

**A STRATEGIC FRAMEWORK FOR SCOTTISH FRESHWATER FISHERIES
PFA 2.5 Mixed Stock Fisheries Working Group**

MIXED STOCK FISHERIES WORKING GROUP

**Wednesday 12th November 2008
Pentland House, Room 449 - 10.30 to 14.30**

AGENDA

1. Chairman's Welcome
 - a. Security and domestics
 - b. Group Introductions
 - c. Chairman's comments

2. Terms of reference Paper MSFWG/08/1

3. Discussion on Working Methodology Paper MSFWG/08/2

4. Discussion on Proposed Timetable for the Group's Work Paper MSFWG/08/3

5. Open discussion of the issues the Group will wish to consider Paper MSFWG/08/4

6. Confirmation of:
 - a. Request FRS introductory paper in time for Meeting 2
 - b. Request sectoral written evidence submissions in time for Meeting 3
 - c. Request: economic, social and financial analysis paper in time for Meeting 4

7. AOCB

8. Chairman's summary

Coffee will be served on arrival, and lunch will be served 12.15 – 13.00.

PURPOSE AND TERMS OF REFERENCE

The group will review all aspects of mixed stock fishing. It will establish what is currently known about mixed stock fisheries, identifying the impact of such fisheries on management and conservation and it will make agreed recommendations for their future management based on evidence and good practice.

The group will:

- draw upon any information that is available in the public domain.
- identify gaps in knowledge, and flag up these gaps to the research community and to its funding sources.
- take into account international trends, guidelines and obligations.
- assess the financial, social and economic issues concerning these fisheries.

In the light of these considerations the group will prepare a report that includes strategic recommendations for Scottish Government and for all parties involved in mixed stock fisheries management.

The report will be submitted to the Scottish Government by 31 December 2009 at the latest.

WORKING METHODOLOGY

The Group's objectives have been outlined by the Chairman in his opening remarks

1. As all parties represented round the table will appreciate very well the question of mixed stock salmon fisheries is both complex and sensitive. There has been a long history of debate and discussion against a background of serious threats to the stocks on which so many depend, for their livelihood or for the opportunity for sport and recreation. The task of the Group is to work together to find an agreed way forward to recommend to Government.
2. The Chairman is therefore concerned that we base our work on the best evidence that we can draw from all the available sources and that – as we move towards conclusions – we do so on the basis of consensus. The attached proposed working methodology, timetable and list of issues for consideration reflect this approach.

The Group's working methodology should therefore be to:

- Gather evidence from a range of sources. The secretariat will need to have all evidence available in time to copy to all members of the Group for their consideration, prior to scheduled meetings
- Review and discuss the evidence placed before it at each meeting
- Reach consensus about the meaning and implications of the evidence considered
- Identifying specific areas where pressures from active mixed stock fisheries are believed to be high
- Identify specific situations where there does not appear to be sufficient objective evidence to be able to reach a consensus on a particular area of debate (see paper MSFWG08/04)
- Make recommendations for further work to improve the evidence-base, wherever relevant
- Consider the economic, social and financial aspects of the issues on the basis of a thorough analysis
- Consider the different approaches to management on the basis of evidence of their effectiveness
- Identify opportunities for recommending early action
- Consider opportunities to deliver or recommend interim outcomes during the course of the next 15 months
- Make recommendations for a strategy and appropriate policy actions that are based upon the evidence that has been reviewed
- Be prepared to make recommendations (interim or otherwise) that seem appropriate but where the current evidence base is still equivocal, based upon the precautionary approach

**A STRATEGIC FRAMEWORK FOR SCOTTISH FRESHWATER FISHERIES
PFA 2.5 Mixed Stock Fisheries Working Group**

- Contribute to the drafting and editing of a final report, summarising the work and recommendations of the Group

WORK TIMETABLE

The Group will undertake its work through a series of plenary meetings. The initial proposal for a timetable of meetings is:

Meeting 1 12th November 2008

- Discussions as outlined in the Agenda
- FRS requested to submit an opening ‘overview’ paper for consideration at Meeting 2
- Group members requested to submit their own position papers for consideration at Meeting 3

Meeting 2 ?? 2009

- Group discusses evidence presented in FRS overview paper
- Group discussed and agrees ‘chapter headings’ that will be required for a final report (based on a discussion of paper MSFWG/08/04 issues during Meeting 1), although does not attempt to populate chapter headings with detailed information at this stage
- Group requests that FRS prepares a science ‘gap analysis’, with recommendations, for consideration at Meeting 4

Meeting 3 ?? 2009

- Group discusses evidence presented by individual members
- Group discusses a paper on the social and economic issues prepared by Scottish Government economists

Meeting 4 ?? 2009

- Group discusses and amends/agrees FRS recommendations on further need for scientific research
- Group considers any further evidence on economic and financial issues
- Group considers a paper on the management options suggested by the evidence so far
- Group commences to populate ‘chapter headings’ with initial bullet point details of:
 - Background
 - Evidence reviewed
 - Consensus on implication of evidence (or not)
 - Recommendations

[Secretariat writes-up agreed bullet points into a more comprehensive draft report format between Meeting 4 and Meeting 5, and submits to Group in advance of Meeting 5.]

Meeting 5 ?? 2009 [Possible overnight + two-day meeting]

- Group discusses wording of draft report, making changes live ‘on screen’ wherever possible
- If required or desired, Group asked to submit additional text material to secretariat subsequent to this meeting, copied to all Group members.

[Secretariat completes final report, and emails to Group for confirmation or final amendments.]

Meeting 6 ?? 2009

A STRATEGIC FRAMEWORK FOR SCOTTISH FRESHWATER FISHERIES
PFA 2.5 Mixed Stock Fisheries Working Group

- If required, the Group meets to agree final report wording

Report completed and delivered to Scottish Government and the Steering Group of the Freshwater Fisheries Forum.

ISSUES TO CONSIDER

The following list of issues the Group might like to consider, with evidence wherever possible, is indicative only – Group members will have specific views about this.

- Definition of what ‘mixed stock fisheries’ means to this Group – bearing in mind that scientifically, almost all exploitation of salmon might be described as ‘mixed stock’
- Specific clarification on definition of types of salmon exploitation that will fall within the remit of the Group, whether by rod catch or by various types of netting
- Clarification about species remit for Group discussions: Atlantic salmon only, or Atlantic salmon and sea trout
- Setting out the factual landscape from statistical data (FRS):
 - Where and to what degree of catch does netting take place – different methods
 - Where and to what degree of catch does rod angling take place – catch, or catch-and-release
- Trends, locally and nationally, on:
 - Smolt production in rivers – is it within conservation limit levels, or not
 - Marine mortality
 - Salmon returning to Scottish waters (pre-fishery abundance PFA)
 - Different types of exploitation on PFA
 - Degree to which rivers might be affected by coastal interception of returning salmon, in terms of risking smolt production capacity for the future
 - Degree to which rivers that might be affected by other forms of exploitation of returning salmon, in terms of risking smolt production capacity for the future
- Management options
 - Conservation measures by regulations made under Section 38 of the Salmon and Freshwater Fisheries (Consolidation) (Scotland) Act 2003
 - Non-statutory voluntary agreements
 - Any other alternatives that might be considered and discussed
- Economic and social contribution to Scotland:
 - First sale values
 - Other economic indicators (including any social-economic indicators)
 - Result of applying theoretical intervention options, taking into account possible exploitation rates in netting (of whatever type) or angling
 - Other financial issues
- Species conservation issues:
 - In terms of European or national legislation or regulation
 - In terms of legally binding or non-binding international agreements

A STRATEGIC FRAMEWORK FOR SCOTTISH FRESHWATER FISHERIES PFA 2.5 Mixed Stock Fisheries Working Group

- In terms of exact language and legal interpretation of any agreements or legislative/regulatory instruments
- In any other relevant terms
- Seasonality – which temporal components of salmon stocks are most at risk, and to what degree does this interact with a discussion about ‘mixed stock fisheries’
- Illegal fishing – degree to which different aspects of legal fishing can put pressure on or otherwise affect illegal activities
- Scientific information – degree to which different aspects of exploitation can contribute to the advancement of scientific knowledge about migratory salmonids
- Degree to which the Group’s work contributes to Scottish Ministers’ 5 ‘Strategic Objectives’:
 - *Wealthier and Fairer*: Enable businesses and people to increase their wealth and more people to share fairly in that wealth.
 - *Healthier*: Help people to sustain and improve their health, especially in disadvantaged communities, ensuring better, local and faster access to health care.
 - *Safer and Stronger*: Help local communities to flourish, becoming stronger, safer place to live, offering improved opportunities and a better quality of life.
 - *Smarter*: Expand opportunities for Scots to succeed from nurture through to life long learning ensuring higher and more widely shared achievements.
 - *Greener*: Improve Scotland’s natural and built environment and the sustainable use and enjoyment of it.
 -
- Implications of the Marine Bill, and the proposals for a Scottish Marine Management Organisations (‘Marine Scotland’)
 - With proposals to introduce legislation that allows for the designation of ‘marine protected areas’, over and above existing Habitats and Birds regulations