

FLOODING ISSUES ADVISORY COMMITTEE

ALLEVIATION SUB-COMMITTEE

Minutes of the 4th meeting held on 19 October 2006, Conference Room 3, Victoria Quay, Edinburgh.

Present: Carolyn Girvan (Scottish Executive (SE), Climate Change and Air Division) – Chair.

Scottish Executive: Helen Kemp (SE, Climate Change and Air Division – minutes), Nick Evans (SE, Planning Division); Debi Garft (SE, Climate Change and Air Division); Stan Irvine (SE, Climate Change and Air Division); Jonathan Dennis (SE, ERAD).

Alvin Barber (City of Edinburgh Council); Dr John Riddell (Independent consultant); Dr Roy Richardson (SEPA); Ronnie Falconer and Dr Shirley Henderson (Jacobs).

Observers: Gordon Petrie (SE Climate Change and Air Division); Katherine White (SE, ERAD); George Gray (Angus Council).

Apologies: Professor Charles Ainger (MWH); John Henderson (SE, Agricultural Policy Division); David Cotterell (Environment Agency); Jim Hutchison (DEFRA); Peter Jones (Welsh Assembly Government); Ted Keegan (Jacobs).

Agenda Item 2: Welcome from Chair, Carolyn Girvan of the Executive's Climate Change and Air Division, and introductions.

1. Carolyn Girvan (CG) welcomed everyone to the fourth Alleviation Sub-Committee meeting. She introduced herself as taking over the chair from Judith Tracey who is now on maternity leave; Helen Kemp (HK) who has taken up the post as Secretariat; and Shirley Henderson who was standing in for Ted Keegan to provide an update on Chapter 7.

Agenda Item 3: Minutes and action points from the third meeting on 25 May 2006

2. Members agreed the minutes from the previous meeting held on 25 May 2006. The action points from the meeting have been completed.

Agenda Item 4: Update on writing technical guidance for local authorities taking forward flood prevention schemes – Debi Garft (DG).

3. DG gave an update on writing the technical guidance:

- Chapter 1 – just requires an Executive foreword.
- Chapter 2 – is ready to go back to Executive's Solicitors for final comments.
- Chapter 3 – final draft received for the Executive to review.
- Chapter 4 – first draft received from the Contractors and will be discussed today.

Copy has also been sent to Matt Crossman to get feedback from the Association of British Insurers. A final draft is required from the Contractors for 30 November 2006.

- Chapter 5 – published.
- Chapter 6 – published.
- Chapter 7 – first draft received from the Contractors and will be discussed today. Copy has also been sent to Executive colleagues for comments. A final draft is required from the Contractors for 30 November 2006.
- Chapter 8 – We are waiting for findings from the University of Dundee research on the social cost of flooding. The Executive will agree a revised timetable with the Contractors.
- Chapter 9 – We have agreed that a chapter on scheme prioritisation is not required at present.
- Chapter 10 – not started yet but Contractors will provide a draft outline for Members to discuss at the next Sub-Committee meeting on 1 February 2007.

4. DG explained that the contract for the guidance ends in July 2007.

5. Members discussed the Glossary and agreed that it should include a table categorising the different types of flooding so that there is a common understanding of the definitions. Although Members recognised that in practice more than one type of flooding occurred at one time and the table should be qualified as such. John Riddell (JR) offered to provide a note to help define fluvial and pluvial.

Action point 1: JR to provide note on definition of fluvial and pluvial flooding.

Action point 2: Members to submit comments on the draft Glossary, References, and the Flood Categorisation Grid to Secretariat by 3 November 2006.

Agenda Item 5: Chapter 4: Design standards – consider draft chapter

6. RF introduced a draft of Chapter 4 and requested views on the sections on 'Risk to People' and 'Climate Change' sections as well as case studies for the annex. Roy Richardson (RR) suggested adding geomorphological aspects as this is a particular issue in Scotland and would also be relevant to the section on maintenance. Members agreed that the section on 'risk to people' should be short in this chapter as it will be covered in the Social Appraisal chapter.

7. JR referred to the section on multiple benefits and innovative solutions and suggested that councils would in practice be restricted by the constraints of the 1961 Act. He added that while fluvial flooding is comprehensive the chapter needs more information about coastal flooding. Stan Irvine (SI) reminded members that local authorities have other powers to take forward flood alleviation solutions. This aspect will be highlighted by the Executive in the foreword and will recognise the emerging work on sustainable flood management.

8. Members discussed the 1 in 100 year (plus provision for climate change) indicative design standards for flood prevention schemes and the 1 in 200 year standard in SPP7. Members agreed that this chapter must be clear about the reasons for the 2 standards. SI explained that while SPP7 was concerned with new developments the flood prevention standards affected all property. The main aim for flood prevention schemes is to concentrate on getting people out of 'high risk' category and not to get everyone out of 'no risk' category. There is also a need to prove Value for Money and some schemes may not be able to justify a higher standard. SI also preferred the term 'provision' rather than 'allowance' for Climate Change which could be included within the plan now or for in the future.

Action point 3: Members to submit comments on Chapter 4, to Secretariat by 3 November 2006.

Action point 4: Members to forward case studies, which should have been built and tested, to be considered for Annex A, to Secretariat by 3 November 2006. The studies should bring out the reasons why a particular option was selected.

Action point 5: RF to include more detail on Coastal Flooding in the second draft.

Agenda Item 6: Chapter 7: Environmental appraisal/impacts – consider draft chapter

9. Dr Shirley Henderson (SH) introduced Chapter 7 and requested comments particularly on high level guidance in Section 1 and case studies.

Action point 6: SH to provide template for case studies for Secretariat to send out to Members.

10. Members agreed that:

- the Chapter should explain the difference between SEA and project level environmental assessment. There is a requirement for more detail on what the regulations state.
- river restoration should be mentioned in Section 4.
- case studies should be catchment wide studies to help illustrate some of the concepts in the environment appraisal process
- an example of where CAR is relevant with cross referencing to Chapter 2 to illustrate how environmental impact assessment and CAR process should run in parallel.
- SEAs and cross border issues should be considered.

11. Importantly Members noted that no decision had been taken on whether CAR would be raised under the planning process or the flood prevention scheme process.

Action point 7: Members to submit comments on Chapter 7 and case studies to the

Secretariat by 3 November 2006.

Agenda Item 7: Chapter 8: Social appraisal – chapter update – including Interim Report on Exploring the Social Impacts of Flood Risk and Flooding in Scotland research

12. RF gave update and reported that the Dundee University research will form the core of Chapter 8. He suggested that this chapter should highlight the importance of flood resilience and flood warnings as well as provisions under the Civil Contingencies Act 2004 which have significant implications. Social aspects of flooding are very relevant to the emergency planning process and are perhaps more important to people who do not receive flooding protection from a scheme if a satisfactory cost benefit ratio is not achieved. SI said that Chapter 8 is important because it will attempt to tackle criticism that flood prevention schemes are based purely on economic considerations. Carrying out a social appraisal will help justify marginal schemes.

Action point 8: RF to move lessons from Katrina and Carlisle etc. to an Annex.

Action point 9: Members to submit comments on Chapter 8 to the Secretariat by 17 November 2006.

Agenda Item 8: Individual Property Grants – update by Carolyn Girvan

13. Nothing further to report on this item. CG will take this forward with Executive Solicitors.

Action point 10: Individual Property – CG to take this forward and report at next meeting.

Agenda Item 9: Update on streamlining flood prevention process with the planning system

14. Nick Evans (NE) updated the Sub-Committee on streamlining flood prevention process with the planning system and explained that the proposals are with solicitors for their response. He explained that Notices of Intent to Develop (NID) procedure will change next year and flood prevention schemes will come through as a planning application. Therefore references to NIDs in Chapter 2, for example, may require to be revised in light of these changes. These changes were included in the planning white paper released last year.

Action point 11: NE to provide a link to the white paper for Secretariat to forward to Members for information.

Agenda Item 10 and 11: Any Other Business and Next meeting

15. AB distributed hard copies of the *Notes for Guidance on the Legislative*

Framework for Assessment and Maintenance of Watercourses and the Promotion of Flood Prevention (Mitigation) Schemes from the SCOTS Flooding Group.

Action point 12: Secretariat will forward a link to an on-line version to Members.

16. The next meeting was arranged for 1 February 2007 at Victoria Quay.

**FIAC Secretariat
November 2006**