

Careers Service Review Committee
Report

Contents

Foreword	Page 2
Executive Summary	Page 4
1. Introduction	Page 6
2. The Present Role and Organisation of the Careers Service	Page 8
3. The Case for Change	Page 11
4. Underlying Principles	Page 14
5. Transitions and Inclusive All-Age Careers Guidance	Page 17
6. Education for Work and Enterprise	Page 21
7. Goals and Critical Success Factors for Careers Scotland	Page 23
8. Social Inclusion and Equality of Opportunity	Page 31
9. Labour Market Information and the Vacancy Handling Role	Page 34
10. Information and Communication Technology	Page 37
11. Performance and Client Satisfaction	Page 39
12. Professionalism	Page 45
13. Funding	Page 48
14. Conclusion	Page 51
Summary of Recommendations	Page 52
<i>Annexes:</i>	
Annex One	Committee Membership
Annex Two	Key Issues considered by the Committee
Annex Three	Evidence Received
Annex Four	Invited to Give Evidence
Annex Five	Extract from the Trade Union Reform and Employment Rights Act (1993)

Foreward

On behalf of the Careers Service Review Committee I am very pleased to pass to you our report and recommendations for development of the current Careers Guidance arrangements. We are confident that implementation of our recommendations will ensure that careers guidance in Scotland will be impartial, informed, client centred, all age, confidential and coherent.

We have consulted widely, received much valuable input and have appreciated the level of co-operation we have received from Careers Service Companies and others who provide careers guidance. We have come across many examples of excellent work on which we have built while also listening to numerous suggestions for change and improvement.

As you anticipated in the terms of reference that you set us, there is scope for change and development of the role of the Careers Service in Scotland in the light of trends and initiatives in education, life long learning and the labour market. We believe that the recommendations we are making will ensure that careers guidance addresses the needs of individuals but will be set in the context of the changing economic and social environment.

Throughout the review our chief concern has been to ensure cohesion in transition planning and support from an early age through adulthood. The role we have identified for careers guidance services takes full account of the variability of learning and work transitions, people and organisational interactions, and also addresses the issue of social inclusion. We have sought a uniformity of purpose and of standards, equality of access, and a service to be delivered in a way which is responsive to individual needs and local circumstances, in the context of robust information about future labour markets and the needs of industry.

We have aimed to focus more on what should be delivered rather than on the institutional framework that should or could deliver our identified goals and critical success factors. We bumped into the confused institutional landscape at various stages in our discussions and, inevitably, have phrased some of our recommendations in the context of current structures. During the period of our review changes to the landscape were already in hand or under discussion, our vision of the way forward is not dependent on any particular institutional structure. We do however identify the need for a body we call Careers Scotland both to set standards and to be a national voice for careers guidance. More work needs to be done to scope the role and accountabilities of such a body and we recommend that that work should begin in the near future.

When the Committee started its work we were supported by Ian McGhee, Head of Transitions to Work Division, Colin Brown, Head of Careers Guidance and Education Business Links Branch and Ann Milović, Secretary to the Review Committee, who was a recent recruit into the Scottish Executive. Within weeks we lost Ian to early (and welcomed) retirement and, a few weeks after that, Colin transferred to another department within the Scottish Executive. The support and advice we had received from them ensured that the work of the committee was already well focused and we were all grateful for that. The Committee however asked that special mention should be made of the commitment and enthusiasm displayed by Ann who stayed with us throughout and was herself on a steep learning curve. She was always helpful, positive and cheerful.

On a personal note I would like to thank those who decided on the shape and membership of the committee. They brought together a group of individuals who had a wealth of experience in a number of fields combined with an ability to share their knowledge and experience in a way which, I am convinced, has enabled us to produce a report and recommendations which are as impartial and coherent as we believe careers guidance should be. I am very grateful to all members of the Committee for their support and commitment as well as, and we sometimes needed this, their sense of humour.

For myself I can, with confidence, say that chairing the committee has been an enjoyable example of lifelong learning!

Barbara Duffner
Chair

Executive Summary

The Careers Service Review Committee was given the remit "To examine the role of the Careers Service in Scotland, and the scope for change and development of that role in the light of trends and initiatives in education, lifelong learning, and the labour market."

The Committee met a total of 10 times over a nine-month period, and within their examination of the Careers Service, they had an extensive consultation exercise with Careers Service Companies and a wide range of stakeholders.

The report describes the current Careers Service in Scotland, and then makes the case for change. The Committee was keen to point out that many of their recommendations are in operation or being developed in one or more Careers Service Companies at present, but that the Committee wanted a uniformity of good practice and standards across Scotland.

The Committee outlined six underlying principles that they believed should underpin the provision of careers guidance in Scotland and should be synonymous with 'Careers Scotland'. Careers guidance should be impartial, informed, client-centred, confidential, available to all and coherent.

The Committee examined the trend towards later transitions and longer transition periods from secondary school to the world of work as well as the probability that individuals will have a number of transition points during their working life. In light of international research and the Scottish Executive's agendas for Lifelong Learning, Social Inclusion and Equality of Opportunity, the Committee recommended that the Careers Service become an inclusive all-age careers guidance service. It should have the responsibility to ensure that careers guidance is available for all groups of people, regardless of their age, but the Careers Service will not necessarily deliver careers guidance to everyone itself. As well, the Committee recommended that the Careers Service review its own access arrangements to better suit the client group, rather than provider ease. Furthermore, the Committee stressed the belief that careers guidance is best received when founded on a solid base of careers education.

The Committee outlined a set of goals for the delivery of careers guidance, and a set of critical success factors for an effective Careers Service in the future. They recommended that there should be effective, meaningful performance measures, national and professional standards, as well as public performance reporting as a way of strengthening careers guidance delivery. These critical success factors are more fully discussed in the sections on Performance and Client Satisfaction, Professionalism and Information and Communication Technology.

The Committee proposed that publicly funded careers guidance in Scotland should move towards a national service, with national marketing and a national brand (Careers Scotland), national standards and a number of services and functions provided nationally. At local level accountability for ensuring delivery of all age careers guidance would remain with the 17 Careers Service Companies. It proposed a working group to establish the national standards and arrangements necessary to deliver Careers Scotland.

The Committee concluded that the vacancy handling function, and the ‘benefits policing’ function, were incompatible with an effective and efficient careers guidance role, and recommended that the Scottish Executive open negotiations with the Department of Social Services, the Department for Education and Employment and the Employment Service over the distribution of these functions.

The Committee noted that effective and coherent careers guidance was inhibited by the ‘crowded institutional landscape’ of bodies responsible for Education for Work and Enterprise and intermediary bodies between education and the labour market. While a full solution was outside its remit, it recommended that in each area a forum (which might be the Careers Service Company) be responsible for developing a local plan for Education for Work and Enterprise and that at national level there should be closer integration between the numerous organisations involved in Education for Work and Enterprise.

In commenting or making recommendations on structure, the Committee members were very aware that work was already underway to review elements of the crowded landscape and emphasised that they were more concerned with outcomes than the process or structure for delivering these. There is more than one way to deliver the underlying principles, goals and critical success factors which are relevant irrespective of structure.

Finally, the Committee concluded that the funding for the Careers Service should be increased to allow it to ensure an all-age inclusive careers guidance service. Contracts for Careers Service Companies should not be re-awarded through competitive tender, but existing contracts should be renewed subject to performance. In addition, the Committee recommended a new funding formula for the Careers Service that takes account of local unemployment levels, degree of social exclusion, population dispersal, level of academic achievement and ‘Non Permanent’ resident population.

Introduction

1.1 On 6 October, the Scottish Minister for Enterprise and Lifelong Learning, Henry McLeish, MP, MSP, announced a review of the Careers Service in Scotland, and the formation of an independently chaired Review Committee. The Committee's remit was:

"To examine the role of the Careers Service in Scotland, and the scope for change and development of that role in the light of trends and initiatives in education, lifelong learning, and the labour market."

1.2 In particular the Minister stated he would like the review to consider within the context of the government's agenda:

- developments in education for work and enterprise, social inclusion and lifelong learning policy, with particular emphasis on the interaction of careers guidance for both young people and adults with the Scottish University for Industry;
- current and predicted patterns of transitions to continued school education, further and higher education, training and employment;
- labour market trends and current theories on employability and related skills;
- the development of Careers Service provision since 1995;
- recent developments in guidance in England and Wales; and
- recent research on education and work transitions.

1.3 We first met on 22 November 1999, and met nine times subsequently, including hearings of evidence in five sessions across Scotland and a residential meeting.

1.4 From the first meeting, we felt it was very important to seek input from as wide a range of stakeholders as possible. We sent out letters requesting evidence from over 400 organisations and individuals, and also had face-to-face discussions with a variety of stakeholders. Some people sent us their submissions in response to publicity we received. We drew upon recent research from A.G. Watts, Cathy Howieson, Sheila Semple and the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) Thematic Review, *The Transition From Initial Education To Working Life*. We also drew upon the Beattie Committee report *Implementing Inclusiveness Realising Potential*, the HM Inspectors of Schools report on "Education for Work in Schools", *Skills for Scotland*, and *Opportunity Scotland*, among others.

1.5 Our remit asked us to examine the role and scope of the Careers Service. Our recommendations, however, have moved beyond our remit towards issues of institutional clutter, confused roles of accountability for delivery and inconsistency of delivery in Scotland. Our recommendations extend to a discussion of the relationships between the Careers Service and Education Business Partnerships (EBPs), and the Adult Guidance Networks (AGNs). We looked beyond the Careers Service because we became convinced of the

indivisibility of careers education, education and industry links, careers guidance and lifelong learning.

- 1.6 Our chief concern has been to ensure coherence in transition planning and support from an early age through adulthood. We identified a developing role for careers guidance services which takes full account of the variability of learning and work transitions, people and organisational interactions, and also addresses the issue of social inclusion. What is right for one individual in one set of circumstances or what is right in the context of one local labour market will not apply uniformly to all people at all times in all locations. We seek instead a uniformity of purpose and of standards, equality of access, and a service to be delivered in a way that is responsive to individual needs and local circumstances, in the context of robust information about future labour markets and the needs of industry.
- 1.7 We have undertaken our work from the premise that careers guidance is a good thing; that informed, independent careers guidance is beneficial to the individual and to the economy. We heard many assertions that this was so; but we remain conscious of the difficulty of demonstrating clear causality between careers guidance and positive outcomes for clients. Nonetheless, common sense suggests that assistance in understanding the personal implications of options at transitions in life will be of value, and the balance of the research evidence is that careers guidance does indeed have positive outcomes. We specifically refer to John Killeen, Michael White and A G Watts (1992) *The Economic Value of Careers Guidance*, (PSI/NICEC, London), John Killeen, Pamela Sammons and A G Watts (1999) *The Effect of Careers Education and Guidance on Attainment and Associated Behaviour*, (NICEC, Cambridge), Marian Morris, Peter Rudd, Julie Nelson and Deborah Davies (2000) *The Contribution of Careers Education and Guidance to School Effectiveness in 'Partnership' Schools*, (DfEE, Nottingham).
- 1.8 We have not, in the text, identified the sources of the proposals we are putting forward. There were too many valuable contributions for them to be individually acknowledged. In most instances at least some Careers Service Companies will be able to read our recommendations and say, "we already do that." We recognise that this is the case, but we considered it more appropriate to describe our desired end-state for all Careers Service Companies rather than make frequent reference to some who do and some who do not.

The Present Role and Organisation of the Careers Service

- 2.1 Specialist employment services for young people can be traced back to Juvenile Employment Bureaux under the Scottish Education Act (1908). These services evolved over time into the local authority based careers services which were in place until the passing of the Trade Union Reform and Employment Rights Act (1993) which repealed the Careers Service provisions of the Education (Scotland) Act (1980) and amended the provisions in the Employment and Training Act (1973) and which brought the responsibility for the Careers Service under the (then) Secretary of State. This is now a devolved responsibility of Scottish Ministers.
- 2.2 The legislation places a duty on the Scottish Ministers to arrange for services to people in “relevant education” e.g. secondary school or further education college and to people with disabilities whatever their age. The services are defined as the provision of information, advice and guidance on education, training and employment, and assisting people to obtain such education, training or employment. The Scottish Ministers also have the power to provide such services to others e.g. adults who are not in relevant education. The legislation is reproduced in full as an annex to this report.
- 2.3 There are 17 Careers Service Companies throughout Scotland. Each is constituted as a partnership of the Local Enterprise Company (LEC) and the Local Authority; some have minor variations in ownership. The rationale behind this model is to bring the educational expertise of the authority together with the labour market and industrial expertise of the LEC. A board manages each company. The make-up of boards varies across the country, but normally includes nominees of each of the partner bodies. Two companies sub-contract the careers service delivery back to the local authorities.
- 2.4 Careers Service Companies receive core funding to provide free guidance, information and placing or referral services to young people who are in secondary school or further education college, 16 and 17 year olds who have left education, and clients of any age with disabilities. The main focus of the contracted provision is on the *progression* of young people into further or higher education, training or working life. The duty to provide services to people in relevant education includes students of all ages who are attending vocational courses at further education colleges, but most Careers Service Companies have not found the core funding sufficient to enable them to place the same emphasis on these clients as on the client groups previously mentioned.
- 2.5 The companies are also expected to work closely with schools, employers, parents, and a wide range of other organisations. They are involved in the social inclusion agenda, the lifelong learning agenda and the education for work and enterprise agenda. They help young people find Skillseekers positions; many deliver careers guidance within the Gateway of the New Deal; they offer support on Higher Still, Education for Work; and they promote and facilitate the Right to Time Off for Study and Training.

- 2.6 Careers Service Innovation funding, which was provided by the Scottish Executive (formerly Scottish Office), was aimed at innovative projects over the past three years. It has stimulated a good deal of useful new thinking in ways to handle labour market information and improvements in the Careers Service Companies' ability to contribute to the Social Inclusion agenda. This in turn has stimulated a much greater degree of external partnership working than was formerly apparent. Similarly, delivering careers guidance within the Gateway element of the New Deal, and in the implementation of policies on networking for adult guidance, has increased the profile and ability of the companies.
- 2.7 Careers advisers generally meet young people for the first time in school. The work of careers advisers in school is a combination of individual interviews, group sessions with students to discuss career options, and being available for students to drop in to discuss concerns and options. The most common model is that of group sessions and some individual work with pupils in S2 over subject choice and then in-depth individual interviews and further group work in S4, 5 and 6. In a typical individual interview the careers advisor and the student will discuss the student's strengths, capabilities and aspirations. They may then discuss the world of work and both the opportunities and limitations the young person should be aware of when deciding on a career path. Having identified some goals they will work together to devise an action plan for meeting them. Careers advisers are also available to parents and guardians if they have any questions or are concerned with their child's choices or lack thereof. Careers advisers work with school staff to plan careers education programmes and often play a role in their delivery.
- 2.8 Most Careers Service Companies support the delivery of careers guidance in their local further education colleges in some way, though this support takes various forms. Some colleges have a careers adviser from the local Careers Service Company on-site for part of the week offering one-to-one interviews. In other cases the company mainly provides advice and information to support the college's own guidance provision.
- 2.9 Careers advisers and other grades of Careers Service staff also work with young unemployed people in a variety of ways, sometimes intensively, and normally using their efforts to assist the transition to training, further education or employment. Careers Services in most parts of the country have extended this expertise and deliver the careers guidance element of the Gateway for the New Deal for 18 to 24 year olds. They play a role in the benefit process for under-18 year olds, have a vacancy handling role for employers and training providers, assist people who are unemployed to find Skillseekers placements, and help with job search activities including writing a curriculum vitae and application form preparation. The Careers Service works with employers to ensure they understand the needs of the labour market so that they can better serve young people by being informed.

- 2.10 There are, of course, private sector careers guidance companies who provide their services for a fee, often alongside other careers related advice such as writing curriculum vitae. Because we have been tasked to review the role of the publicly funded Careers Service, we have purposely not examined private sector providers or Further or Higher Education careers services.

The Case for Change

Strengths of the Present System

- 3.1 The present system has many strengths and, throughout the evidence taking, very many favourable comments were made about the performance of Careers Service Companies and individual careers guidance professionals. We also saw for ourselves the high degree of professionalism often apparent and the commitment to delivery of effective guidance and achievement of targets.
- 3.2 The present system combines schools, the Careers Service and other agencies, such as Education Business Partnerships (EBPs), working together. It allows for independent and professional advice to be made readily available to young people. The development of organisations built on a company-type model, but drawing on the expertise of their partner “owners”, has brought heightened management skills and awareness to an important service.
- 3.3 The tradition of partnership between the Careers Service and a broad spectrum of partner organisations has certainly strengthened the quality of careers guidance provision by ensuring that interventions can lead to more coherent careers advice and guidance.

Reasons for Change

- 3.4 Throughout the report there are sections or parts of sections that identify that even though the current system is “not broke”, it certainly needs to develop to meet the needs of the changing social and economic environment in which we are and will be operating. We also need to see changes to take advantage of developments in information technology and to create a national voice for and national access to the Careers Service.
- 3.5 As we say in our introduction, much of what we recommend is being done or is building on what is already being done by Careers Service Companies or other providers of guidance.
- 3.6 The focus of the Careers Service tends to be on the first destination of those leaving secondary education, rather than developing employability skills and providing careers guidance at transition points. All the evidence we have shows that we should not operate with an assumption that the first destination will be the start of a career in one company or one profession. Individuals are now expected to be able to change career paths and develop different skill sets over their working life. The current focus and targeting of Careers Service Companies is inconsistent with the new model. The world of work is changing and people need to be able to be more flexible and to change their career paths.
- 3.7 The section on transitions later in the report emphasises the fact that transitions are made by individuals at varying stages in their lives and often later than was traditionally the case. More people are going into further or higher education and

are not making choices until the completion of their post-secondary education. The current level of focus on school leavers and their initial destinations is increasingly inappropriate, or at least is not sufficient, to support individuals in making informed choices at the various transition points with which they will be faced.

- 3.8 While the current model of local delivery organised by Careers Service Companies has many strengths, there was very strong evidence that substantial benefits could be derived from national co-ordination e.g. in terms of provision of information and material as well as professional development. In addition, a “Careers Scotland” could ensure that the views of the Careers Service could be sought and reflected in the development of new initiatives and policies. It would provide better access for many stakeholders who express concern to us that they did not know how to access the Careers Service.
- 3.9 Some of the activities currently undertaken by Careers Service Companies, such as blanket one-to-one interviewing, the vacancy handling role and the role in the administration of the Job Seekers Allowance, consume a great deal of scarce resources. Evidence we have received leads us to the view that the benefits of some of these activities are doubtful and indeed, in the case of the Job Seekers Allowance, are counter-productive in delivering client-centred and confidential careers guidance.
- 3.10 There are a number of changes and developments already underway which will impact on the role of the Careers Service and the way in which it discharges its role. Notably:
- developments in Information and Communication Technology (ICT) will aid delivery of careers-related information, advice and guidance across Scotland rather than simply within individual Careers Service Companies;
 - developments in Education for Work and Enterprise are underlining the importance of a solid careers education foundation;
 - the Scottish University for Industry, being launched this autumn, will promote lifelong learning to all, particularly seeking to encourage people back into learning. Its *learndirect scotland* helpline will offer information and advice on all types of learning opportunities across Scotland. This role might reduce the volume of the more straightforward enquiries by adults currently received by the Careers Service and adult guidance providers. However, the helpline staff will not provide guidance, and *learndirect scotland* is likely to increase the demand for adult guidance services, especially from those who have not recently engaged in learning. It will be important for *learndirect scotland* to be able to refer callers, as appropriate, to high quality guidance providers;
 - lastly, the focus on equality of opportunity and, in particular, social inclusion and the recommendations in the Beattie report.
- 3.11 These new opportunities for learning should be accompanied by access to careers guidance in order to ensure that the learner is choosing the parts that are best for the individual and which take account of good labour market information and employment options.

- 3.12 In a successful future, Education for Work and Enterprise, comprising all of the following elements - careers education, careers guidance, enterprise education, education/industry links - will be taken for granted as an integral part of every individual's lifelong learning experience, whether from school, college, university or in their adult learning. The careers guidance element of Education for Work and Enterprise will be accessible, relevant and realistic. Those who need the most support will receive it, and will be guided through the choices they face to go on to play a full part as productive members of society. We believe our report substantially contributes to making this vision a reality.
- 3.13 The proposals and recommendations in the following sections are intended to address the changes that are needed while building on the strengths of current practice in the Careers Service.

Underlying Principles

- 4.1 We have identified a number of underlying principles that underpin the recommendations in our report.
- 4.2 Careers guidance must be:
- impartial;
 - informed;
 - client-centred;
 - confidential;
 - all age; and
 - coherent.

Impartial

- 4.3 Those seeking careers guidance must have confidence that the information, advice and support they receive is truly impartial.
- 4.4 There are inevitably some tensions between the need to give impartial advice and recognising the requirements of other stakeholders and members of any partnerships that may exist. Further and higher education institutions wish to see the number of students grow; businesses and industry want to see the best people chosen to work for them and to develop the skills needed for the future; and Government has its own targets and perceived needs for economic development and social change. Clients must have the confidence, however, that they are receiving impartial careers guidance that is not driven or distorted by the needs of any particular stakeholder, but that enables them to make informed choices.

Informed

- 4.5 We are operating in a rapidly changing marketplace and expanding global economy. That means that the need to change and change rapidly will increase. Employment and educational opportunities are constantly changing and expanding. One set of skills will not be sufficient for anyone for his or her entire career. Careers guidance providers need to know what the anticipated changes will be and how individuals may best access opportunities. It is essential that people who offer careers guidance are provided with the necessary development and access to information so that their advice and support can be well informed.
- 4.6 Many respondents, such as national training organisations and professional organisations, expressed concerns that Careers Service Companies seemed unaware of the needs and opportunities within their sectors, or of the growing potential of self-employment. Furthermore, these organisations did not know how to access the Careers Service in order to provide information about their sectors. A way of facilitating such access is signalled in Section 7.

Client-centred

- 4.7 The very strong message from all sources was that the focus of impartial, informed careers guidance must be on the individual client and must provide support during transition stages. Individuals have very different needs, abilities, and aspirations. Careers guidance needs to take all of these into account.
- 4.8 The delivery of careers guidance has tended to be based on the notion that there is a single point of transition for individuals – i.e., from education to work, and that the needs of every individual at that point of transition are similar. Models that assume only one transition and that are predominantly based on a single interview are no longer appropriate and do not meet either the needs of the individual or of the economy.
- 4.9 We believe that the proper role of the Careers Service today is less about getting people into jobs and more about equipping an individual to operate effectively in the changing marketplace, and doing so in a way that responds to the needs and current degree of employability of the individual.
- 4.10 Our principles of impartial, informed, client-centred, confidential careers guidance that is available to all and coherent in provision are entirely consistent with the approach to inclusiveness adopted by the Beattie Committee in their report. The role we see for careers guidance will enable effective support to be provided for groups identified by the Beattie Committee as requiring additional support and focus, as well as for all other groups.
- 4.11 We heard much evidence that it would be a mistake to assume that only people who are relatively disadvantaged can benefit from careers guidance. It is abundantly clear that impartial, informed careers guidance is also beneficial to academically able and successful people.

Confidential

- 4.12 If individuals are to receive impartial, informed and client-centred careers guidance, then they must have the confidence that discussions and information they provide about themselves will be treated as confidential. This applies particularly to those people who are at risk of being socially excluded, many of whom may have a number of problems that they need assistance to address.
- 4.13 The need to ensure confidentiality brings with it certain issues, such as:
- what can be shared between other agencies and other careers guidance professionals (if, for example, the individual moves to another part of Scotland); and
 - the (in)appropriateness of the role of the Careers Service in processing Job Seekers Allowance, commonly known as “benefits policing” (which we refer to later in the report).

All-age

- 4.14 There was overwhelming support in the evidence we received for the extension of careers guidance to people of all ages and from all groups and backgrounds.
- 4.15 Careers guidance is not just for the initial transition at the end of compulsory education or on leaving school. It is also for people after they have entered the labour market, whether employed or unemployed, who need to manage their careers in the context of a labour market where job and occupational change are more frequent, or who wish to rejoin the labour market.

Coherent

- 4.16 We came across a number of instances where the lack of coherent provision of careers guidance reduced its potential effectiveness, such as:
- the variability of access to careers guidance in different parts of Scotland, particularly for adults;
 - the lack of consistency in the provision of careers guidance in schools and further education institutions;
 - the enormous variety in the availability of Education for Work and Enterprise activities, including enterprise education and education and industry links;
 - the variability of information available; and
 - the lack of consistent measurement frameworks enabling comparisons between Careers Service Companies.
- 4.17 We saw a real need to introduce cross-Scotland coherence into the provision of careers guidance, while at the same time preserving the benefits of local activities and local knowledge.
- 4.18 We want to ensure that there is a consistency and coherence of provision with differences being driven by the varying needs of individuals or identifiable differences in the local economy. Accidents of geography or funding arrangements should not adversely impact on the coherence of careers guidance provision.
- 4.19 All of these underlying principles are based on the importance of ensuring equality of access to careers guidance, and later to employment, training or education, for all people of Scotland.
- 4.20 **We recommend that these underlying principles – that careers guidance must be impartial, informed, client-centred, confidential, all-age, and coherent - be adopted by Careers Service Companies and that any changes to the role or organisation of the Careers Service must ensure that these principles are preserved.**

Transitions and Inclusive All-Age Careers Guidance

- 5.1 We were asked to consider the scope for change and development of the Careers Service's role in the light of trends and initiatives in education, lifelong learning and the labour market. We concluded that we need an inclusive all-age careers service that individuals can turn to at different transition points.

Transitions

- 5.2 The basic assumption implicit in the current role assigned to the Careers Service is that transitions to work occur only in respect of young people and during a very restricted age range. The bulk of Careers Service work is therefore based on the delivery of an interview or series of interventions in the senior years of secondary education or the first two years after full-time education.
- 5.3 The underlying assumption is manifestly not valid in today's labour market, nor in the context of developments in Scottish Executive policy on education, the growth of enrolments in further and higher education, and in the context of a major growth in policy initiatives on lifelong learning. A number of Careers Service Companies are beginning to explore the opportunities presented by the changing world, but they can be inhibited by the existing policy, regulations and structural frameworks.
- 5.4 As evidenced in the recent Organisation of Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) Thematic Review, *The Transition From Initial Education To Working Life*, young people are making their initial transition at varying stages and often later than was traditionally the case. The current trends are towards longer transitions (before and after leaving education), more complex, more flexible and more individualised pathways, pathways and choices which keep options open, integrating general and vocational education linking school-based and workplace learning, part-time jobs and self-employment.
- 5.5 Furthermore, trends in the labour market and changes within the Scottish economy demonstrate that people are following, and need to follow, several careers over a lifetime and thereby have more transition points than previous generations. The Careers Service must be able to respond to changing and increasing transition points. Individuals will need to develop new skills at different stages in their working lives and to be increasingly flexible. To a considerable extent, these concerns have been recognised in the introduction of the New Deal, in which the Careers Service has, in most areas, a significant involvement.
- 5.6 The OECD Thematic Review outlines the requirements of a successful transition system that can be achieved through different models. These requirements include a strong economy, well-organised and clearly defined pathways, workplace experience combined with education, safety nets, good information and guidance and effective institutions and processes.

- 5.7 We note that Wales will be introducing by 2001 a national all-age careers information, advice and guidance service, operating to a common branding, “Careers Wales”. It is to be based on the current eight Careers Service Companies, and will draw together the Careers Service, the Adult Guidance Initiative and will operate the *learndirect* helpline in Wales. It will also develop an all-Wales quality award for careers education.

Widening the Client Group

- 5.8 There are a number of glaring gaps in the provision of guidance, and we were unaware of any systematic, Scottish-wide provision to address those gaps. For instance, the statutory provision allows for guidance to those in relevant education, such as students in further education, but not for adults who are thinking of entering further education. The same gap applies to those returning to education or to work. There is no statutory provision for careers guidance for adults who are unemployed or for those who will need to acquire new skills.
- 5.9 In an age of lifelong learning, equality of opportunity and social inclusion, these gaps and inconsistencies in provision of careers guidance, which if closed could potentially encourage social inclusion and lifelong learning, are no longer tolerable. With so many different routes to education, training and work, there is a corresponding need to enhance the provision of careers guidance to help ensure that suitable choices are made. We look in more detail at issues of Equality of Opportunity and Social Inclusion in Section 8 of this report. Our conclusions in that section reinforce our view that an inclusive all-age careers guidance service is necessary.
- 5.10 Careers guidance is made up of three tiers: information, advice and guidance. **We recommend that there should be an entitlement for all to free careers information and advice. In principle, access to individual careers guidance should also be free.**
- 5.11 We do, however, recognise that demand might exceed the capacity of services funded at this level to deliver and that resources are not unlimited. Should the level of funding provided prove inadequate to meet demand, then a degree of prioritisation may be required. **If, for whatever reason, the entitlement to receive guidance cannot be met free of charge for all groups, we recommend that the following groups should be prioritised to receive free careers guidance:**
- those up to and including 24 years of age;
 - the current statutory client group, meaning those in relevant education (secondary school or further education college), and people with disabilities, including special needs, regardless of age;
 - those with less than Scottish Vocational Qualification Level 3 or equivalent;

- **those who are unemployed or unwaged; and**
- **those in declining industries.**

Access

- 5.12 We heard through a number of evidence submissions of concerns that the Careers Service had not fully moved to a client-centred approach in relation to access of service provision. Whilst undoubtedly the Careers Service focussed on the careers guidance needs of the individual client and acted impartially in relation to that client, there was not uniformity across Scotland in ensuring that services were provided in a manner that placed customer service above provider convenience. With the extension to inclusive all-age careers guidance this may become more of an issue.
- 5.13 This gap in client-orientation is sometimes evidenced in the provision of access that can sometimes seem inflexible. Examples of these include set lengths of careers guidance interviews, scheduling of interviews, opening hours and office location. It is fair, however, to recognise that these can be as much about convenience of the education establishment as of the Careers Service. Emphasis must be given to the needs of the client when negotiating service level agreements between the Careers Service and its partner organisations, such as educational providers.
- 5.14 We heard in evidence of several examples and suggestions for improved access. These include well-located careers service offices with high street premises, suggestions of co-location with the Employment Service, Learning Resource Centres, colleges, libraries and other related agencies and using University accommodation normally only used during office hours and term-time. Other measures could include more flexible opening hours, telephone helplines, as well as increased use of information and communication technology opportunities such as interactive websites offering careers information, advice and guidance by careers advisers. Some have suggested the use of video-conferencing to overcome the barriers of distance. Facilities can sometimes be available in schools or local learning centres. These are just some examples of ways of improving access to clients, with the underlying aim of being responsive to clients' changing needs.
- 5.15 The Careers Service needs to be constantly responsive to the changing dynamic of the demand for careers guidance. **We recommend that all Careers Service Companies adopt access measures aimed at meeting the needs of the redefined client group and that the annual reports recommended later in this report include a section on access.** The Careers Service should actively seek the clients most in need of its services, and develop a range of methods by which careers guidance can be accessed.

- 5.16 We recognise that adult clients may find a variety of routes to accessing careers guidance. Indeed for many adults who are socially excluded the route into careers guidance will be through intermediaries such as community education workers and community based project workers. We saw benefit in maintaining the diversity and networks, which are integrated by the Adult Guidance Networks (AGNs), but also recognised there may be a need to review how these networks will relate to Careers Scotland and the changing role of Careers Service Companies.

Links with the Scottish University for Industry / learndirect scotland

- 5.17 As of the writing of this report, the Scottish University for Industry / *learndirect scotland* is in its formative stages, with a national launch planned for later in the year. Although the final form of *learndirect scotland* is not yet visible to the public, the Committee has heard from its Chief Executive and Director of Learning, and has examined the Scottish Executive publication, “*Scottish University for Industry: the shortest route to learning.*” While much of *learndirect scotland*’s work will entail brokering with individuals, businesses and learning providers, there is a recognised need for careers guidance to help inform individuals when making choices for learning. We understand that *learndirect scotland* may provide basic careers information and first level advice, but will refer clients to qualified careers advisers for more advanced needs and queries.
- 5.18 **We recommend close strategic links between the Careers Service and the Scottish University for Industry / *learndirect scotland*, and close operational links between individual Careers Service Companies and the *learndirect scotland* helpline, databases and learning centres.** If people are to be successfully encouraged back into learning, it will be essential that callers referred by the *learndirect scotland* helpline to guidance providers receive an appropriate and timely level of service tailored to their needs.

Education for Work and Enterprise

Careers Education – Starting Early

- 6.1 Careers guidance, which is what our review has focused on, is one element of Education for Work and Enterprise. We recognise at Section 7 the importance of cooperative partnership working in delivering the over-arching strategy. Although we do not comment on the contribution of all parties we did recognise the particular importance of careers education in schools and the benefits of collaboration between Careers Service Companies, Education Business Partnerships (EBPs) and schools in providing careers education on which careers guidance is able to build and on the basis of which young people are enabled to make more informed choices and decisions. Careers guidance is perceived to be most effective if it is built upon the solid foundation of effective careers education.
- 6.2 The Careers Service has a role to play in bringing its expertise in careers guidance to bear by supporting schools in the design of their careers education programmes. We received evidence from a number of witnesses suggesting that an early start in careers education, with school staff, careers advisers and others working in partnership, could be a powerful tool in raising the awareness of young people of the choices facing them in their future lives. There was some evidence of the value of introducing careers education in primary schools. We suggest that where this is not happening efforts should be made by Careers Service Companies to offer advice to interested primary schools particularly in areas of disadvantage.
- 6.3 The recent report by Her Majesty’s Inspectors of Schools on “*Education for Work in Schools*” recommends that Careers Service Companies should contribute to careers education policy developments, provide information and advice on the labour market and leaver destinations, participate in awareness-raising activities, advise schools on careers information resources, and provide advice to individual pupils (recommendation 7.5, page 47 of the HMI report). **We endorse** the recommendations in the report. We saw some impressive examples of co-operative work between Careers Service Companies, schools and employers and the beneficial impact of a clear focus on Education for Work and Enterprise.
- 6.4 We suggest that the Scottish Executive Education Department, working with the Scottish Executive Enterprise and Lifelong Learning Department and other partners, should consider incorporating careers education and education for work and enterprise activities more fully into the processes of continuous professional development for teachers, target setting, monitoring for schools and school inspection.

Further Education and Training Programmes

- 6.5 We noted that careers education does not feature as a systematic element of teaching in further education colleges or in vocational training programmes. The view we have heard expressed in some quarters is that further education, by its very nature, is vocationally oriented and therefore has less need for specific careers education. Given the recent expansion of further education and changes in provision, this view may be outdated.
- 6.6 The level of involvement of the Careers Service in careers guidance provision for further education students and people on educational training programmes also appears to be variable and it may be helpful to clarify the respective roles of the Careers Service, further education colleges and training providers in this respect. We suggest that a thematic review of education for work and enterprise activity in the further education sector and in educational training programmes be undertaken by Her Majesty's Inspectorate and the Careers Service Inspectors, with a view to forming a baseline assessment of provision and areas for development.

Goals and Critical Success Factors for Careers Scotland

Introduction

- 7.1 In this section of our review we focus on the outcomes which we believe must be achieved if we are to see the effective delivery of the changes that we recommend. Although our remit did not specifically invite us to look at the structures of the Careers Service Companies, or the framework within which they operate, we bumped into the problems of the crowded and confused institutional landscapes so often that we became convinced that some degree of change is essential if the Careers Service is to deliver for the future. The reasons for the confusion are historic and understandable, but effective delivery of consistent careers guidance across Scotland will require some change. We do however recognise the ease with which discussions on structure can distract from the more important issue - what the structure should deliver - and would emphasise that we are more concerned to focus on the deliverables than on the means of delivery.
- 7.2 Many of our recommendations are designed to achieve greater integration and consistency of activity, to achieve benefits from economies of scale and to give careers guidance a national position while retaining the benefits of local focus. The effective maintenance and deployment of the proposals for change, consistency of application across Scotland, provision of common services and the need to maintain the integrity of the brand means that there will need to be a national body with responsibility for setting strategy and ensuring coherence and integration, with the local Careers Service Companies focusing on delivery of careers guidance. This national body, Careers Scotland, should in our view be separate from rather than a part of the Scottish Executive. We expand on this below.
- 7.3 We recognised that there would need to be some changes to current structures and accountabilities to deliver the outcomes and make some comments on what these might be. We did not have the opportunity to consider the impact of the setting up of the Local Economic Forums, whose formation was recently announced by the Minister, or the relevance of the new Scottish Enterprise model to our proposals or the way in which our recommendations might be delivered.
- 7.4 We hope that the proposals suggested in the following paragraphs will allow for better coherence at both national and local level, an opportunity for reflection and re-evaluation at local level and a more focused role for the Careers Service. It is our ambition to ensure that all companies deliver to the high standards of the best companies and that there should be no difference in the nature or content of guidance other than that which is justified by the needs of individuals.

The Confused Landscape

- 7.5 We saw evidence of excellent partnership and collaborative working where partners used their own particular knowledge or expertise to deliver focused Education for Work and Enterprise and careers guidance. In the context of the social inclusion agenda, there were some impressive examples of partnership working in the delivery of the New Deal. In many parts of Scotland, Education Business Partnerships (EBPs) deliver real benefits to schools and to employers, although some parts of Scotland do not have formal EBPs. We also heard of examples of where individual Local Enterprise Companies (LECs) took differing views on what should be funded which resulted in differences in what Careers Service Companies were able to offer. There were also expressions of concern about the overbearing influence some partners exerted.
- 7.6 There are many players in the field of transitions and lifelong learning. We recognise the value of having specialist and specific inputs into this area. However Careers Service Companies, EBPs, Local Learning Partnerships and Adult Guidance Networks (AGNs), as well as local authorities responsible for schools and community education services, are all operating in similar lines of business, but each with very varied responsibilities and funding routes. Lines of accountability and accessibility are not sufficiently clear and transparent either to those involved in delivery or to the clients.
- 7.7 This is aggravated by the crowded institutional landscape of intermediary bodies between education and work, noted by the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development panel which reviewed the transition from education to employment, training or post-secondary education in the UK in 1998, and more recently by the Enterprise and Lifelong Learning Committee of the Scottish Parliament. Not only are responsibilities confused, but also the energy that goes into the creation and maintenance of overlapping networks and partnerships can detract from the provision of a transparent and accessible service to clients and partners.
- 7.8 We recognised that the structure of the Scottish Executive was a decision by Scottish Ministers to help meet the challenge of devolution and that the Enterprise and Lifelong Learning Department was created to be responsible for all post-school issues. A number of consultees were confused as to the responsibilities and relationship of the Enterprise and Lifelong Learning Department and the Education Department. The challenge for the Scottish Executive is to ensure that the roles of these departments are clearly understood and that they have complementary and consistent policies. This matter is also addressed in our section on Performance and Client Satisfaction.
- 7.9 We were surprised that Careers Service Companies were excluded from the National Special Educational Needs Advisory Forum established by the Education Department.

- 7.10 **We recommend that the Scottish Executive Enterprise and Lifelong Learning Department and the Education Department set up working arrangements which will provide a role model for the co-operative working needed at local level to achieve effective delivery and which will ensure an integration and consistency of policy and targets.**

Four Goals for Careers Scotland

- 7.11 The evidence we have heard, the principles we have recommended in Section 4 and the requirements of Government policy in a number of areas including Social Inclusion and Lifelong Learning have suggested to us 4 main goals that need to be achieved:
- (i) ensure more coherence, at both local and national levels, between careers guidance and other activities that come under the umbrella of Education for Work and Enterprise;
 - (ii) establish clear responsibilities, at both local and national levels, for the delivery of an inclusive all-age careers guidance service as set out in Section 5 and following sections;
 - (iii) ensure that the Government core value of a commitment to equality of opportunity for everyone is delivered; and
 - (iv) improve the co-ordination and evenness of careers guidance delivery across Careers Service Companies and achieve the improvements in service and the economies of scale that this may bring.
- 7.12 **We recommend that, whatever structural change is made, there should be clear accountability for the delivery of our 4 goals listed at 7.11 and that progress is reported in the national annual report (recommended in Section 11).**

Critical Success Factors

- 7.13 In the context of the 4 goals above, we would wish to see the delivery of the following Critical Success Factors being designed into roles and responsibilities of those partners, groups or individuals with accountability for delivering careers guidance in the future. Achievements of these Critical Success Factors are measurable and progress should be reflected in the annual reports that are recommended in Section 11.
- Delivery of independent and impartial careers guidance.
 - Sufficient funding to enable delivery of the defined level of guidance.
 - Delivery of equality of opportunity, including inclusiveness and increased employability.
 - Careers guidance appropriately integrated with initiatives from the Scottish Executive Enterprise and Lifelong Learning Department and the Education Department.
 - Common key performance measurements and objectives for Careers Service Companies set.

- Professional standards for careers advisers: defined and achieved.
- Public performance reporting established for all Careers Service Companies.
- National standards for Careers Service Companies set and monitored.
- Process established for research and development on careers guidance.
- A clear line of sight between the policy makers (the Scottish Executive) and those responsible for deployment of guidance (Career Service Companies) in place.
- Access provided to the Careers Service at national level by employers' organisations and national training organisations.

7.14 **We recommend that, whatever structural changes are made, there should be clear accountability for the delivery of the Critical Success Factors listed at 7.13.**

7.15 The section and following 7.16 suggests how this might be achieved, but we would emphasise again that we are more concerned with the delivery of our recommendations than the shape of the structure.

Delivery of Goals and Critical Success Factors

National Level

7.16 We have suggested that delivery of our aims will broadly require:

- some time-limited focused activity to develop standards and products (see 7.18); and
- these standards and products to form the framework within which Careers Service Companies would be required to operate within Scotland and to support the delivery of a coherent Careers Scotland.

Also required will be:

- longer-term activities to ensure fully effective integration across the two Scottish Executive departments, key stakeholders and the organisations involved in delivering elements of Education for Work and Enterprise and Equality of Opportunity (see 7.21).

7.17 In addition, we would expect to see the continuation of close liaison between the Careers Service Companies themselves and the Scottish Executive and the establishment of Careers Scotland (see below).

National Level Time-Limited Activity and Establishment of Careers Scotland

7.18 **We recommend that all publicly funded careers guidance activity be given a clear identity and suggest that Careers Scotland be established as a brand name and as an organisation.** We use the term 'Careers Scotland' to describe these arrangements as well as brand name for the services which they will deliver.

That brand name would ensure that all publicly funded careers guidance has a national identity. We have not scoped in any detail what Careers Scotland would look like or what effect its creation will have on current Careers Service Companies. This now needs to be done with some urgency.

7.19 We identified a need to set up a “working group” with representatives from Careers Service Companies and Adult Guidance providers to develop proposals for:

- national professional standards;
- arrangements for Continuous Professional Development;
- codes of practice;
- key performance measures (as defined in Section 11);
- standards for company annual reports;
- minimum standards for Access; and
- measures of employability.

7.20 The working group would also develop proposals for the establishment, maintenance and ongoing review of:

- a national information and communication technology strategy;
- a coherent brand and national marketing;
- professional development and training;
- common materials;
- a single line of communication between the Careers Service and other stakeholders, including employers organisations, national training organisations, *learndirect scotland* and STUC; and
- other common services and functions which are more effectively provided on a Scotland-wide basis.

7.21 We would expect this group to take input from all stakeholders, customers and clients and make maximum use of good work that has been and is being done outside the Careers Service Companies. We would also expect the working group to demonstrate a commitment to the integration of activity that is, at present, perceived to be patchy.

7.22 Following appropriate consultation, the working group would make recommendations to the Scottish Executive which, once accepted, would be mandatory for all Careers Service Companies and for those to whom publicly funded work is subcontracted.

7.23 **We recommend that a time-limited working group be established with the remit, in full consultation with clients, customers and stakeholders, to develop proposals for the delivery of our specified goals and Critical Success Factors. These proposals should cover the national standards for publicly funded careers guidance in Scotland, performance measures, the functions that need to be organised or decided nationally and the arrangements for delivery as set out in Section 11.**

- 7.24 **We recommend that the role and accountability of Careers Scotland be scoped with some urgency and that, in order to support the delivery of this reports' recommendations, the organisation be established.**

National level – proposals for more cohesion

- 7.25 We recognised the need for greater integration of activity at national and local level across the range of partners involved in Education for Work and Enterprise, Lifelong Learning, Equality of Opportunity and Social Inclusion as well as between the two Scottish Executive Departments involved in education and Lifelong Learning. We consider that there is a need to have a national partnership that would ensure that:

- careers guidance provision is integrated with other aspects of education for work and enterprise;
- major shareholders, clients and customers input to careers guidance activity and review performance;
- Careers Service Company activities are supporting the development of employability skills which reflect the forecast needs of the Scottish economy in a manner which is consistent with the underlying principles recommended at Section 4;
- the underlying principles continue to be relevant and are adhered to; and that
- implications for and opportunities to support Equality of Opportunity and social inclusion are addressed in any new initiative.

- 7.26 It may be that this specification will require a new forum or that some restructuring of current groups could meet the requirements. We are concerned that these activities are undertaken, and undertaken effectively and make a recommendation about this at 7.36.

Delivery of Goals and Critical Success Factors

Local Level

- 7.27 For each of the 17 Careers Service Company areas we believe there is a need for one body to have the responsibility for ensuring the delivery of careers guidance to nationally specified standards. We recognise that our proposals for Careers Scotland will have an impact on the roles and responsibilities of Careers Service Companies but believe these can best be scoped once the working party has developed proposals.
- 7.28 We concluded that this single responsible body should be the current Careers Service Company. We saw a clear difference between being accountable for ensuring delivery and actually delivering. There may well be circumstances where Best Value would be provided through sub-contracting, in cases such as providing careers guidance for adults or providing support for those who are physically disabled to access education, training and Lifelong Learning

opportunities. Anyone who is sub-contracting a service from a Careers Service Company would be required to operate according to nationally defined standards and would be subject to the same review and inspection arrangements as the Careers Service Company itself.

- 7.29 **We recommend that Careers Service Companies be given the responsibility for ensuring, although not necessarily delivering, the provision of an inclusive all-age careers guidance service.** We expect this service to work with other partners, especially where a strong adult guidance service has already been developed. **We recommend that the Careers Service have the clear responsibility within the adult guidance networks for ensuring that routes of access to the careers guidance entitlement are clear, and that any gaps in provision are identified and filled.**
- 7.30 The decision on whether to sub-contract and to whom would be in accordance with the Best Value model (which should be amended if necessary for application to Careers Service Companies) and consistent with the recommendations of the Nolan Committee on Standards in Public Life.
- 7.31 We believe that careers guidance is at its most effective in the context of a well-developed programme of Education for Work and Enterprise. Delivery of such a programme relies on collaboration and partnership working either between independent partners or within the framework of a formally structured overarching partnership established on a company model.
- 7.32 **Whatever the structure at local level, we recommend that a single agency or forum should be given the lead role in ensuring that an Education for Work and Enterprise plan is developed for each Careers Service Company area.**
- 7.33 The lead could come from the Careers Service Company or the overarching partnership. We felt it was beyond our remit to make a recommendation on this structure, but we consider that our recommendation for the output – the plan – would support the delivery of careers guidance and the integration of activity at local level.
- 7.34 The plan should ensure the development of key employability skills such as:
- values and attitudes;
 - basic skills;
 - defined core skills;
 - customer service skills; and
 - career management skills.
- 7.35 The process of producing the plan might encourage a review of current partnership working gaps and overlaps. The sharing of the plan would support the sharing of best practice.

National and Local structures

- 7.36 **We recommend that the Scottish Executive consider, with partners as appropriate, arrangements that, at both national and local levels, will deliver our goals and ensure integration between the Enterprise and Lifelong Learning Department and the Education Department, key stakeholders and organisations involved in delivering Education for Work and Enterprise and Equality of Opportunity.**

Composition of Careers Service Company Boards

- 7.37 We heard a few comments to the effect that the actions of some Careers Service Company Boards were not sufficiently transparent for it to be clear whether conflicts of interest could be affecting decisions or whether some members of the Board could be acting primarily in the interests of their parent organisation.
- 7.38 The Scottish Education and Industry Department issued a paper to all Careers Service Companies in January 1998 entitled “Governance, Accountability and Openness: Guidelines for Careers Service Companies”. This document highlighted issues that Careers Service Companies should consider when appointing members and in general practice. It drew upon a number of codes of accountability for public organisations, notably the Nolan Committee’s report on Standards in Public Life (1995).
- 7.39 The Scottish Office’s guidelines include specific reference in section 7.2 to conflict of interest that may arise where officials are perceived to be acting primarily in the interests of their parent organisation, rather than in the interest of the Careers Service Company.
- 7.40 **We recommend that the Scottish Executive takes steps to ensure the guidelines for Careers Service Companies on Governance, Accountability and Openness are adhered to and that reference to this is clearly included in the annual report for individual Careers Service Companies and in the national annual report.**

Social Inclusion and Equality of Opportunity

- 8.1 We believe the Careers Service has a crucial role to play in supporting the delivery of the Government's social inclusion and equality of opportunity agenda, in particular its work with disaffected clients, both young people and adults, and with those who have disabilities or who belong to minority groups. The Beattie Committee recommendations also recognised the Careers Service's role in this area.
- 8.2 As far as young people still in school are concerned, we heard in evidence about a three-tiered approach to careers guidance work in schools. The tiers include a core service for all pupils, a filtered service for those who need some specialist help, and an intensive service for those in particular need of specialist help. This system is designed to encourage self-managed careers decision-making, and is responsive to the needs of the individual. We find this model attractive and believe it would support the approach referred to in 8.9 below of providing early support to pupils in schools who are identified as being at risk of exclusion.

Connexions – the English Model

- 8.3 As part of our review we have followed some of the debate surrounding the development of the Connexions service in England. We can see the rationale that lies behind the Connexions strategy, in taking a holistic view of the support young people require to become employable and to make the transition from education to employment, training or post-secondary education. We are, however, concerned that this approach relies too heavily on the traditional focus of careers guidance as being a requirement at a set period in life. We were also concerned that the Connexions approach would divert resources away from others for whom careers guidance is useful. The approach we have advocated in Sections 3, 4 and 5 is to recognise that in today's and tomorrow's world there will be multiple transitions in a person's career which may require information, support and guidance.

Social Inclusion and the Beattie Committee Report

- 8.4 We were asked to give close consideration to the Beattie Committee Report, *Implementing Inclusiveness Realising Potential*, which recognised that the Careers Service can play a significant part in the assessment of the ongoing training, education and employment requirements of young people who require additional support to enter post school education, training or employment. **We endorse the findings of the Beattie Committee.**
- 8.5 We feel the key worker role envisaged by the Beattie Committee report is an equally valid approach for all young people and adults at risk of social exclusion. We therefore suggest that an inclusive all-age careers guidance service should have the responsibility of liaising with appropriate agencies in ensuring that appropriate support is provided to people who are socially excluded.

- 8.6 We are, however, of the view that the provision of such dedicated support for groups at risk of social exclusion should not be provided at the expense of provision of services to all other clients.
- 8.7 **We recommend that the Scottish Executive, in considering the key worker and area strategy role arising from the Beattie Committee report, consider whether these concepts could usefully be extended to other groups at risk of social exclusion.**
- 8.8 At the time of writing this report, the formation of the National Action Group has recently been announced and will be chaired by Nicol Stephen, Scottish Deputy Minister of Enterprise and Lifelong Learning. The Scottish Executive is still considering the Beattie Committee's other recommendations and will be producing an action plan later this year.
- 8.9 **We recommend that work be swiftly undertaken by the National Action Group to define and introduce national protocols for:**
- **assessment;**
 - **the exchange of information between agencies; and**
 - **confidentiality.**
- 8.10 These protocols should build upon existing processes such as the Progress File, as this has the benefit of clear ownership by the young person. Because of its impartiality and its partnership with schools, teachers and other agencies, the Careers Service is in an ideal position to contribute to this process and to take on a major role with regard to assessing the training and education needs of young people. This recommendation should be seen within the wider context of the development of an assessment framework as proposed by the Beattie Committee report and will have applicability beyond those who are currently social excluded. We see it as important that we achieve a consistency or "read-across" between the various reports and records of achievement which are being developed within Scotland.
- 8.11 The collaborative nature of Careers Service Companies' work and their ability to forge constructive relationships with a wide range of partners was discussed in the previous section on structure. **We recommend that, subject to the Scottish Executive's Beattie Action Plan, the Careers Service Companies adopt the role of co-ordinating the area strategy groups suggested by the Beattie Committee report, because Careers Service Companies provide impartiality and expertise as the agency that specialises in transitions.** This would be consistent with their current obligation to ensure Equality of Opportunity and would facilitate effective collaboration amongst a number of organisations with expertise in fields relevant to the wider social inclusion agenda.

- 8.12 **We also recommend that further work be undertaken by the National Action Group in collaboration with the working group referred to in Section 7, to define the nature of the contribution of the Careers Service to developing the key worker role.** In most cases, because of its unique position in engaging with clients both before and following the initial transition from school, the Careers Service is best placed to take the lead in key worker provision and management, taking into account individual circumstances and the local context. This does not necessarily mean that all key workers should be careers advisers; it only means that Careers Services often have the knowledge and capacity to recognise the needs of young people, and of the likely source of the best means of helping them. Their work in schools would enable them, with teachers, to identify those at risk of social exclusion and to initiate early action.

Careers Guidance, Equality of Opportunity and Social Inclusion

- 8.13 **We recommend that the Careers Service (Careers Scotland) is given clear accountability to ensure the provision of careers guidance and support in the development of employability skills for all groups of people, including those who are at risk of being socially excluded, and that they have the accountability for ensuring the delivery of area strategy action plans. This could be achieved either by the integration of the plan within the Education for Work and Enterprise plan developed for each area (as recommended in Section 7) or by the development of a separate plan. We recommend the former.**

Labour Market Information and the Vacancy Handling Role

Labour Market Information

- 9.1 It is critical that the support offered by the Careers Service is delivered in the context of the labour market. The current wisdom is that an understanding of the labour market is best achieved through work with employers and the operation of a direct vacancy handling and placement service. In our view this service contributes, at best, to a narrow and partial understanding of the labour market, based largely on the opportunities available to early entrants to the labour market.
- 9.2 Careers advisers need consistent and high quality labour market information (LMI). Local LMI should be provided by the Local Enterprise Companies (LECs) and local employers, while national LMI should be provided by Careers Scotland (as discussed in Section 7), *learnirect scotland* and the Scottish Labour Market Unit.
- 9.3 **We recommend that Careers Scotland should target work with employers on a more strategic level, developing strategic partnerships with employers, the national training organisations, the Enterprise Network, Education Business Partnerships and the Scottish Labour Market Unit.**

The Vacancy Handling Role and the Employment Service: Role of the Careers Service

- 9.4 One of the issues the Committee found particularly challenging was whether the vacancy handling and placement role should continue as a funded element of work. It was mentioned extensively in evidence received from stakeholders and from Careers Service Companies in particular. There were many arguments in favour both of retaining the role and of relinquishing it. We note that we make the following comments in the absence of input from the Employment Service (ES).
- 9.5 Those in favour of *retaining* the vacancy handling and placement role argued that:
- it gives credibility to the careers guidance role;
 - it is a way of combining the theory of employability with actual experience of looking for a job;
 - it means the Careers Service acts as a “one-stop shop” for careers guidance and as a job centre for the present client group of 16 and 17 year olds;
 - the initial transition from school to the world of work can be very difficult and requires much support;
 - if the Careers Service is integral to the placing of young people into work, training or education, the service can play an advocacy role for some clients with special needs; and
 - the placement role helps to bring the Careers Service into contact with and in touch with the labour market, and it brings employers into the youth

labour market through programmes such as Skillseekers and Modern Apprenticeships.

- 9.6 Those in favour of *relinquishing* the vacancy handling and placement role cited:
- the time, cost and energy of being a placement agency as well as a careers guidance agency;
 - that the placement function was not performed effectively;
 - as the Careers Service moves to become an all-age service, it becomes increasingly arbitrary and inefficient for it to offer a placement service for a small part of its client group;
 - although it provides a basis for continued contact with the labour market it does so in relation to an increasingly narrow range of job opportunities;
 - advocacy can be provided without a placement role; and
 - supporting job search can be provided without a placement role.
- 9.7 The evidence before us indicates that employers do not view the present vacancy handling service in itself as particularly effective. Employers and their representative organisations are notably critical of both the knowledge shown by Careers Service staff of the current state of the labour market and of the specific requirements of employers in the placement of individual clients. We are not persuaded that the vacancy handling service, which is to some extent a replication of the work of the ES, is an effective use of Scottish Executive funding. We would not wish to deter Careers Service Companies from continuing to provide the service on a self-funded basis.
- 9.8 We believe that a different balance between the roles of the Careers Service and the ES is required. The vacancy handling function for clients of all ages can be, and often is, performed by the ES. The Careers Service should retain a more focused role of supporting the placement of young people who most need such support. We recognise that in taking forward the Beattie Committee's recommendations regarding key worker support, the Careers Service will continue to have a role in assisting individuals in the transition from education into employment. Sometimes this would mean acting as an advocate with employers on a person's behalf; this implies the Careers Service adopting a role akin to that of the key worker as proposed by the Beattie Committee report.
- 9.9 We also heard significant evidence suggesting that the role of the Careers Service in processing Job Seekers Allowance, commonly known as benefits policing, is inconsistent with the supportive role of the careers adviser, which we fully support. These views are further supported by the findings in the draft report of the Careers Service Inspectors into the Careers Service role in the processing of Job Seekers Allowance for unemployed people under 18. Moreover, if the ES takes over the vacancy handling role of the Careers Service, the Careers Service will no longer have a logical role to play in processing Job Seekers Allowance.

- 9.10 We recognise that the Careers Service's role in processing Job Seekers Allowance falls under the powers reserved to the UK government and not those devolved to the Scottish Executive. **We recommend that the Scottish Executive undertake negotiations with the Department for Education and Employment, the Department of Social Security, and the Employment Service to consider the potential for transfer to the Employment Service of the vacancy handling role in parallel with the transfer of the benefits policing role from Careers Service Companies.** Until the transfer takes place we would expect Careers Service Companies to continue with their vacancy handling role in order to protect the potentially more vulnerable individuals.
- 9.11 We consider the worst solution for clients would be for the Careers Service to transfer the vacancy handling role and keep the benefit processing role. It would be illogical for clients to use the Careers Service to receive Job Seekers Allowance and not be able to find vacancies for work at the same location. Furthermore, if this were to occur, it would severely undermine the Careers Service's credibility with clients as an impartial source of support regarding careers guidance and transitions.
- 9.12 We became aware that there was not always as much co-operation as there might usefully be at local or national level between Careers Service Companies and the Employment Service. **We recommend that the Careers Service should develop a more strategic relationship with the Employment Service at the national level and a more operational relationship at the local level with the latter formalised through Service Level Agreements.** We were convinced that effective partnership working would not only benefit both the Careers Service and the Employment Service but more importantly their stakeholders and clients.
- 9.13 The Careers Service may continue to offer a vacancy-handling role as long as it is not by using Scottish Executive core funding. We acknowledge that this recommendation will have an impact for staff in Careers Service Companies who presently spend much of their time on this function.

Information and Communication Technology (ICT)

- 10.1 At our first meeting we recognised the potential importance to effective careers guidance of ICT and were aware that some Careers Service Companies had already made substantial progress in developing their ICT capability. We therefore commissioned a national ICT audit of Careers Service Companies. This showed a significant level of activity, and a consensus from the companies themselves that some national direction on ICT would be welcomed. Moreover, in addition to the possible information, management, marketing and guidance benefits from increased strategic use of ICT, staff would be seen as models of modern professional practice.
- 10.2 The range of ICT resources is growing well beyond software packages now in use. ICT can be used for a variety of purposes, such as, but not exhaustively:
- interactive advice;
 - marketing of publications and services;
 - vacancy identification;
 - management and record keeping;
 - management information transfer;
 - tracking;
 - information gathering;
 - information organisation; and
 - information distribution.
- 10.3 The recommendations for the Working Group in Section 7 anticipate that that group will develop a national strategy for ICT. This strategy must include partnership with the Scottish University for Industry / *learnirect scotland* and the National Grid for Learning. Clients should be led into the careers guidance system by a wide range of routes, and ICT can do much to support this.
- 10.4 People of all ages are becoming computer literate and internet-able, and expect to be able to use the internet for information and even interactive advice and guidance. Although some work has been done in this field among Careers Service Companies, it is still in its infancy and is patchy across the country. There are, however, some initiatives in web-based interactive careers guidance, and these should be encouraged. **We recommend that ICT should be explored for delivering careers information, advice and guidance and that further work should be done at a national level to develop interactive and connected websites in partnership with the Scottish University for Industry / *learnirect scotland* and the National Grid for Learning.**
- 10.5 We noted that Careers Service Companies are unable to access National Grid for Learning and similar Government funds aimed at encouraging learning and public service providers to develop digital or web-enabled services. **We recommend that the Scottish Executive secure access to national ICT development funds to allow Careers Service Companies to make the necessary investment in infrastructure, systems and staff training.**

- 10.6 Ideally all Careers Service Companies in Scotland would be on a common ICT platform, or be working towards a common platform. However, the committee recognises that much money and time has been invested in the current ICT strategies of each company, and the crucial factor must be that the platforms are capable of communicating with each other. The fundamental issue, however, is the requirement for ease of transfer of information between companies. **We recommend that the transfer of information between Careers Service Companies should be a priority for the working group.**

Performance and Client Satisfaction

Introduction

- 11.1 We saw considerable evidence of a commitment to the measurement of the quality and effectiveness of the work of Careers Service Companies with several producing excellent annual reports and clear evidence of meeting targets related to such measures as:
- school leaver destinations;
 - number of interviews;
 - number of action plans; and
 - client satisfaction.
- 11.2 The use of Service Level Agreements (SLAs) to define roles and responsibilities between schools and Careers Service Companies was widespread. Where careful planning had gone into the development of these SLAs it was clear that they were useful documents for both parties to the agreement.
- 11.3 The Scottish Quality Management System (SQMS) was seen as a valuable means of measuring or reviewing performance of processes and sharing best practice. There was some concern that the cost impact of undertaking SQMS on some smaller and more distant Careers Service Companies was disproportionate.

Need For Change

- 11.4 The recommendations for changes to the careers guidance provision contained in this report mean that many of the current measures are no longer appropriate and new measures or changes to current measures will be necessary. In particular there is a need to focus on outcomes over a period of time.
- 11.5 As illustration of this need for change:
- Input measures on the number of people interviewed will not deliver the development of employability skills that are necessary for the changing economy or the delivery of an inclusiveness strategy. Input measures such as these run a risk of inappropriate and ineffective activity.
 - Some stakeholders have expressed considerable dissatisfaction with Careers Service Companies. A measurement system should ensure that Careers Service Companies meet the reasonable expectations of stakeholders without impacting on the principles we have identified as fundamental to what Careers Service Companies do and how they should do it. The process of developing appropriate measures should include discussion with stakeholders and those discussions would have, as part of their objectives, a requirement to ensure that stakeholders understood what can reasonably be expected of Careers Service Companies and what role they themselves have in supporting Careers Service Companies.

- There was some concern that the Scottish Office Guidance On Governance, Accountability and Openness, based on the Nolan recommendations, has not been fully deployed and adherence to these standards was not part of any monitoring or inspection.
- Throughout the evidence we heard, reference was made to an inability to compare performance across companies. This is inappropriate in publicly funded bodies and inconsistent with our recommendation for a “Careers Scotland”.
- The change to an all-age careers guidance service, a requirement for increasing flexibility in the workforce, the recognition of increasing numbers of transition points and the differing needs of individuals combined with an increased focus in movement into further education reduces the value of first destination information but increases the need for longitudinal studies into the effectiveness of careers guidance.
- All Careers Service Companies operate in partnership with a number of other organisations. The effectiveness of these partnerships as much as the effectiveness of individual Careers Service Companies determines whether or not individuals receive the guidance which they need and are given the ability to make appropriate choices. New Deal provides some models for how partnership working can be assessed.

11.6 The above indicate some of the issues which need to be addressed when looking at the appropriate measures to assess the impact of the Careers Service.

A Performance and Measurement Framework

11.7 We make some specific recommendations below on approaches we consider should be taken to measurement of the impact of the Careers Service where our thinking is sufficiently developed for us to consider those recommendations would add value. We did however recognise that more input would be needed to develop an effective and comprehensive measurement framework and, recognising this, we make recommendations about the nature of the framework rather than its contents. **We recommend that the working group referred to in Section 7 should have as one of its early and key tasks the requirement to recommend to the Scottish Executive the minimum standards and measures that should apply to all Careers Service Companies and to any organisation to which they sub-contract publicly funded careers guidance activity.**

Framework

11.8 We recognise that individual Careers Service Companies may need to develop additional measures to meet the needs of their own audience and would not wish to interfere in that. In this section of our report we are concerned with the national measurement system.

- 11.9 We also recognise that some of the changes we are recommending can only be delivered by the Scottish Executive and better collaboration within that body. We would anticipate that the measurement framework would address how well they are perceived to be achieving coherence.
- 11.10 We need to have a basket of measures that can be used to assess overall performance. It will be important that measurement does not focus on one or two measures that may then drive inappropriate activity.
- 11.11 The measurement framework should cover:
- impact on individuals;
 - professionalism of delivery;
 - performance of the Careers Service Companies;
 - stakeholder requirement; and
 - partnership working.

We make comments on some aspects of some of these below.

- 11.12 Targets and performance indicators should be:
- designed as hierarchies of measures;
 - easily understood by the relevant audience;
 - capable of comparison with other companies / types of accreditation;
 - related to the process and output of activity;
 - inclusive of a range of quantitative and qualitative data, and incorporate targets for continuous improvement; and
 - collectable without unreasonable cost.
- 11.13 The measurement framework should ensure that the Underlying Principles in Section 4 and the Goals and Critical Success Factors in Section 7 are delivered.
- 11.14 There is a risk that measurement can become an industry in its own right. The challenge is to identify the key effective measures. In the time available to us we were unable to identify these key measures, and we decided against offering a long list of possible measures.

Impact on Individuals

- 11.15 Although we have good evidence about the first post-secondary school destination of young people, we have much less information about where they went after their first destination. The careers guidance which we now seek to provide should have an impact at a much later date at different transition points and should increase the “employability” of all groups including people who are socially excluded and all minority groups.

- 11.16 Longer term tracking and destination information, while difficult and potentially costly, should enable the effectiveness of careers guidance to be measured. We concluded that the relevant sections of the Scottish Executive Enterprise and Lifelong Learning Department and the Education Department should be expected to support the mechanism necessary to track the career paths of clients to evaluate the effectiveness of advice and guidance provided by Careers Service Companies. We would expect such tracking to be on a sample basis but with samples large enough to be reliable in the context of particular groups e.g. people who are vulnerable or who have disabilities.
- 11.17 In addition to tracking transition points, destinations and the development of employability, there are numerous other measures that can be used to assess, in a shorter timescale, the impact of careers guidance. The detailed research by Cathy Howieson and Sheila Semple has much to commend it both in terms of approaches to measuring the impact of the Careers Service on the clients and other stakeholders. The Beattie Committee recommendations on Inclusiveness identify opportunities for measurement of client impact. **We recommend that further work be done to identify measures for the future which are consistent with the framework identified in paragraphs 11.7 to 11.14 and that the Scottish Executive, the proposed working group and the Careers Service Companies work together in implementing and developing effective measures.**

Performance of Careers Service Companies

- 11.18 Careers Service Companies have accountability for:
- the effective management of the company itself;
 - the development of partnership relationships with bodies such as Education Business Partnerships, schools and further education colleges; and
 - the provision of effective careers guidance which is provided in accordance with professional codes and standards and meets the requirements of the Scottish Executive and the needs of the clients.
- 11.19 The thrust of accountability in publicly funded bodies is predicated on a number of principles:
- willingness to compare performance with other similar organisations;
 - preparedness to challenge established ways of doing things;
 - establishing the culture of continuous improvement; and
 - consultation with and involvement of customers.
- 11.20 The application of these principles would require Careers Service Companies to put in place quality development processes that:
- allowed for self evaluation against nationally agreed quality standards;
 - benchmarked services against nationally agreed performance measures; and
 - required annual public performance reporting.

- 11.21 Quality development processes adopted by publicly funded agencies charged with education delivery and based upon self evaluation against performance criteria have been developed by Her Majesty's Inspectorate in collaboration with appropriate professionals. The model perhaps best known in education is the quality in education initiative entitled "How good is our school". This quality process identifies a number of key quality indicators and enables self-evaluation of performance as well as comparison with nationally agreed benchmarks. There is evidence of a strong correlation between the "How good is our school" model and the European Foundation for Quality Management model that is used by both private and public sector organisations. **We recommend that consideration be given by the working group referred to in Section 7 to the development of "How good is our Careers Guidance".**
- 11.22 Careers Service Companies have paid attention to the quality of their organisations through accreditation processes such as SQMS and Investors in People. Concern has however been expressed that these quality models focus more on the effectiveness of management arrangements and less on the effectiveness of careers guidance. We think the latter point should be addressed. We also would like to see specific efforts made to ensure a "read across" between SQMS and other accreditation processes. We wish to ensure the avoidance of duplication of effort as far as practical. **We recommend that the working group should commission work to identify a quality model for the Careers Service that is clearly identified as being a Careers Service model building on SQMS, that looks at the effectiveness of the careers guidance offered against still to be developed quality and performance indicators, and demonstrates a read-across between other identified accreditation processes.**
- 11.23 Careers Service Companies presently produce annual reports but not in a way that enables comparisons to be made between the performance of one company to another. **We recommend that Careers Service Companies should be required to publish an annual report which meets certain minimum standards to be set down by the working group and shows how well they are doing against national benchmarks and key performance measures.** This annual report would also identify areas and targets for improvement. Where work is sub-contracted, we would expect the performance of those sub-contractors to be reflected in the report against the required measures. The Scottish Executive would use the company annual reports as a means of assessing performance. Continuation of funding for individual companies would be dependent on their performance over time. We would also seek evidence that the sub-contracting process had been consistent with the Best Value regime and the Nolan report.

Partnership Working

- 11.24 Section 7 of our report emphasises the importance of partnership working. We encourage the development of Partnership working and would see it as an accountability of the Careers Service Companies to forge effective partnerships with organisations that will enable them to meet their targets.
- 11.25 We would also expect that effective careers guidance would have an economic, social and educational impact. We do not underestimate the difficulty of measuring this. Nevertheless, in the context of the wider collaborative structures we propose, **we recommend that higher level measures be introduced reflecting the economic, social and educational impact the Careers Service may have.**

Careers Scotland Annual National Report

- 11.26 We recommend at 11.23 that the Careers Service Companies be required to produce annual reports. **We recommend that Careers Scotland be required to produce a national annual report reviewing the quality of careers guidance and careers guidance companies in Scotland.** The Scotland-wide report would include information about national performance and the views of major stakeholders. This report would also identify results from, or proposals for, research on careers guidance.

Professionalism

- 12.1 We have taken the view that the services provided by the Careers Service should be available to all ages and categories of people, in a manner that encourages access and promotes Equality of Opportunity and is underpinned by the principles of impartiality, confidentiality and client-centredness. We believe that such services should be described as professional. The emphasis on management and efficient organisation that has characterised recent developments in the Careers Service should not detract from the need for practice to be rooted in a strong professionalism.
- 12.2 We believe that if Careers Service Companies are to deliver this vision they will need to employ teams of people who are suitably competent and qualified to jointly provide a professional service to users. This will require attention to be paid to the training and development not only of careers advisers but also of careers assistants. We are particularly concerned that Careers Service staff at all levels should have continuing opportunities to update their understanding of current labour market and employability issues. Future demands, such as the growing use of information and communication technology and the development of an all-age service, will continue to require new skills.
- 12.3 For the services to be widely viewed as professional they will need to demonstrate:
- robust initial training to a nationally agreed level;
 - continuous, systematic development of skills, knowledge, understanding and competence, including academic and action research for continuous improvement;
 - adherence to a code of ethics that safeguards service users; and
 - an effective management of resources for optimum results.
- 12.4 We recognise that the way teams are constituted will vary according to the needs of a location and so we do not prescribe the competencies that are required, but we expect that the core competence will be that of the careers adviser and will include as a minimum:
- the ability to conduct effective interviews or group activities with a range of clients in a careers guidance context using a variety of information effectively for the benefit of the client;
 - the ability to work effectively in networks and partnerships for the benefit of clients;
 - the ability to reflect on and evaluate their own practice; and
 - the ability to plan and organise their own work and to manage their working relationships effectively.

- 12.5 The existing qualification for careers advisers, the Diploma in Careers Guidance (DCG), will be replaced by the Qualification in Careers Guidance (QCG) in 2003. With effect from 3 July 2000 the Institute of Careers Guidance took over as the Awarding Body for the DCG and pilot QCG. The Institute has also formed a new partnership with Edexcel for awarding Scottish/National Vocational Qualifications (S/NVQs) in Guidance. The QCG is currently being piloted in Scotland at the University of Paisley. Postgraduate qualifications in Adult Guidance are offered by higher education institutions in Scotland and are relevant qualifications for practitioners delivering Adult Guidance as a specialist service. (It is anticipated that in many Careers Services, Adult Guidance will be developed as a service delivered by specialist rather than generic careers advisers but this will vary according to local needs and circumstances.) The SVQ Level 4 in Guidance, with appropriate underpinning knowledge, is also deemed to be an acceptable qualification for the delivery of professional career guidance services. We recognise the need and desirability of including a range of competencies within teams in order to meet the varying needs of clients both effectively and efficiently.
- 12.6 **We recommend that the proposed working group meets training providers, the Institute of Careers Guidance, the Careers Service Companies, the Trade Unions that represent Careers Service staff and the Scottish Executive to agree the most appropriate content of initial training for all levels to meet the needs of the newly defined Careers Service. We recommend that standards for such training are agreed, defined and made publicly known.**
- 12.7 **We further recommend that the working group consider the issue of continuous professional development (CPD). It should agree to an approach to CPD that is sufficiently rigorous to meet the requirements of the profession whilst remaining responsive to the changes in demand for training that will inevitably flow from organisations that are committed to adapting to meet the changing needs of their users.** The systematic maintenance, improvement and broadening of knowledge, skills and competence through working life are core to the definition of “professional”. **We recommend that evidence of employee engagement in CPD be incorporated into the performance standards for Careers Service Companies.**
- 12.8 We recognise that both initial training and CPD require funding both directly and indirectly (e.g. in terms of time away from the workplace). By its nature, this requirement for funding is continuous and tends to be in negative correlation to company size – since training and development tend to benefit from economies of scale and are usually provided at lower cost when greater numbers are involved. **We recommend that discussions take place between the working group and the Scottish Executive to agree a method to organise and to fund training and development in a way that will ensure that it takes place as required to meet the needs of a professional service as described above.** We anticipate an important role for Careers Scotland in coordinating CPD across companies to ensure the most cost effective management. We suggest that the practice in other professions for CPD be used as the benchmark for determining an appropriate approach to continuous professional development for Careers Service staff.

- 12.9 We recognise that professional careers advisers work within a strong ethical framework and wish to see this framework informing and influencing the development of all career guidance provision in Scotland. We recognise that membership of a professional body that requires its members to subscribe to a code of ethics and standards is consistent with independent, impartial advice and professional practice. The Institute of Careers Guidance has an increasing role in the regulation of the profession in this way and other professional bodies, such as the National Association for Educational Guidance for Adults, have an important contribution to make. **We recommend that the working group be required to discuss with the Institute of Careers Guidance and the other professional bodies the ethical values which should underpin the delivery of an inclusive all-age careers guidance service and to agree a code of ethics and a statement of service which can be adopted and promoted nationally.**
- 12.10 We recognise that the commitment of staff is central to the achievement of a continuously improving, professional Careers Service. **We recommend, in line with the approach promoted by the Best Value Regime, that Careers Service Companies have in place appropriate arrangements for ensuring that staff and their Trade Unions are able to make a meaningful input to decisions that affect the delivery of services to clients.**
- 12.11 The committee is concerned that whilst a sound body of research has been developed in the UK in recent years that bears on the work of the Careers Service, there appears to have been little that has a Scottish dimension. This is felt to have the potential to undermine the professionalism of the Scottish Careers Service. **We recommend that the working group be required and funded to commission relevant research that will ensure the continuing development of the profession in Scotland.** This is particularly important in the light of potential changes to the role of the Careers Service in England, which may move it away from the role we envisage in Scotland.
- 12.12 However, the issue is not simply the availability of research; it is also the readiness of the profession to use research to inform its practice. We saw little evidence of such readiness, and this was reflected in the submissions to the committee, very few of which made any reference to relevant research. We consider that CPD should ensure the development of a culture in which relevant research and labour market information are systematically used to promote improvements in the practice of careers guidance.

Funding

Current Position

- 13.1 The Scottish Executive currently provides approximately £21.8 million/per annum to the 17 Careers Service Companies for the core service; the amount each receives is based on the Grant Aided Expenditure formula (GAE). For comparative purposes, we note that the Education GAE for 1999/2000 was nearly £2.6 billion¹. We had some doubts as to whether this funding is adequate to meet the needs of the statutory group and found examples of additional funds being found to provide the service. Core funding is increased from a number of sources that we were unable to fully unravel in the time available to us. Some local authorities provide funds as do some local enterprise companies to some Careers Service Companies.
- 13.2 Some Careers Service Companies generate additional funds to support delivery of the core service from their own revenue generating activities. Money can come from European Social Funds, Scottish Executive Adult Guidance Development Funding, Social Inclusion Partnerships, further education provision, and from the Voluntary Sector. A number of schools prioritise within their own budgets to provide more per capita funding for careers education and guidance than do others, similarly some further education colleges provide additional funds for careers guidance.
- 13.3 Several Careers Service Companies provided convincing arguments for the establishment of a more stable national financial framework. Under current arrangements, Careers Service Companies have been required to bid for the contract to provide careers guidance on a five-yearly basis (with current contracts extended pending the outcome of this review). These arrangements create unnecessary work for the Companies in a situation where real competition does not exist and can make it difficult, particularly in distant locations, to recruit staff who can only be offered short-term contracts. **We recommend that, subject to current and continuing satisfactory performance, the Scottish Executive re-contract with the existing 17 Careers Service Companies from April 2001, with annual reviews.**
- 13.4 The Adult Guidance Networks receives modest funding from the Scottish Executive. The Networks fulfil a useful function in bringing together all those concerned with the provision of information, advice, guidance and learning in a local area on order to improve co-ordination and facilitate referrals between the agencies **We recommend that funding for Adult Guidance Networks be maintained.**

¹ See “Investing in You: The Annual Report of the Scottish Executive 99/00”, published 19 April 2000.

Expanding Role

- 13.5 The Beattie Committee recommended extensions to the role of Career Service Companies to support Inclusiveness. This review is recommending that entitlements to free careers guidance should be expanded (Section 5) and recognises that the degree of expansion will be determined by the availability of funding.
- 13.6 We have made no estimate of the costs of delivering the Beattie recommendations or of the amounts spent on support that is currently provided, which can presumably be off set against an overall increase of support. We are clear however that the necessary funding should not come from the current budget for Careers Service Companies. **We recommend that the funding for the Beattie Committee recommendations should not come from funding currently allocated to the provision of the core service.**
- 13.7 **We recommend that the core funding of the Careers Service Companies be increased to ensure the provision of an inclusive all-age careers guidance service as outlined in Section 5.** This increase in funding should be provided to the Careers Service Companies who would then be charged with providing adult careers guidance services themselves or contracting with quality-assured bodies to provide these services, as outlined in Section 7.
- 13.8 We have made a very rough calculation of the additional costs of providing an inclusive all-age careers guidance service. We did not have sufficient time to do a costing of this recommendation, but we have attempted to draw on examples of Adult Guidance provision in four regions of Scotland that were presented to us as typical of good practice. On this basis, we estimate that existing levels of demand for guidance for adults could be met at an approximate cost, nationally, of an additional £5m per annum (25%) increase to the Careers Service budget. We also recognise that better access to information and improved marketing may increase the demand for careers guidance above the level we have assumed. This could in part be offset by economies of scale and development of national regulations.
- 13.9 There is an underlying assumption that effective career guidance has social and economic benefits in particular where it reduces periods of unemployment or avoids disadvantage. We would expect that measurement of these social and economic benefits would be picked up as part of the review of high level measures referred to in 11.24.

Changing Role and Organisation of Careers Service Companies

- 13.10 The effect of some of our proposals will be to increase costs or to direct money from other organisations directly to careers guidance. There will however be scope for re-investment from:
- economies achieved through Careers Scotland common provision of functions;
 - the setting up of national systems e.g. publications, information and communication technology;

- the removal of job placement and benefits policing from the core funded activity; and
- any reduction in the information provision activity which is, in practice, taken over by Scottish University for Industry

13.11 On the other hand funding must be sufficient to ensure the continuous professional development (CPD) of Careers Service Company employees. We heard anecdotal evidence that CPD was not taking place because of funding or work load pressures. **We recommend that opportunities for re-investment of savings arising from the development of national products and changed vacancy handling role should be scoped and that one area for re-investment should be continuous professional development.**

Funding Formula

13.12 Irrespective of any funding change that will be necessary to meet the Beattie Committee recommendations and the expanded role of the Careers Service, concerns were expressed about the adoption of the GAE formula. It does not take adequate account of:

- unemployment levels;
- degree of social exclusion;
- population dispersal;
- levels of academic achievement; or
- the impact on the size of the resident population of educational institutions or people travelling to work and hence seeking guidance in the area of work, not residency.

13.13 While recommending the formula should be reviewed in the light of the above, we agreed it would be necessary to have a base level of funding for island services. **We recommend that the GAE formula for funding should be reviewed with the aim of ensuring unemployment levels, degree of social exclusion, population dispersal, level of academic achievement and ‘non-resident’ population are given some weight.**

Individual Learning Accounts (ILAs)

13.14 At the time of writing this report, ILAs are being piloted, but are expected to come “on-line” later this year. They will be funds people can use to purchase learning or training. At present, the policy for the first 100,000 accounts is that the Executive will contribute £150 to fund learning costs if an individual commits £25. Thereafter ILAs will provide discounts of 20% on most learning costs, and discounts of 80% on basic IT, literacy and numeracy courses (i.e. up to SVQ Level 1 Qualification). ILAs can be used to pay for careers guidance from Scottish Quality Management System (SQMS) accredited organisations who employ qualified careers guidance delivery staff. It may be that ILAs could be used to purchase careers guidance should funding levels for an all-age guidance service be insufficient for a universal entitlement to a free service.

Conclusion

- 14.1 Throughout the entire Review process, our chief concern has been to ensure coherence in transition planning and support from an early age through adulthood. We identified a developing role for careers guidance services which takes full account of the variability of learning and work transitions, people and organisational interactions, and also addresses the issue of social inclusion. We have sought a uniformity of purpose and of standards, equality of access, and a service to be delivered in a way that is responsive to individual needs and local circumstances, in the context of robust information about future labour markets and the needs of industry.
- 14.2 We think our recommendations lay the foundations for this vision. We have recommended measures to make the Careers Service more robust, rigorous and open to outside scrutiny. Our recommended performance measurement indicators, professional and national standards, and public performance reporting, as well as the underlying principles we have set down, will lead the Careers Service to become an inclusive all-age careers guidance service to help the people of Scotland realise their potential.

Summary of Recommendations

Underlying Principles

1. We recommend that these underlying principles – that careers guidance must be impartial, informed, client-centred, confidential, all-age, and coherent - be adopted by Careers Service Companies and that any changes to the role or organisation of the Careers Service must ensure that these principles are preserved. (4.20)

Transitions and Inclusive All-Age Careers Guidance

2. We recommend that there should be an entitlement for all to free careers information and advice. In principle, access to individual careers guidance should also be free. (5.10)
3. If, for whatever reason, the entitlement to receive guidance cannot be met free of charge for all groups, we recommend that the following groups should be prioritised to receive free careers guidance:
 - those up to and including 24 years of age;
 - the current statutory client group, meaning those in relevant education (secondary school or further education college), and people with disabilities, including special needs, regardless of age;
 - those with less than Scottish Vocational Qualification Level 3 or equivalent;
 - those who are unemployed or unwaged; and
 - those in declining industries. (5.11)
4. We recommend that all Careers Service Companies adopt access measures aimed at meeting the needs of the redefined client group and that the annual reports recommended later in this report include a section on access. (5.15)
5. We recommend close strategic links between the Careers Service and the Scottish University for Industry / *learndirect scotland*, and close operational links between individual Careers Service Companies and the *learndirect scotland* helpline, databases and learning centres. (5.18)

Goals and Critical Success Factors for Careers Scotland

6. We recommend that the Scottish Executive Enterprise and Lifelong Learning Department and the Education Department set up working arrangements which will provide a role model for the co-operative working needed at local level to achieve effective delivery and which will ensure an integration and consistency of policy and targets. (7.10)
7. We recommend that, whatever structural change is made, there should be clear accountability for the delivery of our 4 goals listed at 7.11 and that progress is reported in the national annual report (recommended in Section 11). (7.12)
8. We recommend that, whatever structural changes are made, there should be clear accountability for the delivery of the Critical Success Factors listed at 7.13. (7.14)
9. We recommend that all publicly funded careers guidance activity be given a clear identity and suggest that Careers Scotland be established as a brand name and as an organisation. (7.18)
10. We recommend that a time-limited working group be established with the remit, in full consultation with clients, customers and stakeholders, to develop proposals for the delivery of our specified goals and Critical Success Factors. These proposals should cover the national standards for publicly funded careers guidance in Scotland, performance measures, the functions that need to be organised or decided nationally and the arrangements for delivery as set out in Section 11. (7.23)
11. We recommend that the role and accountability of Careers Scotland be scoped with some urgency and that, in order to support the delivery of this reports' recommendations, the organisation be established. (7.24)
12. We recommend that Careers Service Companies be given the responsibility for ensuring, although not necessarily delivering, the provision of an inclusive all-age careers guidance service. We recommend that the Careers Service have the clear responsibility within the adult guidance networks for ensuring that routes of access to the careers guidance entitlement are clear, and that any gaps in provision are identified and filled. (7.29)
13. Whatever the structure at local level, we recommend that a single agency or forum should be given the lead role in ensuring that an Education for Work and Enterprise plan is developed for each Careers Service Company area. (7.32)
14. We recommend that the Scottish Executive consider, with partners as appropriate, arrangements that, at both national and local levels, will deliver our goals and ensure integration between the Enterprise and Lifelong Learning Department and the Education Department, key stakeholders and organisations involved in delivering Education for Work and Enterprise and Equality of Opportunity. (7.36)

15. We recommend that the Scottish Executive takes steps to ensure the guidelines for Careers Service Companies on Governance, Accountability and Openness are adhered to and that reference to this is clearly included in the annual report for individual Careers Service Companies and in the national annual report. (7.40)

Social Inclusion and Equality of Opportunity

16. We endorse the findings of the Beattie Committee. (8.4)
17. We recommend that the Scottish Executive, in considering the key worker and area strategy role arising from the Beattie Committee report, consider whether these concepts could usefully be extended to other groups at risk of social exclusion. (8.7)
18. We recommend that work be swiftly undertaken by the National Action Group to define and introduce national protocols for:
 - assessment;
 - the exchange of information between agencies; and
 - confidentiality. (8.9)
19. We recommend that, subject to the Scottish Executive's Beattie Action Plan, the Careers Service Companies adopt the role of co-ordinating the area strategy groups suggested by the Beattie Committee report, because Careers Service Companies provide impartiality and expertise as the agency that specialises in transitions. (8.11)
20. We also recommend that further work be undertaken by the National Action Group in collaboration with the working group referred to in Section 7, to define the nature of the contribution of the Careers Service to developing the key worker role. (8.12)
21. We recommend that the Careers Service (Careers Scotland) is given clear accountability to ensure the provision of careers guidance and support in the development of employability skills for all groups of people, including those who are at risk of being socially excluded, and that they have the accountability for ensuring the delivery of area strategy action plans. This could be achieved either by the integration of the plan within the Education for Work and Enterprise plan developed for each area (as recommended in Section 7) or by the development of a separate plan. We recommend the former. (8.13)

Labour Market Information and the Vacancy Handling Role

22. We recommend that Careers Scotland should target work with employers on a more strategic level, developing strategic partnerships with employers, the national training organisations, the Enterprise Network, Education Business Partnerships and the Scottish Labour Market Unit. (9.3)

23. We recommend that the Scottish Executive undertake negotiations with the Department for Education and Employment, the Department of Social Security, and the Employment Service to consider the potential for transfer to the Employment Service of the vacancy handling role in parallel with the transfer of the benefits policing role from Careers Service Companies. (9.10)
24. We recommend that the Careers Service should develop a more strategic relationship with the Employment Service at the national level and a more operational relationship at the local level with the latter formalised through Service Level Agreements. (9.12)

Information and Communication Technology (ICT)

25. We recommend that ICT should be explored for delivering careers information, advice and guidance and that further work should be done at a national level to develop interactive and connected websites in partnership with the Scottish University for Industry / *learndirect scotland* and the National Grid for Learning. (10.4)
26. We recommend that the Scottish Executive secure access to national ICT development funds to allow Careers Service Companies to make the necessary investment in infrastructure, systems and staff training. (10.5)
27. We recommend that the transfer of information between Careers Service Companies should be a priority for the working group. (10.6)

Performance and Client Satisfaction

28. We recommend that the working group referred to in Section 7 should have as one of its early and key tasks the requirement to recommend to the Scottish Executive the minimum standards and measures that should apply to all Careers Service Companies and to any organisation to which they sub-contract publicly funded careers guidance activity. (11.7)
29. We recommend that further work be done to identify measures for the future which are consistent with the framework identified in paragraphs 11.7 to 11.14 and that the Scottish Executive, the proposed working group and the Careers Service Companies work together in implementing and developing effective measures. (11.17)
30. We recommend that consideration be given by the working group referred to in Section 7 to the development of “How good is our Careers Guidance”. (11.21)
31. We recommend that the working group should commission work to identify a quality model for the Careers Service that is clearly identified as being a Careers Service model building on SQMS, that looks at the effectiveness of the careers guidance offered against still to be developed quality and performance indicators,

and demonstrates a read-across between other identified accreditation processes. (11.22)

32. We recommend that Careers Service Companies should be required to publish an annual report which meets certain minimum standards to be set down by the working group and shows how well they are doing against national benchmarks and key performance measures. (11.23)
33. We recommend that higher level measures be introduced reflecting the economic, social and educational impact the Careers Service may have. (11.25)
34. We recommend that Careers Scotland be required to produce a national annual report reviewing the quality of careers guidance and careers guidance companies in Scotland. (11.26)

Professionalism

35. We recommend that the proposed working group meets training providers, the Institute of Careers Guidance, the Careers Service Companies, the Trade Unions that represent Careers Service staff and the Scottish Executive to agree the most appropriate content of initial training for all levels to meet the needs of the newly defined Careers Service. We recommend that standards for such training are agreed, defined and made publicly known. (12.6)
36. We further recommend that the working group consider the issue of continuous professional development (CPD). It should agree to an approach to CPD that is sufficiently rigorous to meet the requirements of the profession whilst remaining responsive to the changes in demand for training that will inevitably flow from organisations that are committed to adapting to meet the changing needs of their users. We recommend that evidence of employee engagement in CPD be incorporated into the performance standards for Careers Service Companies. (12.7)
37. We recommend that discussions take place between the working group and the Scottish Executive to agree a method to organise and to fund training and development in a way that will ensure that it takes place as required to meet the needs of a professional service as described above. (12.8)
38. We recommend that the working group be required to discuss with the Institute of Careers Guidance and the other professional bodies the ethical values which should underpin the delivery of an inclusive all-age careers guidance service and to agree a code of ethics and a statement of service which can be adopted and promoted nationally. (12.9)
39. We recommend, in line with the approach promoted by the Best Value Regime, that Careers Service Companies have in place appropriate arrangements for ensuring that staff and their Trade Unions are able to make a meaningful input to decisions that affect the delivery of services to clients. (12.10)

40. We recommend that the working group be required and funded to commission relevant research that will ensure the continuing development of the profession in Scotland. (12.11)

Funding

41. We recommend that, subject to current and continuing satisfactory performance, the Scottish Executive re-contract with the existing 17 Careers Service Companies from April 2001, with annual reviews. (13.3)
42. We recommend that funding for Adult Guidance Networks be maintained. (13.4)
43. We recommend that the funding for the Beattie Committee recommendations should not come from funding currently allocated to the provision of the core service. (13.6)
44. We recommend that the core funding of the Careers Service Companies be increased to ensure the provision of an inclusive all-age careers guidance service as outlined in Section 5. (13.7)
45. We recommend that opportunities for re-investment of savings arising from the development of national products and changed vacancy handling role should be scoped and that one area for re-investment should be continuous professional development. (13.11)
46. We recommend that the GAE formula for funding should be reviewed with the aim of ensuring unemployment levels, degree of social exclusion, population dispersal, level of academic achievement and 'non- resident' population are given some weight. (13.13)

Annex One

Careers Service Review Committee

Chair

Barbara Duffner Head of Personnel (North), Royal Mail

Members

Paul Barlow Managing Director, Glasgow Airport

Alex Blackwood Chief Executive, Glasgow Education Business Partnership

Catriona Eagle Chief Executive, Argyll and Bute Careers Partnership

Ed Gillespie Chief Executive, Grampian Enterprise Limited

Janice Laird Adult Education and Guidance Co-ordinator, Fife Adult Guidance and Education Services

Val MacIver UHI Board of Governors

Iain McMillan Director, CBI Scotland

Ros Micklem Principal, Cardonald College

Shelagh Rae Director of Education and Leisure, Renfrewshire Council

David Raffe Centre for Educational Sociology, University of Edinburgh

Grahame Smith Deputy General Secretary (Policy and Campaigns),
Scottish Trades Union Congress

Edward Tweedlie Headteacher of Brannock High School, Motherwell

Stephanie Young Director, Lifelong Learning, Scottish Enterprise Glasgow

Secretariat

Ian McGhee Transitions to Work Division
Scottish Executive Enterprise and Lifelong Learning
Department

Colin Brown Scottish Executive Enterprise and Lifelong Learning
Department

Ann Milović Scottish Executive Enterprise and Lifelong Learning
Department

Annex Two

Key Issues considered by the Committee

CLIENT GROUP

should this be widened and if so in what way
if it is how will career services work with/relate to other providers

SKILLS SHORTAGES CURRENT & FORECAST

are Careers Service focusing adequately on areas of likely future skill shortages
how do the Career Service ensure they are aware of current and future needs of employers

IMPACT OF TECHNOLOGY

will the increasing use of technology in schools have an impact on the way in which Careers Service provide services/clients access services
what changes will there be/need to be in the way Careers Service operate in view of increasing use of technology
should there be 'minimum' standards for providers so that they can be seen as 'role models' and so there is a common platform across Scotland

ACCESS

are current access arrangements effective e.g.

'opening hours'
clients moving between locations
working parents
distances to travel
provision of information

LIFELONG LEARNING & SOCIAL INCLUSION

how well do current Careers Service activities and approaches fit with the government's agenda
are any changes necessary in the light of other current activities e.g. learning points from New Deal, Beattie Report etc.

CLIENT SATISFACTION

are we meeting current and future needs of the client group
how do we best assess what these needs are and monitor success in meeting them
how do we/should we meet the different needs which exist in the client group

MEASUREMENT

how well are the companies doing now in terms of performance
are current measurement systems appropriate
what should performance targets look like

MODELS OF DELIVERY

does the organisational model impact on the quality of the service provided/make a difference to the effective deployment of policy

CORE : NON-CORE ACTIVITIES

some providers provide non-core as well as core activities, does this impact on the quality of the service provided/make a difference to the effective deployment of policy

OTHER PROVIDERS/ORGANISATIONS

who are they
how effective are they
what are the pros and cons of seeking to establish closer links with some or all e.g. Scottish University for Industry, Scottish Guidance Group

CAREERS SERVICES: SKILLS & COMPETENCIES

what skills and competencies do providers need
how do the companies ensure minimum standards are maintained
are the providers role models for core skills

OTHER MODELS: OTHER EXPERIENCE

what can we learn from England, Europe, North America

VISIONING

is our thinking (as reflected above) radical enough
are there opportunities we are missing

Annex Three

Evidence Received

Aberdeenshire Council
Angus College
Angus Council
Argyll and Bute Careers Partnership
Ayrshire Careers Partnership
Association of Careers Service Companies in Scotland (ACSCIS)
Association of Directors of Education in Scotland
Association of Scottish Colleges
Banff and Buchan College
Ingrid Booth*
Michael Breslin*
Cardonald College
Careers Central Limited
Career Development Edinburgh and Lothians
Central College of Commerce
City of Edinburgh Council, Education
City of Edinburgh Council, Social Work Department
Clydebank College
Confederation of British Industry (CBI Scotland)
Coutts Consulting Group
Craft Bakery Training Organisations (Scotland)
Create Interest (Promoting the Food and Drinks Industry)
Dumfries and Galloway Careers Service
Dumfries and Galloway College
Dunbartonshire and Lomond Careers Service
Dunbartonshire and Lomond Education Business Partnership
Dunbartonshire Enterprise
Dundee City Council Social Work Department
East Lothian Council, Education and Community Services
East Renfrewshire Council
Edinburgh's Telford College
Margaret Ewing, MSP, MP
Falkirk College
Falkirk Council Education Services
Fife Adult Guidance Network
Fife Careers Limited
Fife Enterprise
Glasgow Careers Partnership Limited
Glasgow Careers Service Unison Submission
Glasgow Chamber of Commerce
Glasgow City Council Education Services
Grampian Careers
John Grant*
Rhoda Grant MSP
and Maureen Macmillan MSP
Highland Council
Highlands and Islands Enterprise
Institute of Careers Guidance

Institute of Chartered Accountants of Scotland, Education
Insurance & Related Financial Services National Training Organisation
Inverclyde Council Education Services
James Watt College
Grant Jeffrey
John Wheatley College of Further and Higher Education
Lanarkshire Adult Guidance Network
Lanarkshire Careers Partnership Limited
Lauder College
Lead Scotland (Linking Education and Disability)
Lothian Adult Guidance Network
Meat and Livestock Commission, Scotland
Moray Council Education Department
Motherwell College
Napier University
National Association for Educational Guidance for Adults
North East of Scotland Adult Guidance Initiative
North Lanarkshire Council
Orkney Opportunities Centre
Renfrewshire Careers Partnership
Renfrewshire Council – Education and Leisure
Renfrewshire Council – Social Work
Renfrewshire Education Business Partnership
Renfrewshire Enterprise
Ross and Cromarty Education Business Partnership
Scottish Borders Careers Service
Scottish Borders Enterprise
SCDI – Scottish Council for Development and Industry
SCONTO – Scottish Council of National Training Organisations
Scottish Enterprise
Scottish Further Education Unit
Scottish Qualifications Authority
Scottish University for Industry
Shetland Careers Service
Skill – National Bureau for Students with Disabilities
Skye and Lochalsh Enterprise
South Lanarkshire College
South Lanarkshire Council Education Resources
Tayside Careers Limited
Unison Scotland
University of Paisley
University of Paisley QCG Students
University of Strathclyde Faculty of Education
West Lothian College
Western Isles Careers Service
Wildcat One Consulting

* as an individual. The Committee received a further five submissions from people who asked for their submissions to be regarded as confidential.

Annex Four

Invited to give Evidence

In Aberdeen:

Bob Shanks
Highlands and Islands Enterprise

Christina Allon
Grampian Careers

Stephen Benwell
Tayside Careers Limited

In Edinburgh:

Ian Carse
Orkney Opportunities Centre

Craig Smith, Mary McKellar and Karen Johnson
Careers Central

Bill Allister, Katy Gordon, Neil Cruickshank
UNISON

Grant Jeffrey
Careers Guidance, Napier University

David Blaszk, Margot Crosbie, and Colin Henderson
Scottish Borders Careers

John Grant

Sheila McCullough
Scottish Council of National Training Organisations (SCONTO)

Christina Allon and Dermot Dick
Association of Careers Service Companies in Scotland (ACSCIS)

In Paisley:

Liz Connolly
Enterprise Ayrshire

Ian Graham
John Wheatley College

Marion McIntosh and Mary Cox
Cardonald College

Margaret Sutherland
Scottish Enterprise

Richard Barron and Helen Mulraney
City of Glasgow Education Services

Danny Logue, Marlene Crawford and Counsellor Eddie Phillips (Chair)
Renfrewshire Careers Partnership

Sham Nath
Continuing Education Gateway

Evidence was also taken at plenary meetings from:

Julie-Anne Jamieson, Scottish Executive – Beattie Implementation, Enterprise and Lifelong Learning Department;

Glenys Watt, Blake Stevenson;

AG Watts, The National Institute for Careers Education and Counselling;

Bob Porrer, Convenor, Association of Graduate Careers Advisory Services (Scotland);

Drew Fleming and Alan Owenson, Careers Service Inspectors;

Cathy Howieson, University of Edinburgh, and Sheila Semple, University of Strathclyde;
and

Sue Pinder, Director of Learning, Scottish University for Industry.

Annex Five

THE EXTRACT FROM THE TRADE UNION REFORM AND EMPLOYMENT RIGHTS ACT (1993)

Careers Services.
1973 c.50.

For sections 8 to 10 of the Employment and Training Act 1973 (careers services of education authorities) and the heading immediately preceding them there shall be substituted-

“Careers services”

Duty of Secretary of State to ensure provision of Careers Services for school and college students.

8.- (1) It shall be the duty of the Secretary of State to secure the provision of relevant services for assisting persons undergoing relevant education to decide-

- (a) what employments, having regard to their capabilities, will be suitable for and available to them when they cease undergoing such education, and
- (b) what training or education is or will be required by and available to them in order to fit them for those employments,

and for assisting persons ceasing to undergo relevant education to obtain such employments, training and education.

(2) In subsection (1) of this section and section 9 of this Act “relevant services” means

- (a) giving of assistance by collecting, or disseminating or otherwise providing, information about persons seeking, obtaining or offering employment, training and education,
- (b) offering advice and guidance, and

(c) other services calculated to facilitate the provision of any services specified in paragraphs (a) and (b) of this subsection.

(3) In this section and section 9 of this Act “relevant education” means-

(a) education involving full-time attendance at any educational institution in Great Britain, other than an educational institution within the higher education sector, and

(b) education involving part-time attendance at any educational institution in Great Britain, other than an educational institution within the higher education sector, which is education of a description commonly undergone by persons in order to fit them for employment.

(4) The references in subsection (3) of this section to an educational institution within the higher education sector shall be construed-

1992 c. 13.

(a) as respects England and Wales, in accordance with section 9 1(5) of the Further and Higher Education Act 1992 or, if this section is in force at any time before section 65 of that Act comes into force, in accordance with section 61(3)(a) of that Act until that section comes into force, and

(b) as respects Scotland, in accordance with section 56(2) of the Further and Higher Education (Scotland) act 1992.

1992 c. 37.

Power of Secretary of State to arrange for provision of Careers Services for others.

9. The Secretary of State shall have power to secure the provision of relevant services, or any description of relevant services, for assisting persons other than those undergoing relevant education, or any description of such persons, to decide-

- (a) what employments, having regard to their capabilities, are or will be suitable for and available to them, and
- (b) what training or education is or will be required by and available to them in order to fit them for those employments,

and for assisting those persons to obtain such employments, training and education.

Provision of services.

10.-(1) The Secretary of State may perform the duty imposed on him by section 8 of this Act, and exercise the power conferred on him by section 9 of this Act, by making arrangements with-

- (a) local education authorities or (in Scotland) education authorities;

PART III

- (b) persons of any other description, or
- (c) local education authorities or education authorities and persons of any other description acting jointly,

under which they undertaken to provide, or arrange for the provision of, services in accordance with the arrangements; and in doing so the Secretary of State shall have regard to the requirements of disabled persons.

(2) The Secretary of State may also perform the duty imposed on him by section 8 of this Act, and exercising the power conferred on him by section 9 of this Act, by giving directions to local education authorities or education authorities requiring them to provide, or arrange for the provision of, services in accordance with the directions; and in doing so the Secretary of State shall have regard to the requirements of disabled persons.

(3) Directions given under this section may require local education authorities and education authorities-

- (a) to provide services themselves or jointly with other authorities or persons,
- (b) to arrange for the provision of services by other authorities or persons, or
- (c) to consult and co-ordinate in the provision, or in arranging for the provision, of services with other authorities or persons.

(4) Arrangements made, and directions given, under this section may include provision for the making of payments by the Secretary of State, whether by way of grant or loan or otherwise, to the persons with whom they are made or to whom they are given.

(5) Arrangements made, and directions given, under this section in exercise of the power conferred by section 9 of this Act may include provision permitting the making of charges for the provision of the services to which they relate.

(6) Arrangements made, and directions given, under this section shall require the person with whom they are made or to whom they are given-

- (a) to provide, or arrange for the provision, of services in accordance with such guidance of a general character as the Secretary of State may give, and
- (b) to furnish the Secretary of State, in such manner and at such times as he may specify in the arrangements or directions or in guidance given under paragraph (a) of this subsection, with such information and facilities for obtaining information as he may so specify.

(7) The Secretary of State may give directions to local education authorities and education authorities requiring them to transfer (on such terms as may be specified in the directions) to any persons who are providing, or are to provide, services in accordance with arrangements made, or directions given, under this section any records of the authorities which may be relevant in the provision of the services.

(8) Local education authorities and education authorities shall have power-

- (a) to provide services or arrange for the provision of services in accordance with arrangements made, or directions given, under this section (including services provided outside their areas) by any such means (including by the formation of companies for the purpose) as they consider appropriate, and
- (b) to employ officers and provide facilities for and in connection with the provision of the services or arrangement for the provision of the services:

but, where directions are given to local education authorities and education authorities, the power conferred on them by this subsection shall be exercised in accordance with the directions.

(9) Where services are being provided in pursuance of arrangements made, or directions given, under this section. the authority with whom the arrangements are made or to whom the directions have been given shall have power. with the consent of the Secretary of State, to provide, or arrange for the provision of more extensive (relevant) services than the arrangements authorise or the discretions require and to employ more officers and provide more facilities accordingly.

(10) Nothing in sections 8 and 9 and this section shall make it unlawful for a local education authority or education authority to defray the cost of exercising their powers under this section from resources other than payments of the Secretary of State.

(II) A direction given under this section may be revoked or varied by another direction so given.

(12) Nothing in this section shall be taken to limit the arrangements which maybe made under section 2 of this Act.

46. After section 10 of the Employment and Training Act 1973 (which is inserted by section 45 above) there shall be inserted-

Careers
service
ancillary
services.
1973 c.50.

(9) In this section-

“goods” includes materials; and

“relevant services” has the meaning given in section 8(2) of this Act”.

“Provision of ancillary goods and services.

IOA(1) The functions of a local education authority or education authority shall include power to enter into agreements and services, for the supply of goods or services authorised by this section with any person (other than an authority) who provides, or arranges for the provision of, relevant services and is a person with whom this section authorities such arrangements to be made.

66 c. 19 *Trade Union Reform and Employment Rights Act 1993*

PART III

(2) This section authorises the making of such arrangements with any person-

- (a) who, under arrangements (or joint arrangements) made with that person under section 10(1) or (3) of this Act provides, or arranges for the provision of, the services;
- (b) who provides the services jointly with an authority under section 10(3) of this Act;
- (c) who is the means by which, under section 10(8), an authority provides, or arranges for the provision of, the services.

(3) Subject to subsections (4), (5) and (6) below, this section authorises

- (a) the supply by the authority to the person of any goods;
- (b) the provision by the authority for the person of any administrative, professional or technical services;
- (c) the use by the person of any vehicle, plant or apparatus belonging to the authority and, without prejudice to paragraph (b) above, the placing at the disposal of the person of the services of any person employed in connection with the vehicle or other property in question;
- (d) the carrying out by the authority of works of maintenance in connection with land or buildings for the maintenance of which the person is responsible;

and the authority may purchase and store any goods which in their opinion they may require for the purposes of paragraph (a) above.

(4) The supply by an authority of goods or services to any person is authorised by this section only for the purpose of the provision by that person of relevant services.

(5) The supply by an authority of goods or services to any person is authorised by this section only during the period of two years beginning with the day on which that person first provides relevant services in the area of that authority.

(6) Goods and services shall be supplied on such terms as can reasonably be expected to secure that the full costs of making the supply is recovered by the authority.

(7) The supply by an authority of goods or services to any person is authorised outside as well as within the area of that authority.

(8) This section is without prejudice to the generality of any other enactment conferring functions on local education authorities or education authorities.