity in the workplace and raise with UK government the need for greater support to employers who are interested in good practice.
- The Scottish Executive should undertake research on costs/benefits of flexible working.
- The Scottish Executive should promote good practice on flexible working in the public sector

- The Scottish Executive and EOC in collaboration with agencies in Scotland working on age issues should promote the link between gender equality and legislation on age discrimination, which comes into force in 2006.
- The Scottish Executive should ensure that measures to engage women fully in economic activity are part of the Fresh Talent initiative.

## **CHILDCARE**

- The Scottish Executive should set specific targets for increasing provision for pre-school and school age children.
- The Scottish Executive should improve funding mechanisms to ensure the sustainability of childcare provision.
- The Scottish Executive, local authorities and the voluntary sector should increase community based childcare provision, particularly in rural areas.
- The Scottish Executive should consider providing some childcare support through social economy initiatives
- The Scottish Executive and EOC should encourage employer support for childcare
- The Scottish Executive should enhance the quality and value of the childcare workforce. There should be a review of the pay and conditions of childcare workers in the public and private sectors.
- There should be improved liaison between the UK government and Scottish interests to ensure that the impact of employment and benefits policies on lone parents in Scotland are understood.
- The Scottish Executive should provide figures for Scotland on value of unpaid childcare work using the ONS Time Use and Household satellite Accounts.
- The Scottish Executive should examine its scope for encouraging fairer shares in childcare and enabling men to take more time with their children.

## **CARING (FOR OLDER PEOPLE AND PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES) AND PERSONAL ASSISTANCE**

- The Scottish Executive and local authorities should continue increasing support for those who provide care or assistance for older people and disabled people by providing more and better professional help.
- The Scottish Executive should encourage employers to support those who have caring responsibilities for older people and disabled people through flexible working arrangements and information about local carer support services.
- UK Government should improve its liaison with Scottish interests to ensure that the impact of UK employment and benefit policies take account of Scottish circumstances.
- The value of unpaid carer work for older people or disabled people should be recognised through calculating its financial value
- Care policies need to enable choice about who provides assistance or care for both providers and recipients.

## **POVERTY AND EXCLUSION: Poverty and Social Exclusion**

In general the Scottish Executive should ensure that gender is effectively mainstreamed in its social inclusion strategies. In particular this should include the following:

- Collecting information such as benefit take-up and access to financial services which reflects the respective positions of men and women. The Scottish Executive should ensure that it reports on gender as part of its social inclusion work
- Providing support for projects like childcare and training that are particularly beneficial to women and to include a focus on teenage girls in low income households
- Taking measures such as targeted consultation to ensure the women are engaged in the projects and strategies for regeneration of communities.
- UK Government and the Scottish Executive raising awareness about the links between poverty and age

## **POVERTY AND EXCLUSION: Difficulties in access to services, including in rural areas**

- The Scottish Executive and local authorities should review the extent to which gender perspectives are taken into account in the strategic planning of public services, including taking into account particular problems in rural areas.
- Relevant authorities should be invited to examine how the position of women workers in public services can be improved. Local authorities should be invited to consider how schools can be better used as community resources.
- The Scottish Executive should reconsider the rules relating to relatives as childcare providers in rural areas, where there may be no pre-five provision, and urban areas where there may not be sufficient places to meet demand, including discussion with the UK Government about related taxation and benefits issues.

## **VIOLENCE AND SAFETY**

- The Scottish Executive should maintain the momentum already achieved on tackling domestic abuse against women
- The Scottish Executive should consider whether existing work on domestic abuse addresses the needs of disabled women, older women, women from minority ethnic communities, women in rural areas and those in same sex relationships.
- The Scottish Executive should consider treating assaults on basis of gender, disability, age and sexual orientation as aggravated assaults.

## **INFLUENCE AND DECISION-MAKING**

- Women's organisations and in particular the EOC should be invited to undertake work with political parties to increase women's political representation.
- The Scottish Executive should ensure that reform of the electoral system for local government helps to contribute to the increased representation of women
- The Scottish Executive should set new targets for women's representation on public bodies and take active steps to improve it.

- Public, voluntary and private sector bodies should be actively encouraged how? to increase women's representation in their decision making.
- The Scottish Executive should continue to support improved dialogue with women and women's organisations.
- The Scottish Civic Forum should be invited to report on how it is engaging women and women's organisations.

## **Political Institutions and Policy Approaches: Recommendations**

### **THE SCOTTISH PARLIAMENT**

- The Scottish Parliament should be invited to debate the Group's report on key issues for the agenda for women in Scotland;
- The Scottish Parliament should consider creating a mechanism to monitor the mainstreaming of gender issues in all committee business.

### **THE SCOTTISH PARLIAMENT: Equal Opportunities Committee**

- We hope the Committee will give a higher profile to the issues of women's inequality and it should seek to engage with the relevant women's organisations that can provide evidence as appropriate to areas of policy development and legislation.
- The Committee is invited to take this report into account in drawing up its next workplan, including its work to mainstream equalities into the work of all of the other committees in the Parliament.

### **THE SCOTTISH EXECUTIVE – POLICY APPROACHES AND CONSULTATION WITH WOMEN**

#### **Mainstreaming Equality**

- All new policy development and draft legislation should consider the impact on men and women and different groups of men and women from the outset, and should seek to reduce gender inequalities. This should entail use of existing research or commissioning of new research as appropriate, consultation with groups likely to be affected by the policy, and the

development of evaluation and monitoring systems as an integral part of policy development.

- Progress on mainstreaming needs to be kept under review and annually reported on, 'champions' who will promote mainstreaming within each department should be identified, information on mainstreaming should be included on the Scottish Executive website by the end of 2003, and mechanisms for measuring success should be developed by the end of 2004.

### **Monitoring, research and evaluation**

- A body of in-depth empirical research in Scotland is required which describes, analyses, and offers explanations for persisting gender inequalities, and which is applied to policy making as a matter of course. The development of systems of evaluation that provide assessments of gender impacts of policies, and which are integral to policy making, is also needed. Scottish Executive Departments should consider commissioning such research. This work should start now.
- By the end of 2004 all new projects should be properly monitored or evaluated and guidance on how to do this should be made available to project managers. Data collection should be standardised; key policy areas where mainstreaming can be more effectively developed by integrating gender analysis of data and research should be identified; and more effective strategies to disseminate the results of gender research to policy-makers and others should be developed.
- All Scottish Executive Departments and other stakeholders should think through what their role should be in taking forward the recommendations listed in this report, whether there is other action they could take to improve the position of women and whether/what research would be required to facilitate them to do so.
- As a matter of course, there should be regular reporting on all agreed objectives listed in this report, and research and evaluation programmes should be put into place alongside practical initiatives. This should include:

### ***Employment***

- Review evidence on the gender pay gap, and women's participation in the labour market, across the Scottish economy;
- Assess the impact of pay reviews;
- Collect data on the position of women in decision-making in business;
- Promote research identifying the benefits to business of diversity, and of flexible working arrangements.

### ***Childcare and other forms of caring***

- Calculate the value of unpaid caring, both of childcare and care for adults;
- Provide better data and research on demand for and usage of childcare, including evaluation separately of benefits for mothers and for fathers.

### ***Poverty and exclusion***

- Systematically incorporate evaluations of gender impacts of projects and initiatives into social inclusion policies;
- Review evidence of gender awareness in public service delivery.

### ***Violence and Safety***

- Assess whether work on domestic abuse and violence against women is addressing the specific needs of minority ethnic women, disabled women, older women, women in rural areas and women in same sex relationships.

### ***Influence and decision-making***

- Promote research on women and decision-making across areas where data is currently limited, such as business, trade unions, voluntary and civic organisations, and research on models and approaches to capacity building.

## **Statutory duty requiring public bodies to promote gender equality**

- It is recommended that an assessment of the impact of statutory duties in promoting gender equality should be carried out, and that consideration should be given to how this policy approach may be applied in Scotland as part of an overall mainstreaming strategy.

- In addition evidence of the impact of the relevant equality clauses of legislation passed in the first session of the Scottish Parliament should be reported on regularly. If it is being found to be effective, an equality clause should be considered in all Scottish Executive legislation.

### **Awareness raising and campaigning about gender equality issues**

- The Scottish Executive should raise the profile of women's inequality and the issues facing women through a campaign, such as those run on domestic abuse and anti-racism. In particular there is a need to dispel the myth that women have achieved equality and there is little left to address. Any campaign could include the strategy set out in this report and key forthcoming events. Such awareness raising campaigns should include looking at the information which is given in schools and in particular should consider making information on employment rights and entitlements available.

### **Consultation with women**

- The Scottish Executive should provide a vehicle for women's organisations in Scotland to come together to provide a further channel for them to engage with the Scottish Executive, Scottish Parliament and other institutions; and to provide strategic input from women's organisations into policy development in order to mainstream key issues of importance to women in Scotland. The new Scottish Women's Convention should take over most of the intended work of the WISCF; the Forum should live on as an annual meeting to celebrate International Women's Day. The Convention should be looked to provide a strategic input into policy development on particular topics. To do that it will need to be properly resourced and have access to and engagement with the relevant people in the Executive, Parliament and other decision-making organisations. We would invite the Women's Convention to consider this report.
- Local events and consultations involving the Executive, Parliament and women's organisations should continue, to allow discussion of issues of local and national importance.
- The Minister for Communities should enter into dialogue as soon as possible with the different women's interests and organisations working with other groups of which women are potentially members and explore in more detail the issues

arising from multiple identity and/or compound discrimination. This report could serve as a basis for that dialogue but the Scottish Executive should be open to broadening the agenda if required to encompass the different perspectives which must be reflected.

## **RELATIONS BETWEEN THE SCOTTISH EXECUTIVE AND THE UK GOVERNMENT**

- The relevant government departments should be invited to take a more proactive role in promoting UK policies in the Scottish context and in working collaboratively with the Scottish Executive where these dovetail with Executive activities more generally.
- The Scottish Executive has an important role to play in ensuring that the views of women in Scotland are reflected at a UK and European level through the appropriate government machinery, and could usefully consult with the Equal Opportunities Committee as part of this process.
- The Scottish Executive should provide better information on gender issues on its website and provide links to the Women and Equality Unit, and other departments in Whitehall.
- The Scottish Executive should make a strong case for as much devolution of authority as possible to Scotland within the structure of a Single Equality Body, and for adequate resourcing of this to ensure that the distinctive nature and differing priorities relating to the position of women in Scotland is addressed.

## INTRODUCTION

On 30 January 2003, Minister for Social Justice, Margaret Curran MSP, announced the appointment of a small short life group to take a strategic look at the issues facing women in Scotland today and to suggest an agenda for action for the next Scottish Executive.

### The Group

#### ***Aim of the Group***

To recommend actions to improve the lives of women in Scotland and which promote and achieve equality between women and men.

#### ***Remit of the Group***

- To consider the key issues facing women in Scotland;
- To identify what needs to be done to enable women in Scotland to benefit from the UK Government/Scottish Executive partnership;
- To identify the areas in which action could best ensure that women realise their potential; and
- To produce an agenda for action for consideration by the incoming Executive.

#### ***Members of the group***

Professor Joan Stringer, Convenor	Principal and Vice-Chancellor of Napier University
Rowena Arshad	Equal Opportunities Commissioner and Director for the Centre for Education for Racial Equality in Scotland, University of Edinburgh
Maria Fyfe	Vice Chair Glasgow Housing Association, former MP
Barbara Kelly	Partner in a farming enterprise near Dumfries with longstanding involvement in rural and consumer affairs.
Jane McKay	Secretary Glasgow Trades Council
Susan Rice	Chief Executive Officer Lloyds TSB Scotland
Sally Witcher	Independent Consultant and Chair of Disability Employment Advisory Committee

***Research support:*** Esther Breitenbach, University of Edinburgh

***Secretariat:*** Scottish Executive Equality Unit

## **The Group's work**

The group was intended to bring together women with experience across a range of sectors and interests, though not necessarily to be representative of the interests of all women. The group met eight times over six months. It was charged with providing a strategic overview and therefore did not commission detailed research to investigate any particular premise or position. It did however commission briefing papers and seek to draw on relevant research already available.<sup>1</sup> It sought to build on work already undertaken by women and women's organisations in Scotland. Thus, in making its recommendations the group has endeavoured to draw upon the work and experience of its members, on research on women's and gender issues in Scotland, and on the work of women's organisations in Scotland. The recommendations outlined in this report should therefore be seen as complementary to the work of women's organisations, and as a contribution to advancing gender equality in Scotland.

## **The scope of the report**

This report is a contribution to the process of improving the position of women in Scotland. It aims to focus attention on key issues for women in Scotland for the Executive and others to address. The key issues that we discuss – employment and pay, childcare and other forms of caring, poverty and social exclusion, violence and safety, and influence and decision-making – are not new to debates on gender equality. Rather they are familiar issues, where changes have been taking place as a result of women's campaigning and action over the years, but where further change is still needed.

Our report makes some recommendations for immediate, medium term, and long term action. But it also recognises that many of the familiar issues are complex and the action plans to tackle them will need to be refined and developed as women's organisations, stakeholders and key institutions and organisations, including groups that work with men, consider how best to implement and

---

<sup>1</sup> Research carried out by Dr Fiona Mackay, University of Edinburgh: for further information see <http://www.pol.ed.ac.uk/gcc>. Papers commissioned for the group, written by Esther Breitenbach, University of Edinburgh: Statutory Duties to Promote Equal Opportunities and Evidence of their Impact; Summary and Discussion of Research Reviews on Women's and Gender Issues in Scotland, and Women in Scotland Consultative Forum.

deliver real change for the women of Scotland. The proposed Women's Convention will no doubt play a role in bringing these groups together to do this work. What we hope to do with our report is to help move forward debate and action on gender equality, by suggesting a range of objectives and action points for the Scottish Executive, and by identifying key bodies and organisations who must work together to achieve change.

We recognise, however, that our report does not cover every issue, nor can it do full justice to the variety of experiences in women's lives in Scotland. We cannot stress enough that attention must be paid to the specific experiences of different groups of women and women with different characteristics. As debates and thinking on gender equality have developed, and as more research and information is gathered on the experiences of different groups, it has become apparent that both the identities and experiences of individuals and groups are understood in complex ways. The discrimination that women encounter, when it is based on prejudice against more than one characteristic, may make, for example, ethnicity or disability a much more important factor than gender. The needs of different groups of women do not necessarily coincide, and each will have their own priorities. For instance, childcare, which is of key importance to many women with young children, is of less relevance where cultural norms and practices do not give rise to a demand for formal provision. Furthermore, even if childcare provision is increased, that of itself may not be adequate or appropriate to meet the childcare needs of mothers or children with disabilities.

If there is a new factor in the development of a strategy for women's equality in Scotland, it is this growing recognition of the diversity of women, and growing awareness of the problems faced by people suffering from multiple discrimination. Some aspects of this diversity of experience have not yet been the subject of widespread discussion or research, for example, the relationship between different faith groups and other aspects of community relations, the unequal treatment of women within their own communities, the inadequacy of current safeguards for women trying to establish their human rights against cultural misogyny, and how women see their prospects for empowerment within various faith groups and communities, and support for women trying to overcome traditional cultural restraints on their activities. This report in itself cannot give a full account of the different needs

of women, based on their age, gender, faith, disability, ethnicity, sexuality, and where they live. However, we strongly recommend that those who mainstream gender into policy development and implementation require to engage with the specific issues that may face different groups of women and develop relevant action plans accordingly. Such action plans should also be arrived at after further dialogue with groups and individuals familiar with the needs and experiences of different groups of women.

The Group was not asked to consider gender inequalities suffered by men in Scotland, such as the lower attainment rates of boys at school, the higher rate of suicide amongst young men and men's lower life expectancy. These problems are important and are being addressed by others. However the Group would wish to see more dialogue and collaboration between agencies that work to address gender equalities, be that for women or men so as to enable best progress on gender equality in Scotland.

## **SECTION ONE**

### **SETTING THE SCENE – THE POSITION OF WOMEN IN SCOTLAND TODAY**

#### **The position of women in Scotland**

Inequality between women and men is both a widespread and persistent feature of contemporary Scottish society. In general women have:

- less access than men to income, earnings, pensions and material resources such as cars or housing;
- less access to time that is their own and not spent on caring for other people or on paid or unpaid work;
- less access to political power and to decision-making across a range of public bodies; and
- they have a 1 in 5 chance of experiencing domestic abuse during their lives.

The factors that contribute to this inequality are complex and inter-related, and as a consequence there are often no easy or quick means of reducing inequality. Not all women experience the same degree of inequality though discrimination and prejudice can still affect women whatever their social status and earning power. Social and economic disadvantage, problems associated with living in rural areas, and other types of discrimination and prejudice such as racism, ageism, homophobia, or discrimination against disabled people, affect both women and men, but tend to have a greater impact on women because of the underlying gender inequalities and sexism that permeate Scottish society.

Women of all ages, backgrounds and class may find that being a woman is all that it takes to experience discrimination, to be stereotyped, to be overlooked in the selection and recruitment to senior positions and decision making bodies or to be one of the one in five who during their lifetime is the subject of domestic abuse.

If a woman is a lone parent without adequate access to childcare, she cannot access work or education easily. Her chances of earning are thereby lessened and her low income may mean poverty now and in old age. She may live in a deprived area or a

rural area and have less access to services. Her poverty and life experience may mean that she is more prone to ill-health. And if she is from a minority ethnic community, and may not have English as her first language, and/or is a disabled person and/or is a lesbian, her exclusion may be compounded.

We cannot tackle underachievement, alienation, deprivation and poverty if we do not also deal with issues of confidence and aspiration and vice versa. So the strategies we adopt to tackle the women's agenda have to take into account all the areas that impact on women's lives. There has to be a holistic approach and a commitment to mainstream gender equality. There has also to be an acknowledgement of the pivotal role of women in the lives of others. For example policy makers tackling child poverty need to understand the issues of women's poverty.

Dealing with many of the issues facing women will require changes in the behaviour and attitude of both men and women.

Changes in gender relations have of course been occurring, but these have often been very slow. For example:

- women gained access to Higher Education over a century ago, but participation of women and men in equal numbers and equality of attainment has only been achieved in recent years, and there are still significant differences between genders in the subjects studied.
- women obtained the vote in 1918, but there is not yet equal representation of women in most political institutions in the UK, the Welsh Assembly being the outstanding exception with 50% women members, and the Scottish Parliament achieving 39% women's representation.
- women began to campaign for equal pay in the late nineteenth century. It took till 1970 for legislation to be passed, but equal pay has still not yet been achieved.
- women received statutory protection from discrimination in the workplace under the Sex Discrimination Act 1975 but they are still concentrated in low paid jobs and are under-represented in senior positions in most sectors.

## Key statistics

(All figures are for Scotland unless its says otherwise)

<b>Things have got better because</b>	<b>But things still need to be done because</b>
Since the election in May 2003 women now make up 39.5% of <b>MSPs</b> , up from 37.2% in the first Scottish Parliament.	Women make up only 15% of <b>MPs</b> representing Scottish constituencies at Westminster.  And women are only 22% of <b>local councillors</b> (2003) - virtually unchanged since 1996.
Women now hold 36% of Ministerial <b>public appointments</b> (July 2003), up from 31% in 1999.	They make up only 22% of <b>chairs</b> to public bodies.
In 2002, 70% of women of working age were <b>economically active</b> (compared to 82% of men of working age).	In 2002, 42% of women in employment worked <b>part-time</b> (compared to only 9% of men).
In 2002, half of newly qualified solicitors, one third of new police officers and 41% of NHS doctors are women.	Work is still <b>split</b> into “women’s work” and “men’s work”: nearly 70% of managers and administrators are men, while 74% of clerical and secretarial workers are women.
The gender <b>pay gap</b> – the difference between the average pay of men and women - has been getting smaller since the Equal Pay Act 1970.	The gender pay gap in 2003 was still 16% (down from 19% in 2002) for full-time workers.
Women’s median weekly <b>individual income</b> in 2001/02 was 59% of men's income, up from 49% of men’s income in 1996/97.	That’s still a gap of 41%
Girls are doing better than boys at <b>school</b> : more girls get 5 or more Higher Grades at A-C, fewer leave at the end of	In Higher Education there is still a <b>split</b> between “men’s subjects” and “women’s subjects”: over 80% of

<p>compulsory education and more participate in Higher Education.</p>	<p>engineering &amp; technology and architecture students are men while over 70% of social studies, veterinary science, subjects allied to medicine and creative arts students are women. Women graduates earn 15% less than men within 5 years of graduating.</p>
<p>Evaluation of the domestic abuse television <b>advertising campaign</b> "Behind Closed Doors" showed maintenance of an awareness factor of over 75% - very high in advertising terms.</p>	<p>In 2001, the police recorded over 35,800 incidents of domestic abuse in Scotland; 91% of the victims were women, and 91% of the perpetrators were male.</p>

### **What women say the issues are**

Since 1998 the Women in Scotland Consultative Forum (WISCF) has brought together a wide range of women's organisations to discuss policy priorities with Ministers and civil servants. Among the key issues consistently raised and discussed, and where women's organisations would like to see action on gender equality are:

- violence against women
- social inclusion and poverty
- employment and training, particularly equal pay and low pay
- childcare
- education
- decision-making in political and public life.

All of these issues have been on the agenda of women's organisations for a considerable period of time, and all of them have been discussed by the Group. There is a broad consensus about the areas where change is most needed, and that there is still a long way to go to achieve gender equality in Scotland. To make change happen a clear agenda with specific policy goals is needed.

We have also mentioned earlier in this report newer issues that have not yet been the subject of widespread discussion or research but which we think should be. Recent research <sup>2</sup> about the impact of devolution also points to the need for:

- effective monitoring of gender mainstreaming and progress towards gender equality;
- more effective communication between Scottish and English/GB/UK counterparts;
- targets for increasing women's representation in senior decision-making positions in politics, the civil service, public and economic life;
- resources and capacity building for the women's sector; and
- tackling any backlash against gender equality.

### **The role of the Scottish Executive, the Scottish Parliament and local authorities**

Since 1997 government has shown a much stronger commitment to gender equality. Improvements since then include the introduction of the national minimum wage, better rights to maternity leave, parental rights to request flexible working, and action to tackle child poverty. The Scottish Office began a process of consultation with women and started to build up staff resources on gender and other equality issues. With devolution in 1999 the Scottish Executive established the Equality Unit, and launched its Equality Strategy in November 2000. In the UK government there is a dedicated Women and Equality Unit, and the devolved administrations in Wales and Northern Ireland have also created equality policy units and put strategies in place. In recent years, Scottish local authorities have also increased their work on equalities issues and the Local Government in Scotland Act 2003 will increase it further, particularly through the new Community Planning and Best Value duties.

#### ***The Scottish Executive***

The Scottish Executive regards gender equality as an integral part of its Equality Strategy <sup>3</sup>. This strategy covers a wide range of groups and equality issues, and such a challenging agenda has

---

<sup>2</sup> Research carried out by Dr Fiona Mackay, University of Edinburgh: for further information see <http://www.pol.ed.ac.uk/gcc>.

<sup>3</sup> Available at <http://www.scotland.gov.uk/library3/social/wtem-00.asp>

been difficult to push forward across all groups simultaneously. On the one hand much progress has been made in developing working relationships with a range of groups, in particular minority ethnic organisations, lesbian, gay, bi-sexual and transgender organisations, and disabled people's organisations (particularly through work on the European Year of Disabled People 2003); on the other hand many women's organisations feel that the Executive has not focussed enough on gender equality and that the initial momentum has not been sustained. There are significant and persistent gender inequalities still existing in Scotland today, and it is recognised that many individual women and women's organisations are frustrated at the slow rate of progress and are impatient for change. The recent statements by Ministers that this should be remedied and action taken to develop both an agenda for action and strengthen women's organisations has therefore been welcome.

Women's lives in Scotland are affected by policies of both UK and Scottish governments, and sometimes both levels of government need to work together to make change happen. As yet these relationships are not always clearly established.

### ***The Scottish Parliament***

The respective remits and roles of the Parliament and the Executive have not always been clear to the general public. In some respects the Executive and Parliament have worked together, but there has also been tension between the two because of the Parliament's responsibility to scrutinise the actions of the Executive, and to criticise or modify these if it thinks fit. It has not always been clear to women's organisations who to approach to raise policy concerns.

Within the period of the first Scottish Parliament from 1999 to 2003, many mechanisms and strategies for the promotion of gender equality have been put in place. This has involved the creation of new institutional machinery and working relationships between government at different levels, between the Scottish Parliament and the Scottish Executive, and between women's organisations and the Parliament and the Executive. Developing this set of complex new relationships has often made progress very slow.

One of the founding principles of the Scottish Parliament is equality of opportunity. The Parliament has a standing Equal Opportunities Committee, and such parliamentary structures, and features such as 'family-friendly' working hours, make the Scottish Parliament a different kind of institution from Westminster (which despite recent improvement does not yet have family-friendly hours). Women also argue that in the main they work differently, supporting constructive committee work, and are less confrontational than men.

In the first Parliament just over 37% of MSPs were women. This increased to 39.5% in May 2003. Though the goal of 50:50 is still to be achieved the significant level of women's representation has given a higher profile to women's issues. Women across political parties argue that they have made a difference. They have shaped policy on areas such as domestic violence, sexual offences, women's and men's health, childcare, free personal care for older people, and the repeal of section 2A (thus removing constraints to the discussion of sexual orientation in schools). Gender perspectives have also been introduced to other policy areas, including enterprise, transport, rural development and environmental issues. Several Acts have included a duty on public service providers to promote equality of opportunity<sup>4</sup>, for example, Acts on education, care, housing, local government, and mental health. The first Act that was put forward by a Parliamentary Committee was the Protection from Abuse (Scotland) Act 2001, which gives greater protection to women at risk of violence from partners or former partners.

A key achievement of both the Scottish Executive and the Scottish Parliament is action against domestic violence, with significant improvements in service provision, enhanced protection through legislation, and prevention work and awareness raising campaigns. On the other hand gender issues are not always as prominent as they might be, and opportunities have been lost to point out how policies are particularly beneficial to women, for example, the introduction of free personal care.

---

<sup>4</sup> The relevant sections of these Acts are as follows: Section 5 of the Standards in Scotland's Schools etc Act 2000, Sections 1 and 43 of the Regulation of Care (Scotland) Act 2001, Section 106 of the Housing (Scotland) Act 2002, Section 59 of the Local Government in Scotland Act 2003, and Section 3 of the Mental Health (Care and Treatment) (Scotland) Act 2003

## ***Local authorities***

Local authorities deliver a wide range of services to their residents including schools, libraries, leisure centres, parks, local transport, planning, housing and social work services. Many local authorities have dedicated staff working to mainstream equal opportunities throughout the authority's work either in a dedicated equality unit or as part of the work of the Chief Executive's office.

The Local Government in Scotland Act 2003 is likely to increase local authorities focus on equal opportunities. It has three core elements:

- a power for local authorities to advance the well-being of their area and/or persons in it;
- statutory underpinning for Community Planning through the introduction of a duty on local authorities and key partners; and
- a duty to secure Best Value (i.e. delivering continuous improvement in a local authority's performance).

Together these elements are intended to provide a framework for better, more responsive public services, promote joined-up working between all the key agencies, encourage greater community participation, achieve delivery of better quality services, and promote a culture of continuous improvement. In delivering continuous improvement in their performance, local authorities must have regard specifically to existing equal opportunities legislation.

## **The role of women's organisations**

Access for women's organisations to the Executive has improved compared to the pre-devolution situation, and the Parliament is also accessible to women's organisations. Women's organisations in Scotland have made their views known to Ministers and civil servants through the Women in Scotland Consultative Forum (WISCF), and have given evidence to Parliamentary Committees. They have responded to consultations, and participated in policy networks supported by the Scottish Executive, such as the Social Inclusion Network, and the Race Equality Advisory Forum. They have also worked together in the development of innovative policies, such as the National Strategy on Domestic Abuse, and on engendering budgets.

Disappointment has been expressed however at the stalled development of the WISCF. Though there are some examples of women's organisations having influenced policy, many feel that politicians and officials in general are too cautious in their approach. The lack of visibility of the women's agenda is a cause of disappointment and frustration, and women's organisations would like to see the Scottish Executive take action on a range of policy issues.

### **The importance of developing the agenda for gender equality**

Women make a contribution to Scottish society through visible and measurable means such as paid work, and through unpaid work, caring, and voluntary activities, which are harder to measure, but just as crucial to the general level of development of society and to the quality of life of its citizens. Despite this contribution, they remain under-represented in decision-making bodies in political, public and economic life. As a matter of social justice this gender imbalance needs to change. As a result institutions will be more representative and able to respond appropriately to diverse communities.

Women's **contribution to economic development** through paid work has been increasing over a period of several decades, and continues to do so. Yet this valuable resource of women's human capital is being under-utilised in the Scottish economy. This is because women still lose out in terms of pay, promotion, and pensions through interruptions to paid employment to undertake childcare and other caring responsibilities. Where women do not return to work investment in training is lost, and costs are incurred in recruiting new employees. Where women do return after childbirth they may do so at a lower level, and hence their skills and potential are not being realised to the full. Policies that enhance women's participation in the labour market are particularly important in the context of an ageing population and a decline in the proportion of the population of working age. Policies that support better pension provision for women are important, and a step towards reducing the incidence of women's poverty in old age.

Scotland's population is projected to change in a number of ways that are likely to make women's contribution to the economy even more important than it is now. There is likely to be a greater

equalisation of women and men's life expectancy, and of their numbers in the population as a whole. The overall numbers in the population will shrink, the proportion of young people will decline, and the proportion of older people will increase. In particular there will be a big increase in the proportion of people aged 51 and over. This implies that using older people's labour more effectively in the economy will be very important, and new legislation outlawing discrimination on grounds of age in 2006 should help this to happen. At the same time the majority of new jobs created are likely to be in the service sector, and many will require communication and 'people' skills, and therefore may well open up employment opportunities for women. The proportion of mothers of under 5s in work is also predicted to continue to increase. Women's labour, whether that of working mothers, or of older women, is therefore going to be a very important resource for the development of the Scottish economy. Measures which support women's participation in paid work, whether childcare provision, support to carers of older people and other adults, appropriate training, and anti-age discrimination measures, will therefore be crucial.

There is a pressing need for **women's work to be fully valued and rewarded**, but also for women to be supported in the organisation of their working lives through adequate childcare provision, and flexible working arrangements. Such provision and arrangements are also beneficial to men, enabling them to balance work and family commitments differently. The contribution that women's unpaid caring work makes to society and to the economy also needs to be better acknowledged.

With respect to public services these are often not sensitive enough to the different needs of women and men or to different groups of women and men. While women make up the large majority of public service workers, they are under-represented at senior levels, often low paid, and work in an environment where changes are frequent and demanding. Their views are seldom heard in the debate about improving public services. The views of women as service users are also seldom heard. They are under-represented on decision-making bodies, and have little access to a policy making process that can have major impacts on their lives. Empowering women in public services, both as workers and as users, and listening to their views will enhance the quality of public services, and contribute to greater gender equality.

There are compelling reasons for developing the agenda on gender equality in Scotland. It will make Scotland more democratic and socially just; it will contribute to Scotland's economic success; and it will improve the quality of public services.

## **SECTION TWO**

### **KEY POLICY ISSUES TO BE ADDRESSED**

This section sets out the key policy issues identified by the group, and lists objectives, and action points for change, that should form part of an overall strategy for gender equality. These key issues are:

- Employment
- Childcare
- Caring (for older people and people with disabilities) and personal assistance
- Poverty and Exclusion
- Violence and Safety
- Influence and Decision-making.

The objectives and actions listed may be immediate, medium, or long term. The table on page [56] provides a summary of these, and indicates Scottish Executive departments and other bodies who have a part to play in making change happen.

## EMPLOYMENT

There are a number of over-lapping aspects of women's position in employment that require to be addressed. These are:

- Equal Pay
- Low Pay, Job Segregation and Unemployment
- Promoting diversity in the workplace.

### Equal pay

**The issue:** despite the fact that the Equal Pay Act has been in force since 1975, the gap between men and women's average pay has been very slow to reduce. Women on average earn only 81p for every £1 earned by men when hourly earnings are compared; they on average earn only 76p for every £1 earned by men when weekly earnings are compared (men tend to work more hours per week and receive more overtime, bonus and shift premium payments). While interruptions to employment for childbearing and rearing contribute to the pay gap, this is not the only factor. For example, EOC research found that in 2002 women leaving higher education with the same qualification in the same discipline entering the same occupations as men earned 15% less after 5 years. Only a minority of employers in the UK are currently taking action to address the gender pay gap through conducting pay reviews – 18% of large employers, and 10% of medium sized employers.

Factors that contribute to the gender pay gap include the impact of gender segregation by industry and by occupation; discrimination; interruptions to employment for childbearing and caring; the effect of part-time work on women's pay and career prospects; and lack of flexibility in working hours. The pattern of gender inequality varies within different sectors of the economy, and in some areas there is more progress than in others.

Campaigns such as the Close the Gap campaign in Scotland have promoted the use by employers of the EOC's equal pay review kits and have provided training and advice for employers, trade unions and employees on equal pay issues. The EOC have backed a number of recent high-profile equal pay claims at industrial tribunals and all economic development and job training projects backed by European Structural Funds money have to demonstrate how they have promoted equal opportunities. But without further

action being taken, reduction of the pay gap is likely to continue to be slow, and this therefore necessitates a long term strategy, with a range of actions designed to tackle the range of factors contributing to inequalities in pay.

**Objective:** to reduce the gender pay gap

**Action points:**

### **A strategic plan for reducing the gender pay gap**

The Scottish Executive should develop a strategic plan for reducing the gender pay gap, identifying a range of actions, and the respective roles of government, employers, and trade unions in achieving this.

The strategy should include the following actions:

#### **1. Set a target for the reduction of the gender pay gap**

A target should be set for reduction of the gender pay gap for this Parliament, and for the longer term, based on a review of the evidence on the gender pay gap across the Scottish economy and within different sectors. We suggest that the target should be at least that all public sector organisations in Scotland and 25% of businesses (large and small) should have carried out a pay review by the end of 2005 and 2006 respectively. In particular pay agreements such as the Single Status Agreement in local government, and the new health services agreement on pay, which aim, amongst other things, to reduce the gender pay gap, should be evaluated for their success in achieving this. Consideration should be given to obliging public sector bodies, including non-departmental public bodies (NDPBs), as part of their conditions of grant to demonstrate that they are fulfilling their obligations under the Equal Pay Act 1970 and other equal opportunities legislation and are promoting equal opportunities in line with best practice.

#### **2. Prioritise sectors for action on equal pay**

Particular sectors should be prioritised for action. Criteria for selection should include those sectors in which change will have the most beneficial effects for the greatest number of women; those where the pay gap is greatest, or where inequalities in grades and pay are particularly persistent such as Finance and Higher Education.

### **3. Promote the conduct of pay reviews**

The Scottish Executive should require public bodies to conduct pay reviews to identify whether there are systematic inequalities in pay between men and women, and to devise schemes to remove such inequalities (building on pay reviews that have already been carried out, e.g. the Scottish Executive completed its own pay review in April 2003). We welcome the planned guidance to local authorities recommending that they carry out pay reviews in order to comply with their best value duties and the impact of this should be evaluated. Private sector organisations should be encouraged to conduct similar pay reviews, using the targets set out in the Kingsmill Review of Women's Employment and Pay, commissioned by the Department of Trade and Industry<sup>5</sup> i.e. 50% of large employers and 25% of smaller companies to carry out reviews within 3 years. This would build on the Close the Gap campaign. It should be emphasised that carrying out pay reviews can contribute to a company's Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) report, where companies have one. CSR reports cover such matters as a company's ethical trading policies, its concerns for the environment, the way it treats its own staff, and its investment in community or charitable activities. The European & External Relations Committee of the Scottish Parliament recently conducted an enquiry about CSR and there is increasing interest in it from shareholders and the general public.

### **4. Public sector procurement policies and compliance with equal opportunities**

The Scottish Executive should investigate how the procurement policies of public sector bodies might improve equal opportunities. Scottish Executive suppliers are informed that failure to comply with Race Relations legislation may render them ineligible to bid for Scottish Executive contracts. This should be extended so that all public sector bodies are required to adopt a policy that they will only buy goods and services from companies that themselves are equal opportunity employers and have a commitment to carrying out equal pay reviews demonstrating their compliance with the Equal Pay Act.

### **5. Promote flexible working arrangements**

The imbalance between women's and men's average working hours should be tackled by active support for more flexible working

---

<sup>5</sup> Denise Kingsmill, 'Review of Women's Employment and Pay', available at <http://www.kingsmillreview.gov.uk>

arrangements, and by challenging the long hours culture present in many organisations. The Scottish Executive can lead by example, can commission research to demonstrate the business case for flexible working, and enlist the support of key Scottish employers in promoting this. It is recognised that large employers often find it easier to introduce such arrangements, and in recognition of the significant proportion of small to medium sized enterprises (SMEs) in the Scottish economy, it is recommended that the Scottish Executive discusses with DTI a means to support SMEs in introducing more flexible working arrangements and in proactively taking forward equality legislation and related practices for both large employers and SMEs. This could include support and advice services and investigating practical ways of improving SMEs' access to temporary staff to cover for absences of permanent staff.

#### **6. Set up programmes to tackle gender segregation**

Programmes should be set up to tackle gender segregation in occupations where there is a particularly large gender imbalance, along the lines of initiatives such as those encouraging women into engineering and science. Sectors and occupations which might be included in such schemes could be construction, and professions such as surveying and architecture, which are very male dominated; and work in childcare, primary teaching, nursing, and secretarial jobs, which are very female dominated.

#### **7. Increase the numbers of women decision makers in business and economic development**

The Scottish Executive, the UK Government and the private sector all need to do more to encourage the appointment of more women to boards of private companies; and to encourage the appointment of more women to public bodies concerned with economic and industrial development.

## **Low pay, job segregation and unemployment**

**The issue:** women make up the majority of the workforce in sectors where low pay is prevalent such as retail and care work. For example, women make up around 80% of employees in both the bottom ten lowest paid manual and non-manual occupations, and 70% of those who benefited from the introduction of the national minimum wage in the UK were women. Low value is often attached to many areas of traditional women's work leading to low pay. Furthermore, the bulk of part-time work has tended to be available in areas of low paid employment – the combination of lack of childcare and choice for women compounding the job segregation in these areas of work. Women in low paid work are also more likely to move in and out of employment: the “low pay, no pay” cycle. Disabled women and minority ethnic women experience higher rates of unemployment.

As well as the segregation of male and female employees into different sectors of the economy, within sectors where women work beside men they are likely to be in lower paid occupations, and therefore encounter occupational segregation.

### **Objectives:**

- To decrease the proportion of women in low paid work
- To improve the distribution of women (and men) in employment across all sectors and occupations

### **Action Points:**

#### **1. Remove barriers to women pursuing particular careers**

Barriers to women pursuing particular careers range from straightforward unlawful practices (such as denying women work placements for spurious reasons and making them sit tests not required of men) to the more subtle pressures which influence attendance at school, subject choice at school and career choices, such as lack of confidence, peer pressure, and established societal expectations about gender roles. The EOC should consider conducting more investigations in order to tackle unlawful practices. Some parents keep their children, especially girls, off school in order to carry out adult responsibilities and this practice has to be more effectively discouraged by schools and any other agencies that come into contact with these families, such as social workers. The Scottish Executive Education Department should set up a short life working group for schools so that these gender

issues are not overshadowed by the understandable focus on boys' underachievement.

## **2. Encourage more women and men into non-traditional areas of work**

A range of bodies should develop actions to encourage more women and men into non-traditional areas of work and to ensure that job stereotyping is not reflected in modern apprenticeships and other training programmes. These bodies should include the Scottish Executive Education and Enterprise, Transport & Lifelong Learning Departments, Scottish Enterprise (SEnt), Highlands & Islands Enterprise (HIE), Jobcentre Plus, the New Deal and Welfare to Work Taskforces, employers' representatives, professional bodies and trade unions.

## **3. Carry out training audits**

The Scottish Executive Enterprise, Transport & Lifelong Learning Department (SEETLLD) should consider the usefulness of encouraging employers to carry out training audits.

## **4. Provide better in-work training opportunities**

Better in-work training opportunities should be provided for women in low paid low skilled jobs to enhance their job prospects. Research is required to show where this is already being done and how this can be taken forward. We suggest the SEETLLD working with SEnt, HIE, the Confederation of British Industry (CBI), the Federation of Small Business (FSB) and STUC should come together to showcase good practice in this area.

## **5. Extend mentoring schemes**

The SEETLLD should consider extending existing mentoring schemes for women starting up their own businesses to women in other types of work.

## **6. Develop public sector strategies on equal and low pay**

Local authorities, NHS Scotland and other public sector employers should consider specific strategies to tackle the concentration of women in the lowest paid areas of work and to ensure equal pay for work of equal value.

## **7. Provide careers guidance and advice for older women**

The SEETLLD should ensure that Careers Scotland can cater for the needs of women who want to enter training or employment later in life and for women living in rural areas where job and training opportunities may be more limited.

## **Promoting diversity in the workplace**

**The issue:** There are legal, moral and business cases for promoting diversity in the workplace, but too many employers are still ignoring them. Many employers are assuming that because women are now qualifying for and entering more professions that this will automatically mean that the senior levels of those professions will in time become more diverse. This assumption may mean that they fail to tackle institutional discrimination that is preventing and will prevent this from happening. For many employers legislation on sex, race, disability discrimination, flexible working and maternity and paternity leave are still perceived to be a regulatory burden. Small and medium sized enterprises (SMEs) find it particularly hard to identify labour to cover for absences and meet the financial cost of dealing with absences for both leave or training. Some companies can demonstrate a strong case that good employment practice and policies such as good work/life balance policies, for example, make a difference to the bottom line.

**Objective:** to increase the number of companies/employers in Scotland who promote diversity in the workplace through recruiting a workforce that reflects the population, and which ensures equal opportunities in promotion.

### **Action Points:**

#### **1. Make the business case for diversity**

All Scottish Executive departments, the EOC and other agencies with contact with employers, including the Enterprise Networks and employers' organisations such as the CBI and FSB, should inform employers at every opportunity about the business case for encouraging diversity at work, as well as the moral and legal case for doing so. The diversity case, which argues that if your customers are diverse you will benefit from being diverse too, should be promoted. Recent research that suggests that employees are increasingly attracted to companies because of their ethos should be disseminated. The benefits of different leadership styles should be promoted, for example, the multi-tasking skills acquired by mothers.

#### **2. Consider providing subsidies and incentives for SMEs**

The Scottish Executive should raise with the UK government the need for greater state subsidies to help employers to meet the

costs of maternity and paternity leave, as is done in some other EU countries. The Scottish Parliament and Executive should explore powers within their scope to offer more incentives for SMEs to assist them meet regulatory requirements, for example, schemes to support temporary labour to cover flexible working, maternity etc. The Scottish Executive's Enterprise, Transport & Lifelong Learning Department should commission research into how other countries are already taking such partnership arrangements with business forward.

### **3. Promote the benefits of flexible working opportunities**

The Scottish Executive should undertake research on the costs and benefits of flexible working opportunities for large companies and SMEs, as anecdotal evidence suggests that it increases efficiency. The overall working culture needs to change to allow both women and men to carry out other responsibilities and pursue other interests.

### **4. Develop good practice on flexible working in the public sector**

More work is needed with the public sector to promote the better application of flexible working and policies to improve work-life balance and to ensure that the future pool of employees does not shrink as the Scottish population ages. The Scottish Executive, together with COSLA and the STUC, EOC and other equality bodies should bring forward examples of positive practice and recommendations.

### **5. Link the promotion of gender equality to forthcoming legislation on age discrimination**

Employers need to promote age diversity in their workforces in order to prepare for changes in legislation in 2006 regarding age discrimination and to cope with demographic trends.

### **6. Link the promotion of gender equality to the Fresh Talent initiative**

The changing demography of Scotland indicates an ageing and declining population. In response to this the Scottish Executive has launched an initiative called "Fresh Talent" to attract people to Scotland. The need to engage the talent of women fully in the economy should be part of this initiative.

## CHILDCARE

**The issue:** although men are now more involved in childcare than they were previously, the division of labour between men and women in childcare remains very unequal. This unequal division of labour, which means that women continue to carry out most unpaid caring work, is a key factor contributing to women's disadvantaged position at work in terms of promotion and pay. Childcare provision is therefore a crucial factor in reducing gender inequality. Furthermore child-caring and childcare work continue to be undervalued. The traditional assumption that it was women's role to carry out unpaid caring work while it was men's role to be bread-winners, continues to influence attitudes to valuing childcare work. Cultural attitudes in Britain have often limited opportunities for parents and children to enjoy recreation and social time together, in contrast to many other European countries, and cultural change is required to make Scotland a more child-friendly society.

While improvements in the availability of childcare, such as the provision of free part-time pre-school places for every 3 and 4 year old whose parents wish this and extra funding for the development of childcare in some disadvantaged areas, are very welcome, not all needs are currently met, and further improvements are required. There is insufficient flexibility in the system of provision to meet the needs of parents who work out of normal working hours, whose working patterns are not traditional, whose hours cannot be adjusted easily, and/or who require support in the event of childcare arrangements falling through. Parents – mainly mothers – on traditional working patterns have difficulty in finding childcare during school holidays and often have to use holiday entitlement or take sick leave to fill the gap.

There are particular issues for women with disabled children in finding accessible, affordable and available childcare. And there are particular issues for lone parents. For example, childcare may be available for lone parents or women with disabilities whilst on a further education (FE) or higher education (HE) course but not available when they come to look for a job if their children are older than 4 years. In general policies should aim to make it easier for lone parents to work by improving cross cutting problems such as childcare and transport, and by not removing childcare when a parent moves from education or training to work. The balance

between allowing parents to choose whether to work or not and forcing them to work should be reassessed. Current policies are not flexible enough to support lone parents who want to look after their children themselves.

There are particular difficulties also for women in rural areas, where formal childcare provision may be very limited or not viable, yet relatives, friends and neighbours who provide childcare cannot be funded through the system of child tax credit benefits.

**Objectives:**

- Provision should meet the requirements of parents in terms of quality, affordability, and flexibility. Childcare should be available for all parents who wish it, in such a way that it enables women to take up the work and education opportunities that they aspire to, and provides good quality care for children to ensure long term benefits to them and to society in general.
- The value of unpaid childcare should receive proper recognition, and childcare workers should be better paid. Unpaid childcare should be shared fairly between men and women.

## **Action points:**

### **1. Increase provision and set targets on childcare**

Provision should be increased generally by the Scottish Executive and local authorities, both in terms of the numbers of children who can be given places, and in terms of hours of provision. Building on the success of the provision of part-time nursery places for 3 and 4 year olds, specific targets should be set for increasing provision for both pre-school and school age children. Provision should be sensitive to the needs of specific groups, such as those of rural communities, and minority ethnic communities.

### **2. Improve funding mechanisms**

Funding mechanisms that support sustainable childcare should be further developed by the Scottish Executive, for example for after-school provision (where better use should be made of school premises); for communities where a culture of use of formal childcare provision is not well established; and to enable women to make transitions from training to work, or to continue in work when children move from pre-school provision to school.

### **3. Develop community based childcare and pilot projects**

More community based provision should be developed by the Scottish Executive, local authorities and the voluntary sector, including better use of existing school premises and purpose built childcare centres, which co-ordinate a range of forms of childcare to provide flexibility for parents, and which support parental involvement. A number of pilot projects of community based childcare provision should be set up targeting particular groups e.g. deprived urban communities, rural communities, minority ethnic communities.

### **4. Support childcare through social economy initiatives**

Women organising childcare in communities and childcare organisations may be assisted by initiatives which seek to grow the social economy. The Scottish Executive should consider how work around the social economy can be harnessed to address some of the issues faced by women and childcare organisations. For example, it is difficult for community based childcare organisations to move from SIP (Social Inclusion Partnership) funding to independence. They spend too much time chasing alternative funding and lottery money, and if their efforts are to no avail it is not only extremely discouraging to those community activists, but is also damaging.

## **5. Encourage employer support for childcare**

Employers should be encouraged to provide support for working parents in a range of ways: flexible working arrangements; information about local childcare services; work place crèches.

## **6. Enhance the quality and value of the childcare workforce**

A key factor contributing to good quality childcare is the workforce. The Scottish Executive should aim to develop a childcare workforce that is well qualified, well trained and well paid. As a part of the strategy on Equal Pay, the pay and conditions of childcare workers in the public and private sector should be reviewed, and revalued in line with the job evaluation criteria of pay schemes such as the Single Status Agreement for local government.

## **7. Better liaison with UK Government**

There should be better liaison between UK Government Departments and Scottish interests to ensure that the impact of UK employment and benefits policies on lone parents takes full account of Scottish circumstances.

## **8. Value properly unpaid childcare work**

Childcare work should be recognised and valued in a number of ways. A value can be put on the unpaid childcare work carried out by women and men using the model of ONS data on Time Use and Household Satellite Accounts. While this value does not mean that any economic reward is available for such work, it is important in affording recognition to the contribution that childcare makes to the economy and to society, and that women in particular make in this way. The Scottish Executive should provide figures for Scotland based on this data.

## **9. Encourage fair shares in childcare**

Men should be encouraged to take on a fair share of care and policies advancing this should be put in place. This would include better paid paternity and parental leave, encouragement for men to take on flexible working arrangements, including career breaks, and part-time work, and to reduce their working hours. It would also include the encouragement of a more child-friendly environment where it is easier for either mothers or fathers to share leisure and social time with children outside the home. The Scottish Executive should examine its scope for action and develop an action plan and awareness raising campaign.

## **CARING (FOR OLDER PEOPLE AND PEOPLE WITH DISABILITIES) AND PERSONAL ASSISTANCE**

**The issue:** a greater share of providing unpaid care for older people and disabled adults requiring care falls on women than on men. Of the 600,000 carers in Scotland, 62% are women. Around half of all carers combine caring and employment, and many find it difficult to juggle work and unpaid care for ageing parents or other adult family members. Not only are the majority of unpaid carers women, but the majority of employees providing care for adults are women. As with childcare both unpaid and paid caring work requires to be appropriately valued.

Given women's greater longevity it is also the case that the majority of older or disabled adults who require care are women. As the proportion of older people in Scotland's population grows the issue of supporting the needs of carers and those being cared for will increase in significance. We welcome the Scottish Executive's commitment to improving the support available to carers and seeking the views of carers and care recipients and to increasing the amount of home care services provided to adults who live alone.

Disabled people do not necessarily want to rely on family members and/ or friends to meet their assistance needs. Indeed, the term 'care' is not always appropriate in that it has emotive connotations, when what is required is straightforward practical assistance. Opportunities for disabled people to exert control over their own lives, and over the nature of the support they receive in order to do this, are to be welcomed.

### **Objectives:**

- Professional support for relatives and friends providing informal care for adults should meet the requirements of both carers and care recipients and be provided in such a way that it enables women to take up the work, education and leisure opportunities to which they aspire.
- The value of unpaid care of adults should receive proper recognition, and care workers should be better paid. Unpaid care should be shared fairly between men and women.

## **Action points:**

### **1. Increase support for carers**

Provision should be increased generally by the Scottish Executive and local authorities, both in terms of the numbers of carers who receive professional help in caring for other adults, including respite care, and in terms of hours and quality of support. The momentum generated by the Scottish Executive's 'Strategy for Carers in Scotland' and the new rights for carers introduced by the Community Care and Health (Scotland) Act should continue. Provision should be sensitive to the needs of specific groups, such as those of rural communities, and minority ethnic communities.

### **2. Encourage employer support for caring responsibilities**

Employers should be encouraged to provide support for employees who provide care for other adults through flexible working arrangements and information about local carer support services.

### **3. Better liaison with UK Government**

There should be better liaison between the UK Government Departments and Scottish interests to ensure that the impact of UK employment and benefits policies on carers takes full account of Scottish circumstances.

### **4. Value properly unpaid care work**

As with childcare, unpaid care work for adult care recipients should be recognised and valued.

### **5. Ensure choice in caring and personal assistance**

Caring must also be a choice for carers and cared for parties. For example disabled people might prefer to employ personal assistants rather than rely on family members, as might family members, and policies should reflect this.

## **POVERTY AND EXCLUSION**

There are two aspects to be considered here:

- Poverty and Social Exclusion
- Difficulties in access to services, including in rural areas.

### **Poverty and social exclusion**

**The issue:** it is widely recognised that women are at greater risk of poverty than men, and are likely to remain in poverty for longer periods than men. Two groups particularly vulnerable to poverty, and which are predominantly made up of women, are lone parents (90% of lone parents are women) and pensioners. Women from minority ethnic communities and disabled women also experience higher levels of poverty and social exclusion. Only around a third of women with disabilities are economically active compared with around three-quarters of non-disabled women.

It is also widely recognised that women's disadvantaged position in the labour market, due to domestic and caring responsibilities (and having to meet the costs of those responsibilities) contributes to their poverty, both while of working age and when they are older, since interruptions to employment and low pay mean that they are unable to build up an adequate pension in retirement.

There also needs to be a recognition that poverty is not always area based, and that strategies that tackle deprivation in particular areas need to be complemented by strategies that provide support to particular groups of people. For example women on low incomes in rural areas may have very limited access to transport facilities, and this limits their capacity to undertake paid work, or to get access to services.

Women often play a significant role in regeneration in deprived communities, though this may not be adequately recognised in regeneration strategies in terms of women's access to decision-making bodies, or in the extent to which issues affecting women are prioritised.

**Objective:** To reduce women's share of poverty as part of the general reduction in poverty levels, through encouragement of more participation in the labour market, and adequate support for those unable to do so, or who are retired. This support should

include a minimum level of income, and good quality public services, which contribute to better levels of health and well-being.

### **Action points:**

In general the Scottish Executive should ensure that gender is effectively mainstreamed in its social inclusion strategies. In particular this should include the following:

#### **1. Report on gender awareness as part of social inclusion work**

There is a range of issues which affect women and men experiencing poverty. It is important however that measures taken to address these are gender sensitive, and where possible information about the respective positions of men and women should be collected. These include: maximisation of incomes through take-up of benefits; access to money advice and financial services such as credit unions; programmes for unemployed people; housing and the environment, and health impacts of these. When reporting on the progress on social inclusion, the Scottish Executive should ensure that a gender perspective is given. It is also important that the position of different groups of women should be reflected in reports e.g. minority ethnic women, disabled women, women in rural areas.

#### **2. Provide support for projects that are particularly beneficial to women**

There is a range of types of project from which women in particular are likely to benefit, and support for such projects should be ensured as part of the social inclusion strategy. This includes: childcare provision and support to parents and good quality recreational facilities for children and young people; women's training projects; women's enterprise projects; childcare training projects. In addition, there should be a particular focus on teenage girls from low income households, who often leave school with few qualifications and low aspirations. Projects should challenge gender stereotypes in employment.

#### **3. Ensure that women's voices are heard**

It is crucial to ensure that women's voices are heard in community regeneration projects and strategies and that their contribution is recognised. Consultation exercises by the Scottish Executive, Communities Scotland, local authorities and others should ensure

that issues for girls and women are separately identified from issues for boys and men, as well as those that affect people irrespective of gender. Decision-making bodies should likewise ensure that their membership includes women, that girls and women's voices are heard, and that their views have an impact on formation of local strategies. It is vital that in any dialogue, the specific needs of different groups of women are considered. To this end specific activities with women from ethnic minority communities, disabled women, lesbians, older women and women with different faiths should be developed.

#### **4. Raise awareness about the links between poverty and age**

Awareness about these issues, and particularly the link between poor pension provision and poverty, should be raised with the UK Government by the Scottish Executive.

## **Difficulties in access to services, including in rural areas**

**The issue:** not all women have problems in accessing public services and in some policy areas, such as free local off-peak bus travel for pensioners and disabled people, there have been welcome improvements. The issues concerning public services and gender inequalities or differences are not necessarily those of inequality of access per se. Indeed it is often claimed (with some justification, e.g. in relation to health) that women make more use of public services than do men. This is for a number of reasons: women are more reliant on public services in a number of respects e.g. women headed households are more likely to be in social housing, women use public transport more than men, women are more likely to be dependant on state benefits than men, and women are more likely to require social care when they are old and more women are disabled than men. Women also have contact with public services in taking care of their children e.g. childcare, education, health and leisure services.

However, women's more frequent use of services does not mean that these services are easily accessible physically or at times that are most convenient for working mothers for example, nor does it necessarily mean that women's needs are taken adequately into account. Location, timing, and childcare facilities are all factors that contribute to good quality services. Frequency, reliability and safety of public transport are very important to women because so many of them rely on public transport to get to work, visit family and friends and to access other services.

People living in rural areas experience particular difficulties in getting access to services. Almost a fifth of Scotland's population live in rural areas, and the majority of rural residents have to travel further to access services. For those on low incomes, or who have no or limited access to private cars, the problems of access are intensified.

Another important dimension of service provision is the attitudes of service providers. These should be non-judgemental, and should not stereotype users on the basis of gender, ethnicity, disability, sexual orientation, age or class, and should be sensitive to different religious and cultural requirements. Further important aspects of public services are representation on decision-making

bodies and consultation with users. Both aspects should ensure that women's voices are heard equally with men's.

**Objectives:**

- easily accessible and user friendly service provision that can meet the varying needs of different groups within the population and which is sensitive to difference and diversity, between and amongst women and men.
- Good pay and conditions, including flexible working, for public service workers.
- An equal share in decision-making and policy making in public services for women and men.

**Action points:**

**1. Review gender awareness in public services**

The Scottish Executive and local authorities should review to what extent strategic planning for public services takes account of these gender issues e.g. any evidence of consideration of gender differences in need, in barriers to access (particularly infrequency, unreliability and lack of direct public transport links), in usage, in target setting and data gathering, in decision-making, and in consultation. The particular problems experienced in rural areas should be taken into account.

## **2. Improve the position of women workers in public services**

Women are the majority of public service workers – many of them low paid and part-time. Improvements to women’s position as workers is likely to contribute to better quality service provision, and this should be a priority within the equal pay strategy. They should also be consulted by services providers for their views on how to improve services – they have been working at the sharp end for long enough to know what would make a difference.

## **3. Better use of community resources**

The Scottish Executive and local authorities should consider whether better use can be made of schools as community resource centres to deliver welfare services and provide information and increase the opportunities for women.

## **4. Fairness in resource allocation**

There is evidence of a need to ensure greater fairness in the allocation of resources, to meet rural needs and to address poverty and deprivation whether it exists in a hamlet or a housing scheme. The Scottish Executive should consider the feasibility of applying different policies/rules for registered childcare providers in different rural and urban areas so that grandparents and other relatives could be recognised childminders in areas where access to childcare is limited either because of remoteness, lack of public transport or lack of sufficient places, and discuss related taxation and benefits issues with the UK Government. The Scottish Executive should also consider whether more work should be carried out on assessing the different cost of providing services in rural and urban areas leading to a re-allocation of resources (as was done in the Arbuthnott report on resource allocation for health services). There is a particular need to recognise the relative deprivation of some areas and to note that Glasgow remains the most deprived of all areas.

## **VIOLENCE AND SAFETY**

**The issue:** in general women are less likely than men to be both the victims and perpetrators of crime, but there are two areas in which crime impacts particularly on women. The first is in the area of domestic abuse, where around 90% of police recorded incidents of domestic abuse involves abuse against females perpetrated by males, and 1 in 5 women experience domestic abuse during their lives. Domestic abuse is part of a spectrum of violence perpetrated by men against women and children, including rape and sexual assault, sexual harassment and child sexual abuse. Recognition of the gendered nature of the majority of domestic abuse, while not denying that it also occurs in other contexts, has been an important step in addressing the issue in Scotland. Disabled women, those from minority ethnic communities and those experiencing violence in same sex relationships have specific needs in relation to accessing support to deal with domestic abuse. Experiencing the abuse of their mother can also have devastating consequences for children and young people who require services in their own right. In households with children where domestic abuse has occurred, children are in the same or next room in 90% of incidents.

The second main concern for women, in particular girls, older women and minority ethnic women, is that they do not feel safe in their own environments, particularly when walking or using public transport in the evening. In 2000, 40% of women felt a bit or very unsafe when walking alone after dark, compared to only 14% of men. These 'fear of violence' issues, particularly fear of racial harassment, prevent some women from making full use of public services and accessing other amenities.

Since 1998, much effort has been put into raising awareness of violence by men against women and improving support for women and children who experience it by the Scottish Executive, local authorities, the police, voluntary organisations such as Women's Aid and Rape Crisis, and many others. The Scottish Executive, in conjunction with a range of partner organisations, is implementing the Action Plan in the National Strategy to Address Domestic Abuse in Scotland, and is pursuing actions to protect women from and prevent domestic abuse and other forms of violence. Work has also been done on improving community safety. We welcome this work and support its continued development.

**Objectives:**

- The eradication of domestic abuse and other forms of violence against women from Scottish society.
- For women to feel safer in their communities.

**Action Points:****1. Maintain momentum on tackling domestic abuse against women**

The excellent work that has been done by the Scottish Executive and its many partners to date on domestic abuse, the development into considering all aspects of violence against women, and the more recent work on improving community safety, including safety in the streets and on public transport, should continue. This partnership approach should be used in other areas, e.g. childcare. The three-year Action Plan of the National Strategy to Address Domestic Abuse in Scotland should be reviewed and consideration given to extending it, with its wider remit, for a further period.

**2. Consider needs of particular groups of women**

To ensure that the provision of support is available to women from minority ethnic communities, disabled women, older women, women in rural areas and those in same sex relationships, the Scottish Executive should consider whether the current work on domestic abuse and other forms of violence against women is addressing their needs.

**3. Tackle all hate crimes**

Assaults that are racially motivated or which incite religious hatred are treated as aggravated assaults; the Scottish Executive should consider extending this to assaults (and harassment) on the basis of the victim's gender, disability, age and sexual orientation.

## **INFLUENCE AND DECISION-MAKING**

**The issue:** overall women's representation in political and public life has been increasing in recent years, but progress remains slow and uneven. While women are now 39.5% of MSPs, they are only 15% of Scottish MPs at Westminster, and only 22% of councillors in Scotland. The Sex Discrimination (Election Candidates) Act 2002 allows political parties to adopt positive measures to improve the gender balance of candidates, but few have so far used it.<sup>6</sup> Women remain under-represented across many areas of public life. For example, they hold only 36% of public appointments made by Ministers, and remain under-represented in senior decision-making positions across a range of bodies.

**Objective:** equal representation of men and women in political institutions, in public bodies, in the judiciary, in decision-making in business, in trade unions, and in voluntary and civic organisations. Equal representation may be defined as 50:50, or following the Scandinavian model a situation where the proportion of either men or women on relevant bodies should not fall below 40%.

### **Action points:**

#### **1. Increase women's political representation**

Women's representation should be increased amongst Westminster MPs, MSPs, MEPs, and councillors. UK legislation has enabled political parties to take positive action measures to increase women's representation, and the steps being taken by parties should be monitored on a regular basis. Given that this is a matter for political parties, and not for government to enforce, this monitoring should be independent from government, and could be undertaken by the Women's Convention (as long as this does not jeopardise the charitable status of any women's organisation) and/or the EOC. Targets and timescales could be set by political parties for increasing representation, for example: 15% of Scottish MPs at Westminster are women – at the next election this should increase to at least 25%; and 50:50 representation should be aimed for in the next Scottish Parliament. Also targets should be set for minority ethnic women representatives.

---

<sup>6</sup> See EOC Annual Report 2002/3 for further details, at <http://www.eoc.org.uk/cseng/abouteoc/annualreport2003.pdf>

## **2. Ensure that reform of the electoral system for local government contributes to the increased representation of women**

The Scottish Executive has given a commitment to reform the electoral system for local government. Given the recent lack of improvement in the proportion of women elected, this should be a priority area for the Working Group on Local Government Reform which is looking at widening participation. The extent to which different electoral systems are likely to contribute to increases in women's representation should be reviewed and publicised as part of this process of reform. The review should take into account the experiences of other countries that have a higher level of women representatives.

## **3. Increase women's representation on public bodies**

New targets for the increase of women's representation in public bodies should be set by the Scottish Executive, both for members and chairs. As well as monitoring and reporting on progress of these, the Scottish Executive should take active steps to encourage women to apply for public appointments, through mechanisms such as seminars, targeting information about public appointments at women and women's organisations, and support for mentoring schemes. It should also review publicity materials, application forms and job descriptions, and recruitment procedures, to ensure that these do not act to discourage women from applying. It should conduct research on the barriers to women in applying for and obtaining public appointments, and should examine in particular the position of groups such as younger women, minority ethnic women, disabled women, and women from different social backgrounds.

## **4. Increase women's representation in the judiciary**

The number of women applying for and being appointed to the judiciary has increased significantly in the last decade, albeit from a very low base. Around 17% of sheriffs are women and 3 out of a total of 32 judges are women. The Judicial Appointments Board has been tasked with considering ways of recruiting judges and sheriffs who are as representative as possible of the communities they serve, whilst still adhering to the overriding principle of appointment on merit. The Scottish Executive should consider putting the Board on a statutory footing with a commitment to continue its work of encouraging a wider range of applicants. The legal profession should also work more actively to support the

many female entrants to the profession to move to senior positions.

#### **5. Increase women's representation in decision-making in business**

The Secretary of State for Trade and Industry in the UK government has taken steps recently to encourage diversity in the composition of non-executive directors on company boards. This should be actively encouraged in Scotland by the Scottish Executive, and data on the composition of the boards of top Scottish companies should be regularly collated and published.

#### **6. Increase women's representation in decision-making in trade unions, voluntary and civic organisations**

Trade unions, voluntary and civic organisations, should be encouraged to increase women's representation in decision making bodies where necessary. Research that would provide data on the current position, and which would identify examples of good practice, and form the basis for guidance would be most useful here, given that changes will rely on voluntary action.

#### **7. Continue Scottish Executive support for consultation with women**

The Scottish Executive should continue to support consultation mechanisms to compensate for under-representation, and to enable women to contribute their views to the policy making process. The Scottish Executive is already supporting a number of such mechanisms, of different degrees of formalisation. Adequate sustained support is necessary for consultation with women through the Convention, and through support to women's organisations who are contributing to the development of women's networks and to capacity building. The Scottish Civic Forum, also supported by the Scottish Executive, needs to account for how well it represents women's views and how much it addresses women's and gender issues, and should be invited to do so by the Scottish Executive.

## **SECTION THREE**

### **POLITICAL INSTITUTIONS AND POLICY APPROACHES**

An agenda for women in Scotland, or strategy for gender equality, requires to be advanced through the particular set of political institutions and policy machinery that currently exist in Scotland. There are a range of policy approaches that can be adopted or strengthened as a means of promoting gender equality. Because some of the key issues which women are concerned about are reserved to the UK Parliament, this means that there also need to be effective working relationships between the Scottish Executive and Whitehall departments. This section sets out what the key areas are and objectives that relate to those areas.

### **THE SCOTTISH PARLIAMENT**

#### **The Scottish Parliament**

The Scottish Parliament debated issues of concern to women on a number of occasions in its first session, most notably the issue of domestic abuse. The Group welcomes this, and hopes that women's issues will continue to be the subject of debates in the Parliament, including the report of the Group itself. The Group also recommends that gender should be mainstreamed throughout the business of the committees of the Scottish Parliament, and should not be the responsibility of the Equal Opportunities Committee alone. A mechanism should be put in place to ensure that monitoring of such mainstreaming is carried out.

#### ***Recommendations:***

- The Scottish Parliament is invited to debate the Group's report on key issues for the agenda for women in Scotland;
- The Scottish Parliament is invited to consider creating a mechanism to monitor the mainstreaming of gender issues in all committee business.

## **Equal Opportunities Committee**

The Equal Opportunities Committee is an important vehicle for promoting equality. It is generally felt that the committee was slow to get started and to determine its role. However towards the end of the first parliamentary session, it had grown in confidence and was becoming more effective. It has championed mainstreaming within the Parliament and has held the Scottish Executive to account on equality matters. Women's organisations have concerns that the focus on women has been limited although the gender stock take, review of research on gender inequality in Scotland, and the work on Gender and Best Value provided a focus latterly.

The Group recognises that the Equal Opportunities Committee's work should be supported and that women's organisations should be encouraged to engage with the committee. The Group hopes that the Committee will consider how it can more effectively address the needs of women and play its part in shaping and promoting the women's agenda.

### ***Recommendations:***

- We hope the Committee will give a higher profile to the issues of women's inequality and it should seek to engage with the relevant women's organisations that can provide evidence as appropriate to areas of policy development and legislation.
- The Committee is invited to take this report into account in drawing up its next workplan, including its work to mainstream equalities into the work of all of the other committees in the Parliament.

## **THE SCOTTISH EXECUTIVE: POLICY APPROACHES AND CONSULTATION WITH WOMEN**

### **Mainstreaming equality**

The Scottish Executive has committed itself to a mainstreaming approach to gender and other equality areas in its Equality Strategy, and has begun to put in place mechanisms for taking this forward. This includes training for Scottish Executive staff, improvements in data and research, consultation with various groups, mainstreaming pilots in particular policy areas, and work

on equality proofing budgets. But there is a lack of clarity about what mainstreaming means and how to measure success. In addition, since mainstreaming is a long-term strategy, it is necessary to ensure that mainstreaming initiatives are sustained.

The Group recognises that mainstreaming equality is a long-term process which requires substantial organisational shift and systemic change, and that it is therefore too early in the process to determine success. It is, however, having an effect on policy development, legislation and presentation of budget information, and can be seen, for example, as working through the equal opportunities provisions of schemes such as Community Planning, and Best Value.

### ***Recommendations:***

- All new policy development and draft legislation should consider the impact on men and women and different groups of men and women from the outset, and should seek to reduce gender inequalities. This should entail use of existing research or commissioning of new research as appropriate, consultation with groups likely to be affected by the policy, and the development of evaluation and monitoring systems as an integral part of policy development.
- Progress on mainstreaming needs to be kept under review and annually reported on, 'champions' who will promote mainstreaming within each department should be identified, information on mainstreaming should be included on the Scottish Executive website by the end of 2003, and mechanisms for measuring success should be developed by the end of 2004.

### **Monitoring, research and evaluation**

In the course of the Group's discussions reference has been made to briefings on relevant research<sup>7</sup>. This research underpins many of the recommendations in this report. This has made it clear that though there is a growing volume of research on women's and gender issues in Scotland, there remain many deficiencies, with little relevant research being available in certain key areas.

---

<sup>7</sup> See Breitenbach, Esther, **Summary and Discussion of Research Reviews on Women's and Gender Issues in Scotland.**

Furthermore where there is relevant research this has often not been reviewed or applied to policy making. Systems for evaluation of gender impacts are at an even less developed stage, and the existence of data that might be used for such evaluations is variable and patchy.

The Group recognises that improvements are occurring in the development of research and data on gender inequalities in Scotland<sup>8</sup>, but much more needs to be done to provide the evidence base and methods of evaluation required for an effective mainstreaming strategy.

### ***Recommendations:***

- A body of in-depth empirical research in Scotland is required which describes, analyses, and offers explanations for persisting gender inequalities, and which is applied to policy making as a matter of course. The development of systems of evaluation that provide assessments of gender impacts of policies, and which are integral to policy making, is also needed. This work should start now.
- By the end of 2004 all new projects should be properly monitored or evaluated and guidance on how to do this should be made available to project managers. Data collection should be standardised; key policy areas where mainstreaming can be more effectively developed by integrating gender analysis of data and research should be identified; and more effective strategies to disseminate the results of gender research to policy makers and others should be developed.
- All Scottish Executive Departments and other stakeholders should think through what their role should be in taking forward the recommendations listed in this report, and whether/what research would be required to facilitate them to do so.
- As a matter of course, there should regular reporting on all objectives listed in this report, and research and evaluation programmes should be put into place alongside practical initiatives. This should specifically include the following:

---

<sup>8</sup> For further information see Literature Review of Research on Gender Inequality in Scotland by Sue Innes, Centre for Research on Families and Relationships, University of Edinburgh, October 2002 at [http://www.scottish.parliament.uk/S1/official\\_report/cttee/equal-02/eor02-07-01.htm](http://www.scottish.parliament.uk/S1/official_report/cttee/equal-02/eor02-07-01.htm); Scottish Executive: [www.scotland.gov.uk/socialresearch](http://www.scotland.gov.uk/socialresearch); Equal Opportunities Commission: [www.eoc.org.uk](http://www.eoc.org.uk)

## **1. *Employment***

- Review evidence on the gender pay gap, and women's participation in the labour market, across the Scottish economy;
- Assess the impact of pay reviews;
- Collect data on the position of women in decision-making in business;
- Promote research identifying the benefits to business of diversity, and of flexible working arrangements.

## **2. *Childcare and other forms of caring***

- Calculate the value of unpaid caring, both of childcare and care for adults;
- Provide better data and research on demand for and usage of childcare, including evaluation separately of benefits for mothers and for fathers.

## **3. *Poverty and exclusion***

- Systematically incorporate evaluations of gender impacts of projects and initiatives into social inclusion policies;
- Review evidence of gender awareness in public service delivery.

## **4. *Violence and Safety***

- Assess whether work on domestic abuse and violence against women is addressing the specific needs of minority ethnic women, disabled women, and women in same sex relationships.

## **5. *Influence and decision-making***

- Promote research on women and decision-making across areas where data is currently limited, such as business, trade unions, voluntary and civic organisations, and research on models and approaches to capacity building.

## **Statutory duty requiring public bodies to promote gender equality**

The recent introduction of a statutory duty requiring public bodies to promote race equality, and provisions in Northern Ireland and Wales on the duty to promote equality, have aroused a lot of interest amongst women's organisations as an approach to the promotion of gender equality. A statutory duty is likely to be included in the new Disability Bill going before Westminster, and UK Government Ministers have said they will consider introducing a gender duty at some stage, though no appropriate legislative vehicle is yet in sight. A number of Acts passed in the first session of the Scottish Parliament have included clauses on the promotion of equality of opportunity, requiring that various services carry this out as a statutory duty, e.g. education, housing and local government.

As yet there is limited evidence of the impact of statutory duties<sup>9</sup>, and work therefore needs to be undertaken to evaluate whether a statutory duty is an effective means of change. Consideration should also be given to **how** a statutory duty on Scottish public bodies to promote gender equality could have the same catalytic effect as the Race Relations Amendment Act.

### ***Recommendations:***

- It is recommended that an assessment of the impact of statutory duties in promoting gender equality should be carried out, and that consideration should be given to how this policy approach may be applied in Scotland as part of an overall mainstreaming strategy.
- In addition evidence of the impact of the relevant equality clauses of legislation passed in the first session of the Scottish Parliament should be reported on regularly. If it is being found to be effective, an equality clause should be included in all Scottish Executive legislation.

---

<sup>9</sup> See Breitenbach, Esther. : **Statutory Duties to Promote Equal Opportunities and Evidence of their Impact.**

## **Awareness raising and campaigning about gender equality issues**

Many gender equality issues are not popularly perceived to be major problems, and the persistence of serious gender inequalities is not widely recognised. Many individual women remain unaware of their existing rights or how to enforce them. Campaigns, such as those on domestic abuse, are regarded as having been effective. Other campaigns on issues affecting women include those on the gender pay gap, and promoting age diversity in the workplace, though these have been lower profile. As yet there are no campaigns, other than the widely acclaimed anti-smoking campaign, addressed to teenage girls, and this is a gap that needs to be filled. The Group considers that such awareness raising campaigns are an important part of the process of setting a women's agenda.

### ***Recommendations:***

- The Scottish Executive should raise the profile of women's inequality and the issues facing women through a campaign, such as those run on domestic abuse and anti-racism. In particular there is a need to dispel the myth that women have achieved equality and there is little left to address. Any campaign should include the strategy set out in this report and key forthcoming events. Such awareness raising campaigns could include looking at the information which is given in schools and in particular should consider making information on employment rights and entitlements available.

### **Consultation with women**

The Group recognises that the Women in Scotland Consultative Forum (WISCF) has made an important contribution in identifying the range of organisations in Scotland with an active interest in women's issues, and that it provided a means of communication on policy issues between women's organisations and Ministers<sup>10</sup>. However, in the form which it existed it did not satisfy fully the desire of women's organisations for active engagement in discussion on policy issues. It is time to move forward, therefore, with the development of new mechanisms for consultation with

---

<sup>10</sup> See Breitenbach, Esther, Women in Scotland Consultative Forum.

women's organisations that can build an agenda on women's issues in Scotland.

***Recommendations:***

- The Scottish Executive should provide a vehicle for women's organisations in Scotland to come together to discuss issues, to provide a further channel for them to engage with the Scottish Executive, Scottish Parliament and other institutions; and to provide strategic input from women's organisations into policy development in order to mainstream key issues of importance to women in Scotland. The new Scottish Women's Convention should be looked to to take over most of the intended work of the WISCF; the Forum should live on as an annual meeting to celebrate International Women's Day. The Convention should provide a strategic input into policy development on particular topics. To do that it will need to be properly resourced and have access to and engagement with the relevant people in the Executive, Parliament and other decision-making organisations. We would invite the Women's Convention to consider this report.
- Local events and consultations involving the Executive, Parliament and women's organisations should continue, to allow discussion of issues that are of local rather than national importance.
- The Minister for Communities should enter into dialogue as soon as possible with the different women's interests and organisations working with other groups of which women are potentially members and explore in more detail the issues arising from multiple identity and/or compound discrimination. This report could serve as a basis for that dialogue but the Scottish Executive should be open to broadening the agenda if required to encompass the different perspectives which must be reflected.

# RELATIONS BETWEEN THE SCOTTISH EXECUTIVE AND THE UK GOVERNMENT

## Relations between the Scottish Executive and the UK Government

The responsibility for many of the key issues and policy areas which impinge on the daily lives of women are **devolved** to the Scottish Parliament e.g. housing, education, health, transport, economic development, local government, crime and the justice system. This is why developing an effective women's agenda in Scotland is so important.

However, a number of the key levers of influence in women's lives are **reserved** to the UK Parliament at Westminster e.g. employment and equality legislation, tax, benefits, pensions policy and minimum wage levels. In each of these areas there may be issues that are specific to Scotland or at the very least ways in which information about and application of these measures will vary in the Scottish context. Problems can also arise when both devolved and reserved responsibilities have a role to play in addressing broad policy areas or are involved in delivering programmes, such as the New Deal programmes. Social security policy underpins or in other ways touches on many devolved areas, including housing and community care. As such establishing and maintaining a strong relationship between Scotland and Westminster is crucial if we are to be assured of delivering fully for women in Scotland.

Prior to the recent creation of a Department of Constitutional Affairs in the UK government, the Scotland Office provided the interface between the Scottish Executive and Westminster and had a responsibility to ensure that Scottish interests are assured in decisions at Westminster. Whilst in some areas there has been a willingness to take a proactive approach to promoting the equal opportunities agenda in Scotland on reserved matters, e.g. equal pay, the proposed single equality body and the changes around Article 13 and the Employment Directives, (EU legislation affecting equal opportunities), in other areas there has been little evidence of proactive work. Anecdotal evidence suggests that the Scottish position has not always been effectively explained, or taken into account. We hope that the new arrangements will provide for a

more effective working relationship between the Scottish Executive and the UK government on matters of concern to women.

The UK government has recently conducted a consultation on the possible creation of a Single Equality Body to replace the existing Equal Opportunities Commission, Commission for Racial Equality, and Disability Rights Commission, and to take on responsibilities for new areas of equality legislation on sexual orientation, religion, and age. It is widely anticipated that the government will make this change. In the event of the creation of a Single Equality Body, the Group strongly recommends that the Scottish Executive should make a full and convincing case for devolving as much authority to Scotland as possible within this new structure, and that it should be resourced appropriately.

***Recommendations:***

- The relevant government departments should be invited to take a more proactive role in promoting UK policies in the Scottish context and in working collaboratively with the Scottish Executive where these dovetail with Executive activities more generally.
- The Scottish Executive has an important role to play in ensuring that the views of women in Scotland are reflected at a UK and European level through the appropriate government machinery, and should consult with the Equal Opportunities Committee as part of this process.
- The Scottish Executive should provide better information on gender issues on its website and provide links to the Women and Equality Unit, and other departments in Whitehall.
- The Scottish Executive should make a strong case for as much devolution of authority as possible to Scotland within the structure of a Single Equality Body, and for adequate resourcing of this.

## **Division of devolved and reserved matters**

The table below outlines the division of responsibilities between matters devolved to the Scottish Parliament and matters reserved to the UK Parliament, with respect to the key areas listed in Section Two.

<b>Policy issue</b>	<b>Devolved</b>	<b>Reserved</b>
Equal pay	Encouragement and promotion of equal opportunities including activity around equal pay. The Scottish Parliament can impose a duty on Scottish public bodies (such as local authorities) to carry out equal pay reviews.	legislation on employment and equal opportunities (including equal pay)
Low pay, job segregation, unemployment	education, training and lifelong learning; encouraging equal opportunities	employment legislation, fiscal policy, minimum wage legislation and equal opportunities legislation
Promoting diversity in the workplace	education, training and lifelong learning, childcare; encouraging equal opportunities	benefits, employment legislation and equal opportunities legislation
Childcare	education, training and lifelong learning, childcare; encouraging equal opportunities	benefits, employment legislation and equal opportunities legislation
Caring (for older people and people with disabilities) and personal assistance	education, training and lifelong learning, care for adults and disabled people; personal assistance; encouraging equal opportunities	benefits, employment legislation and equal opportunities legislation

Poverty and social exclusion	education, training and lifelong learning, childcare, economic regeneration, health, local government; encouraging equal opportunities	taxation, pensions, benefits, national minimum wage, employment and equal opportunities legislation
Access to services, including in rural areas	provision of most services; encouraging equal opportunities	not applicable
Violence and safety	criminal and civil law, criminal justice and civil law systems, provision of services to victims, social work, planning , policing and education; encouraging equal opportunities	not applicable
Influence and decision-making	appointments process for most Scottish appointments; encouraging equal opportunities	regulation of political parties

## **CONCLUSION**

We hope and trust that this report will be considered and discussed by women's organisations and also taken into account by all those whose responsibilities affect the lives of women

We acknowledged at the outset that women are not all the same. Whilst we have attempted to identify the areas of common concern and the key issues of relevance to most women, we are clear that the experiences and needs of some groups of women may require different strategies and approaches. There may be different priorities for disabled women, women from minority ethnic communities, older women, lesbians or women of different faiths. We have not attempted to describe what these might be because we believe that this should be the subject of specific dialogue and consultation with the relevant groups of women.

We therefore recommend that the Minister enter into dialogue as soon as possible with the different women's interests and explore in more detail the issues arising from multiple identity and/or compound discrimination. We recommend that this report serves as a basis for that dialogue but that the Scottish Executive is open to broadening the agenda if required to encompass the different perspectives which must be reflected.

We are grateful for the opportunity that has been presented with the formation of this short life group to contribute to the development of work to improve the lives of women in Scotland. We hope that our deliberations have been helpful in this regard.

## SUMMARY OF ACTION POINT RECOMMENDATIONS

The table below summarises the action points made in Section Two on key policy issues to be addressed, and in Section Three on political institutions and policy approaches.

### Action points:

- the steps that will help us to reach the objective
- these are categorised as either immediate, medium-term or long-term actions. We think that these categories of action points can be delivered in the following time-scales:
  - **(I) Immediate** – action to start now and to be substantially delivered by the end of 2004 if not sooner;
  - **(M) Medium-term** – action to start now and to be substantially delivered by April 2007 (the end of the term of the current Scottish Executive and Scottish Parliament); and
  - **(L) Long-term** – action to start now, but recognition that the deep-rooted changes in attitudes and behaviours required means that realistically this action may take a decade or more to be achieved.

In the table below:

- The first column summarises the recommended action points – full descriptions of these points are in Sections Two and Three;
- The second column lists who, as a minimum, should be involved in delivering the action point; and
- The third column categorises the action point as either an immediate, medium-term or long-term actions

Please see the Appendix on Acronyms for explanations of the acronyms used in the following table

Action	Involving	I, M or L
<b>POLICY ISSUES</b>		
<b>Equal pay</b>		
Developing a strategic plan	SE to lead, but work with WEU, DTI, EOC, employers and unions	I
1. Setting a target	ditto	I- L
2. Prioritising sectors for action on equal pay	ditto	I - L
3. Pay reviews	All employers to carry them out; SEED, SEETLLD, EOC, unions, share holders and general public to apply pressure to ensure they are done	M
4. Public sector procurement policies	SEED, all Scottish public sector bodies	M
5. Flexible working arrangements	SEED, SEETLLD, DTI, DWP, EOC, Fair Play, all employers	L
6. Programmes to tackle gender segregation	SEED, SEETLLD, Enterprise Networks, sectoral employers & professional bodies; schools, FE and HE institutions	L
7. Women decision makers in business and economic development	SE Public Bodies Unit; new Commissioner for Public Appointments in Scotland, CBI, Institute of Directors, boards of private companies	L
<b>Low pay, job segregation and unemployment</b>		
1. Remove barriers to women pursuing particular careers.	All employers, EOC; SEED, schools and FE and HE institutions	I - L
2. Encourage more women and men into non-traditional areas of work	SEED, SEETLLD, Enterprise Networks, schools and FE and HE institutions, Jobcentre Plus	L
3. Training audits	SEETLLD, Employers	M
4. In work training opportunities	Employers, Enterprise Networks, CBI, FSB, STUC and SEETLLD	I

5. Mentoring for business start-ups	SEETLLD, STUC, employer representatives	I
6. Public sector strategies on pay	Local authorities, NHSScotland, other public sector employers	M
7. Careers guidance and advice	SEETLLD, Careers Scotland	I
<b>Promoting diversity in the workplace</b>		
1. Make the business case for diversity	SEETLLD, Enterprise Networks, DTI, DWP, EOC	I
2. Subsidies and incentives for SMEs	SEETLLD, Scotland Office, DTI	I
3. Benefits of flexible working opportunities	DTI, DWP, SEETLLD, Fair Play, EOC	M - L
4. Flexible working in the public sector	SE, EOC, COSLA, STUC	M
5. Link to forthcoming legislation on age discrimination	DTI, DWP, SEED, SEETLLD, STUC, employers representatives, employers	I
6. Link to Fresh Talent initiative	SEFCSD	I
<b>Childcare</b>		
1. Increasing provision and setting targets on childcare	SEED; local authorities	M
2. Improved funding mechanisms for childcare	SEED; local authorities	M
3. Community based childcare and pilot projects	SEED; Communities Scotland; local authorities	M
4. Social Economy childcare initiatives	SEED, Communities Scotland; SEETLLD	I
5. Encouragement of employer support for childcare	SEED, SEETLLD, STUC, employers representatives, employers	M

6. Enhancing the quality and value of the workforce	SEED, SEETLLD local authorities, employers	M
7. Liaison with UK Government	SE, DTI, DWP, HMT	I
8. Properly valuing unpaid childcare work	SEED, EOC	M
9. Encourage fair shares in childcare	SEED, SEETLLD, SEED, DTI, DWP, EOC, Fair Play	L
<b>Caring (for older people and people with disabilities) and personal assistance</b>		
1. Increasing support for carers	SEED, local authorities	M
2. Encouragement of employer support for caring responsibilities	SEED, EOC, Fair Play, employers representatives	I - M
3. Liaison with UK Government	SEED, DWP, HMT	I
4. Properly valuing unpaid carer work	SEED, local authorities	M
5. Ensure choice in provision and receipt of care or assistance	SEED, local authorities, other care providers	M
<b>Poverty and social exclusion</b>		
1. Report on gender awareness as part of Social Inclusion Work	SEDD in the lead, all other SE Departments	M
2. Provide support for projects that are beneficial to women	SEDD in the lead, all other SE Departments	I - M
3. Ensure that women's voices are heard	All SE Departments, Communities Scotland, local authorities, other decision-making bodies	I - M
4. Raise awareness about the links between poverty and age	DWP, SEDD	I

<b>Difficulties in access to services, including in rural areas</b>		
1. Review gender awareness in public services	All SE Departments, local authorities, all public service providers	I - M
2. Improve the position of women workers in public services	All service providers	M
3. Using Community Resources	SEED and local authorities	I
4. Resource Allocation	SEFCSD in lead, all SE Departments	M
<b>Violence and safety</b>		
1. Maintain momentum	SEJD and partners in National Strategy to Address Domestic Abuse in Scotland	I
2. Consider needs of particular groups of women	SEJD	I
3. Tackle all hate crimes	SEJD	M
<b>Influence and decision-making</b>		
1. Political representation	Political parties, women's organisations	I - L
2. Reform of the electoral system for local government	SEFCSD, local authorities	M
3. Public bodies	SE Public Bodies Unit in lead	I - M
4. The judiciary	SEJD, Judicial Appointments Board	M
5. Business	DTI, SEETLLD, Institute of Directors	L
6. Trade unions, voluntary and civic organisations	STUC, SCVO, Scottish Leadership Foundation, Scottish Civic Forum and their liaison SE Departments	I
7. Scottish Executive support for consultation with women	SEDD, women's organisations, Scottish Civic Forum	I

<b>POLITICAL INSTITUTIONS AND POLICY APPROACHES</b>		
<b>The Scottish Parliament</b>		
1. Debate on the Group's report	Scottish Parliament	I
2. Creation of a mechanism to monitor the mainstreaming of gender issues in all committee business.	Scottish Parliament	I
<b>Equal Opportunities Committee</b>		
1. Give a higher profile to the issues of women's inequality and seek to engage with the relevant women's organisations.	Equal Opportunities Committee, women's organisations	I
2. Take this report into account in drawing up its next workplan, including its work to mainstream equalities into the work of all of the other committees in the Parliament.	Equal Opportunities Committee, all other Parliament Committees	I
<b>The Scottish Executive: Mainstreaming equality</b>		
1. Consider the impact on men and women and different groups of men and women from the outset in all new policy development and draft legislation.	All SE Departments	M
2. Annual reporting on progress on mainstreaming, identification of 'champions' to promote mainstreaming, including information on mainstreaming on the Scottish Executive website by the end of 2003, and developing mechanisms for measuring success by the end of 2004	SE Equality Unit to lead, all SE Departments	I

<b>Monitoring, research and evaluation</b>		
1. Development of a body of in-depth empirical research in Scotland and development of systems of evaluation that provide assessments of gender impacts of policies.	SECRU, all SE Departments, other research commissioning bodies	I
2. Monitoring and evaluation of all new projects; standardisation of data collection, better integration of gender analysis of data and research into policies and more effective dissemination strategies for gender research.	SE Equality Unit, SECRU, All SE Departments	I
3. Think through what their role should be in taking forward the recommendations listed in this report, and whether/what research would be required to facilitate them to do so, including:	All SE Departments and other stakeholders	I
4. Regular reporting on all objectives listed in report, and putting in place research and evaluation programmes	SE Departments, SECRU	I-L
5. Review evidence of gender pay gap	SEDD, SEETLLD, SECRU	I-L
6. Assess impact of pay reviews	SEDD, SEETLLD, SECRU	I-L
7. Collect data on position of women in decision-making in business	SEETLLD, SECRU, Enterprise Networks	I-L
8. Promote research on the business case on for diversity and flexible working	SEETLLD, SECRU	I-M
9. Calculate value of unpaid care	SECRU	I
10. Provide better data on demand for and usage of childcare	SEED, and local authorities	I-L

11. Evaluate gender impacts of social inclusion policies	SEDD, SECRU	I-L
12. Review gender awareness of public service delivery	All relevant departments	I-M
13. Assess how work on domestic violence meets needs of specific groups	SEJD, SECRU	I-M
14. Promote research on women and decision-making	SEDD, SEETLLD, SECRU, SEnt, CBI, STUC, SCVO	I-L
<b>Statutory duty requiring public bodies to promote gender equality</b>		
1. Assess the impact of statutory duties in promoting gender equality and consider how this policy approach may be applied in Scotland as part of an overall mainstreaming strategy	SE Equality Unit	M
2. Report on the impact of the relevant equality clauses of legislation passed in the first session of the Scottish Parliament. If it is being found to be effective, an equality clause should be included in all Scottish Executive legislation.	All relevant SE Departments	M

<b>Awareness raising and campaigning about gender equality issues</b>		
1. Raise the profile of women's inequality and the issues facing women through a campaign, such as those run on domestic abuse and anti-racism.	All relevant SE Departments	M
<b>Consultation with women</b>		
1. Proper resourcing for and access to and engagement with the relevant people in the Executive, Parliament and other decision-making organisations for the new Women's Convention. The Women's Convention should be invited to consider this report.	SE Equality Unit, all SE Departments, Scottish Parliament, other decision-making bodies, the Women's Convention, women's organisations	I
2. Local events and consultations involving the Executive, Parliament and women's organisations.	SE Equality Unit, all SE Departments, Scottish Parliament, women's organisations	I
3. The Minister for Communities should enter into dialogue as soon as possible with the different women's interests and organisations working with other groups of which women are potentially members and explore in more detail the issues arising from multiple identity and/or compound discrimination.	Minister for Communities, women's organisations	I

<b>Relations between the Scottish Executive and the UK Government</b>		
1. More proactive role in promoting UK policies in the Scottish context and better collaborative working between the Scottish Executive and UK Government Departments	All relevant SE and UK Government Departments	I
2. Ensuring that the views of women in Scotland are reflected at a UK and European level through the appropriate government machinery, and should consult with the Equal Opportunities Committee as part of this process.	All relevant SE and UK Government Departments, EU institutions	I
3. Better information on gender issues on the Scottish Executive website	SE Equality Unit	I
4. Ensure that as much authority as possible is devolved within the structure of a new Single Equality Body	SE Equality Unit, Scottish equality bodies	I

## **BIOGRAPHICAL DETAILS OF GROUP MEMBERS**

### **Professor Joan Stringer, Convenor**

Professor Joan Stringer is the Principal and Vice-Chancellor of Napier University and a former Equal Opportunities Commissioner. Joan also chaired the group establishing the Single Equality Commission in Northern Ireland. Her other public appointments have included membership of the Consultative Steering Group on the Scottish Parliament and membership of the Scottish Committee of the National (UK) Committee of Inquiry into Higher Education (Dearing Committee). Joan's career in higher education began in 1978 when she tutored part-time while studying for a PhD in Politics. In 1980, Professor Stringer moved to Aberdeen where she lectured and researched politics and public administration at the Robert Gordon University. She became Head of School in Public Administration and Law in 1988 and was appointed Assistant Principal in 1991. In 1996, Joan was appointed Principal and Vice Patron of Queen Margaret University College in Edinburgh. Joan's career in higher education has been characterised by a strong commitment to equality of access to higher education and she regularly speaks and writes on equality and diversity issues.

### **Rowena Arshad**

Rowena Arshad is the Director for the Centre for Education for Racial Equality in Scotland and Senior Lecturer within the University of Edinburgh. She was appointed Commissioner for the Equal Opportunities Commission in 2001. She is currently also on the Boards of the Scottish Higher Education Funding Council, Edinburgh Telford's College and Her Majesty's Inspectorate of Education. Previously she was a member of the Independent Committee on Student Finance (Cubie Committee), Working Group on Guidelines in Sex Education (Repeal 2A) and the Race Equality Advisory Forum set up by the Scottish Executive. Currently, she chairs the Scottish Executive Widening Access to Council Membership Progress Group. Rowena is community education trained, gaining her first post-school qualification as a mature student. She worked in the voluntary sector prior to joining higher education. She was instrumental in starting the after school club in the primary school her children attended and in the setting of LinkNet Mentoring Initiative which provides a mentoring service

to members of the Edinburgh, Lothian and Fife communities. Rowena was also very active in the STUC Black Workers' Committee and was a member of the STUC General Council for many years. Her main concern is in the area of recognising multiple discriminations whether as a service provider, an educator or member of society.

### **Maria Fyfe**

Was MP for Glasgow Maryhill 1987 - 2001, retired. UK Opposition spokesperson on Women. On Scottish shadow team as spokesperson on Women, Education and Health. Chaired Scottish all-party group on children. Chaired Labour backbench committee on international development. Convenor of the Women's Issues Group on Scottish Constitutional Convention. Campaigned for 50:50 representation in Scottish Parliament and family-friendly hours.

Glasgow District Councillor 1980 - 1987, vice-chair Finance Committee 1980 - 1984, chair Personnel Committee 1984 - 1987. Won support for creation of Equal Opportunities Committee, and was involved in numerous reforms affecting women at local and national level.

Degree in Economic History from Strathclyde University as mature student. Senior lecturer in trade union studies 1976 - 1987, encouraging involvement of women in trade unions. Campaigner for equal pay. Honorary doctorate from Glasgow University in 2002 for her work for women's rights.

### **Barbara Kelly CBE DL LLD**

Barbara Kelly holds a number of senior public appointments and her main interests lie in consumer affairs, women's issues and in rural and environmental matters. A major part of her life has been home based as a partner in a mixed farming enterprise. She is not afraid of challenge and is a former Chairman of the Scottish Consumer Council, Equal Opportunities Commissioner for Scotland and most recently, Chairwoman of the UK Architects Registration Board. Presently a member of the BPplc Scottish Board and of the Royal Mail Board in Scotland, she has recently become a Trustee of the Royal Botanic Garden Edinburgh and of the Robertson Trust. She is Convenor of the Millennium Forest for

Scotland Trust. She was the first woman Director of the Clydesdale Bank, a founder director of Scottish Enterprise and a main Board member of Scottish Natural Heritage.

Made CBE in 1993, and a Deputy Lieutenant of Dumfriesshire in 1998, she holds Honorary Doctorates from the Universities of Strathclyde 1995, Aberdeen 1997 and Glasgow 2002.

### **Jane McKay**

Currently holds the women's seat on the General Council of the TGWU and a member of the TUC General Council and TUC Women's Committee. Chair of both the Scottish and UK National Women's Committees of the TGWU for many years. Member of the general Council of the Scottish Trades Union Congress for 18 years serving on all its Committees. Chaired General Purposes Committee and the Economic and Employment Committee. President of the STUC in 1992.

Longstanding and active member of the STUC Women's Committee serving as its Chair on several occasions. Worked closely with communities and unions through employment in Glasgow Trades Council. Member of the Scottish Constitutional Convention, active supporter of 50:50 campaign for equal representation in the Scottish Parliament and other campaigns to support women's rights.

Worked on the organisation and provision of support to Chilean refugees in the 1970s. Established network of unemployed and community resources centres in Glasgow area and worked to support unemployed women. Former board member of West of Scotland water and Independent Assessor for public appointments.

### **Susan Rice**

Susan Rice, a Chartered Banker, became Chief Executive of Lloyds TSB Scotland in August 2000, the first woman to head a UK clearing bank. She worked previously at Bank of Scotland and NatWest Bancorp in New York. In her earlier career, she was a dean at both Yale and Colgate universities in America.

Susan is a non-executive director of Scottish and Southern Energy and chairs the Edinburgh International Book Festival. She also is a founding director of Charity Bank, chairs the Advisory Board of the Scottish Centre for Social Justice and is active in addressing issues of social and financial exclusion. She is a frequent speaker on the future of financial services, the Scottish economy, leadership, financial exclusion and corporate responsibility.

Her interest in the visual arts has led to several high profile arts sponsorships through the business, most notably the Rembrandt's Women exhibition at the Scottish National Gallery and Glasgow's Whistler Centenary exhibition.

Born and brought up in the United States, Susan has degrees from Wellesley, Aberdeen University in Scotland, and honorary doctorates from The Robert Gordon University and Edinburgh University. She is a Fellow of the Royal Society of Edinburgh.

### **Sally Witcher**

Sally Witcher is a freelance consultant, researcher and trainer to the voluntary and public sectors, with a particular focus on diversity and equal opportunity. She was appointed in August 2002 as the first Chair of a new Department for Work and Pension's (UK Government) advisory committee on disability employment policy (the Disability Employment Advisory Committee). She also advises the Scottish Executive Equality Unit on disability issues, EYDP, etc. She has considerable experience working in the fields of poverty, social security benefits, community care and campaigning.

Sally is a former Director of the Child Poverty Action Group (a UK-wide campaigning charity) and, prior to that, Campaign Worker for Disability Alliance. More recently she has worked with a range of Scottish and UK-wide organisations, including the Disability Rights Commission. She is a founder of Direct Payments Scotland and occasional columnist for Community Care magazine and lead author of Scottish Executive funded research into Direct Payments. Sally has extensive experience of participating in research advisory committees including the ESRC research programme on children and the Centre for Analysis of Social Exclusion at the London School of Economics. She is currently working on a phd thesis developing a generic theory of exclusion

and discrimination. Sally is a disabled person and lives in Edinburgh.

Lynne Main, member of the Wester Hailes Community Council, Scottish Social Inclusion Network and Community Planning Taskforce, was invited to be a member of the Group but was unable to participate due to unforeseen circumstances.

## APPENDIX OF ACRONYMS

CBI	Confederation of British Industry
DTI	Department of Trade and Industry (UK)
DWP	Department of Work and Pensions (UK)
EOC	Equal Opportunities Commission
EU	European Union
FE	further education
FSB	Federation of Small Businesses
HE	higher education
HIE	Highlands & Islands Enterprise
COSLA	Convention of Scottish Local Authorities
MP	Member of Parliament (the UK Parliament at Westminster)
MEP	Member of European Parliament
MSP	Member of Scottish Parliament
NDPB	Non-Departmental Public Body
ONS	Office of National Statistics
TUC	Trades Union Congress
SCVO	Scottish Council for Voluntary Organisations
SE	Scottish Executive
SECRU	Scottish Executive Central Research Unit
SEDD	Scottish Executive Development Department
SEED	Scottish Executive Education Department
SEETLLD	Scottish Executive Enterprise, Transport & Lifelong Learning Department
SEnt	Scottish Enterprise
SEFCSD	Scottish Executive Finance & Central Services Department
SEHD	Scottish Executive Health Department
SEJD	Scottish Executive Justice Department
SME	small and medium sized enterprise
STUC	Scottish Trades Union Congress
WEU	Women and Equality Unit (part of DTI)
WISCF	Women in Scotland Consultative Forum

The report can be viewed on the Scottish Executive website at

**[www.scotland.gov.uk](http://www.scotland.gov.uk) <http://www.scotland.gov.uk>.**

If you require this report in an alternative format please contact the Equality Unit at the address below:

Scottish Executive  
Equality Unit  
Area 2F South  
Victoria Quay  
Edinburgh  
EH6 6QQ

Tel: 0131 244 0095  
Fax: 0131 244 1824